

## ABSTRACT

### Go Tell It On The Mountains: Tracing Evangelical Activity in Peru from the early Dominican Missions to the Contemporary Ministries of Buckner Perú

Bonnie E. Cantwell

Director: Dr. Joan E. Supplee

In the nearly five centuries spanning 1532 to 2015, Peru has experienced three primary political eras. From early colonialism, to nineteenth-century elite republicanism, up to twentieth-century democratization, Peru has evolved as a state and as a nation. Speaking to its nationhood, Peru's religious identity has long been marked by the hegemony of the Catholic Church. In the most recent decades, however, Protestantism, particularly Pentecostalism, has won converts through grassroots missionary endeavors. Although the contemporary Protestant movement appears to be a sporadic boom, it actually owes much to its evangelical predecessors. Missionary strategies in Peru have evolved alongside political eras, such that the establishment of Catholicism in the colonial era, gave way to the introduction of Protestantism in the republican era, which in turn opened up the "religious market" for the twentieth-century surge in Protestant adherents and democratic participants. These three movements will be analyzed individually, and cumulatively as each comes into partial expression in the work of Buckner International in present-day Peru.

APPROVED BY DIRECTOR OF HONORS THESIS:

---

Dr. Joan E. Supplee, Department of History

APPROVED BY THE HONORS PROGRAM:

---

Dr. Andrew Wisely, Director

DATE: \_\_\_\_\_

GO TELL IT ON THE MOUNTAINS:  
TRACING EVANGELICAL ACTIVITY IN PERU FROM THE EARLY DOMINICAN  
MISSIONS TO THE CONTEMPORARY MINISTRIES OF BUCKNER PERÚ

A Thesis Submitted to the Faculty of  
Baylor University  
In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the  
Honors Program

By  
Bonnie E. Cantwell

Waco, Texas

May 2015

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements . . . . .	ii
Dedication . . . . .	iii
Chapter One: <i>Del Suelo a Cielo</i> . . . . .	1
Chapter Two: In the Name of Crown and of Christ . . . . .	17
Chapter Three: A Chapter Concerning Toleration . . . . .	34
Chapter Four: Preference for the Protestant . . . . .	51
Chapter Five: Buckner Perú Case Study . . . . .	67
Chapter Six: A Concluding Philosophical Reflection on Contemporary Protestant Missions in Peru . . . . .	81
Bibliography . . . . .	86

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Principal thanks is owed to the small *pueblo joven* of Pamplona in Lima, Peru, where I first surveyed the arduous life of highland migrants, who bear the indelible mark of the *Imago Dei*, despite their manifold hardships.

To Buckner International: your presence in Peru sows the seeds of eternity. May you find fertile soil amidst the rocky terrain.

To my loving family: you have been a wellspring of prayers and patient affirmation. Without you, this project would never have found its way to press.

To my caring community: you bore my burdens and feigned interest in my research—that is more than I should have asked for.

To my advisor, Dr. Supplee: from Waco, to Lima, Mendoza, Arequipa, San José, and back, you have been more than faithful to this project and a generous friend to me.

## DEDICATION

### *Doxología*

*A Dios, el Padre celestial, al Hijo, nuestro Redentor,*

*Al eternal Consolador, unidos todos alabad.*

*Cantad al trino y uno Dios, sus alabanzas entonad;*

*Su eterna gloria proclamad con gozo gratitud y amor.*

*Amén.*

## CHAPTER ONE

### *Del Suelo al Cielo: an Introduction to the Thesis Project*

Those who believe that they believe in God, but without passion in their hearts, without anguish in mind, without uncertainty, without doubt, without an element of despair even in their consolation, believe only in the God idea, not God Himself.

—Miguel de Unamuno, *The Tragic Sense of Life*

### *Introduction*

The history of Christian missions in Peru spans more than five centuries. The story begins with the 1532 arrival of Francisco Pizarro's chaplain, Fray Vicente Valverde, and continues to the present day.<sup>1</sup> As Peru developed as a state, it also evolved as a nation. The development of political ideology has continually prompted changes in the religious milieu. This is most evident in the colonial and early republican eras, when the spiritual convictions of the Peruvian people conflicted with the regulations of the state. Colonial Catholicism displaced indigenous beliefs, and republican liberalism limited the Catholic Church. The first movement established Catholic Christianity, while the second opened up the religious marketplace, albeit by a narrow margin, to the introduction of Protestantism. When the nineteenth-century rhetoric of liberty gave way to the twentieth-century reality of democratic vote and voice, religious leaders, and particularly evangelical proselytizers, changed their strategies to keep pace.

---

<sup>1</sup> William H. Prescott, *History of the Conquest of Peru* (Paris: Baudry's European Library, 1847), 248.

The rise of Peruvian Protestant missions, in many respects, reaches its climax in the twentieth-century boom in charismatic Protestantism—but this event did not happen in isolation. The millennial surge in Peruvian Protestants is owed to the movement's historical antecedents in the nineteenth-century and the establishment of the Catholic Church in the colonial era. While individual aspects of this history have received ample attention from historians, sociologists, political scientists, and theologians, each of these accounts assumes a narrowness of focus that obscures the grand narrative of missionary activity in Peru across the centuries.

This project provides a sweeping sketch of Christian missions in Peru, presenting an account of the primary models of Christian missions active in Peru from the sixteenth- to the twenty-first-century. Utilizing a chronology of political transitions, the time period from the arrival of the Spaniards to present may be divided into three distinctive religious eras: colonial Catholic, nineteenth-century Protestantism, and millennial evangelicalism. Given the constraints of an undergraduate thesis, it is necessary to trim the tall grass of this topic. To this end, each missionary milieu will be tightly tethered to the corresponding political ideology of its era. Missionaries live in the tension between external, political pressures and internal, religious convictions. The professed vocation of Christian missionaries is to proclaim the Gospel message, the good news of Christ's sacrifice and salvation, but they must navigate secular restraints in order to present their religious agenda. Evangelical organizations' approach to governmental relations participates in their organizations' definition of efficacy.

The expectations, and thereby the self-understood efficacy of the mission, is inextricably related to the culture from which missionaries emerge and the culture they



enter. In the colonial and republican eras, missionaries operated under the strictures of home agencies and mission boards. Their expectations were pre-established but subject to negotiation in the field, particularly in light of the political constraints and social movements within the mission field. Moving into the millennial age, Protestant missions enacted grassroots efforts and saw a shift away from strong oversight. In a concluding twenty-first century case study, Buckner International represents a mean of the two: the guidance of an international oversight, cooperation with the government, and the deference to local leadership. In Hegelian terms, Buckner is the present iteration of the dialectical thesis, which has cycled through the colonial era, republican era, and democratic era.

This project provides a historical narrative of Peruvian Christianity that originated in the establishment of the Catholic Church, proceeded to the nineteenth-century secularization of the new republic and arrival of Protestant missionaries, and then tracks the twenty-first century surge in Protestantism. Simply put, the boom in Protestantism directly depends upon the framework raised by the colonial and republican era antecedents. This project will conclude with an analysis of the work of a Protestant missionary organization, Buckner International, and its approach to the Peruvian state and social welfare initiatives as well as traditional missionary activities.

### *Survey of Existing Research*

Given the nature of this project, research materials must be drawn from across the centuries and the academic disciplines. The majority of secondary sources will pertain specifically to Peru, but comparative sources from other regions will also be employed.

Primary sources were utilized where they were accessible. The primary and secondary research materials used in each chapter will here be addressed in turn.

### *Primary Resources on the Establishment of the Catholic Church in Peru*

Primary resources on the encounter are, at once, many and few. Although there are have a proliferation of pages scripted by the foremost Spaniards, the thoughts and attitudes of Amerindians come into history indirectly. In light of this limitation, it is appropriate to utilize dissenting Spanish voices in order to isolate the critical debates and indicate points of clear consensus. Scant indigenous perspectives, as expressed in late-contemporary writings, are incorporated as available.

Among the Spanish authors, one finds unanimous agreement that the Spanish project of Christianization ought to be undertaken, and tremendous dissension as to the best methodology. Juan Ginés de Sepúlveda will represent the dominant perspective of colonists. Sepúlveda affirmed the strong-arm tactics of the state, as he believed the indigenous people were too brutish to accept the faith otherwise. Bartolomé de Las Casas and Francisco de Vitoria will represent the contrarian position. Vitoria believed the requirement of Christian conversion to overstep legitimate church and state authority, while Las Casas defined a loving presentation of Christian salvation as a requisite for conversion.

The writings of Garcilaso de la Vega and other indigenous sympathizers balance the perspective of these Catholic Spaniards. Marvin Lunenfeld compiled a valuable collection of primary sources in *1492: Discovery, Invasion, Encounter*. One of the most useful texts included is “The Assault on Peru.” Authorship for this text is attributed to the

son of a Spanish captain and an Inca princess who “chose to emphasize his Andean heritage in a history of the ruling family that brought its achievements.”<sup>2</sup> This author sympathizes with the ignorance of the native people, and makes a tacit argument against the *Requerimiento* a legal document commissioned in 1512 and adopted by the Spanish crown in 1513. Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala provides the premier explication of the indigenous perspective. He was Quechua man of social prominence born in the years after Spanish conquest who depicted scenes of the conquest in line drawings. These sources, and others of the like, will be used to counterbalance the bold Spanish voices in the literature.

#### *Secondary Resources on the Establishment of the Catholic Church in Peru*

Historians have long been intrigued by the era of the Spanish Conquest and have produced considerable corpus of secondary sources. Disputes about and reactions to the Black Legend mark these texts. The Legend originated with English and Dutch colonists who unfavorably depicted the Spanish colonial enterprise and early evangelical practices in order to validate their presence in the Americas (i.e. if the Spanish may rightfully lay claim to the territory). Latin American revolutionaries and advocates of the Spanish-American War retrieved the Legend.<sup>3</sup> Although many historians are self-conscious of the Legend, and its flat rendition of colonial history, some academics champion the position. For example, Luis N. Rivera depicts the evangelical endeavor as a convoluted

---

<sup>2</sup> Unknown, “The Assault on Peru,” in *1492: Discovery, Invasion, Encounter*, Marvin Lunenfeld, ed. (Lexington, MA: Cengage Learning, 1990), 175.

<sup>3</sup> Margaret R. Greer, Walter D. Mignolo, and Maureen Quilligan, eds., *Rereading the Black Legend* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007), 6.

mix of political, economic and religious motives of the monarchs, pope and conquistadors.<sup>4</sup> His primary question of investigation may be phrased thus: In presuming one's own culture to be more advanced, does one also claim the right of domination? This line of inquiry gainfully re-enlivens the sixteenth century debate of moral agency and political sovereignty in colonial activity.

In opposition to the traditional narrative of conquest, Jeremy Ravi Mumford asserts the legitimacy of Spanish social reorganization in the Americas. He relies on the example of viceroy don Francisco de Toledo. According to Mumford, the Spanish conducted a legitimate conquest of Andean America and thereby possessed the right and, indeed, the obligation to impose the Spanish socio-political order.<sup>5</sup> This account is unsatisfactory, as it does not account for the harms borne by conquered persons and multivariate misunderstandings between the subjugator and subjugated. In her analysis of the Inca tradition, Irene Silverblatt criticizes the legal justification behind conquest practice. She argues that the military conquest and its attendant hierarchical society is a social ill.<sup>6</sup> Regardless of the conquerors' presumed political rights, no power, military or otherwise, ought to infringe on human rights—a line of argumentation furthered by Lewis Hanke. Silverblatt emphasizes human rights in terms of gender equality, but the principle could easily be applied to the freedom of religious determination. R.S. Sugirtharajah strikes a middle ground in his panoramic view of global Christian missiology. In his view, pre-existing cultures appropriated the colonizers' religious texts

---

<sup>4</sup> Luis N. Rivera, *A Violent Evangelism, The Political and Religious Conquest of the Americas* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 1992), 64.

<sup>5</sup> Jeremy Ravi Mumford, *Vertical Empire* (London: Duke University Press, 2012), 7.

<sup>6</sup> Irene Silverblatt, *Moon, Sun and Witches* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987), 67.

naturally.<sup>7</sup> Empires rise and fall, cultures change and evolve. While this perspective accurately reflects many historical episodes, it unduly preempts a subjective evaluation of Christianization and conquest behavior.

A representative collection of differing perspectives may be found in John Frederick Schwaller's edited collection, *The History of the Colonial Church in Latin America*.<sup>8</sup> Schwaller's edition provides a platform for discordant perspectives. He includes articles from Rivera, as well as Karen Vieira Powers, and Kenneth Mills. Powers argues that internal disputes among the priestly orders allowed for the expression of the Amerindian people's agency. Accordingly, Powers de-emphasizes the power of the Spanish state and Catholic religious order—two institutions Rivera invests with nearly absolute authority. Mills adds to this conversation by acknowledging both the strength of the Spanish Catholics and the resistance of the indigenous people. Mills cites the *visitas*, inspections of native communities during which Spaniards would search out remnants of Pre-Columbian religious practices, as an instance when Spanish intrusions heightened the natives' incentive to preserve their religious practices. By presenting these differing lines of argumentation in a single text, Schwaller forwards the dialogue of historical analysis, and provides a multi-angle perspective on the institution of the Catholic Church in colonial Spanish America.

#### *Primary Resources on the Post-Revolutionary Republic of Peru*

---

<sup>7</sup> R.S. Sugirtharajah, *The Bible and the Third World: Precolonial, Colonial and Postcolonial Encounters* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2001), 67.

<sup>8</sup> John Frederick Schwaller, *The History of the Catholic Church in Latin America* (New York: New York University Press, 2011).

Early leaders of the Peruvian republic struggled to establish a new national identity. In the second half of the nineteenth-century, Positivism rose to the fore—a fortuitous occurrence for the Protestants. Although Positivism values science to the exclusion of religious faiths, the Positive thinkers admired the Protestants emphasis on education, and therefore preferred Protestantism to Catholicism.<sup>9</sup> To set this scene, it is valuable to refer to August Comte’s original work, in translation, before incorporating secondary sources to justify its political resonance. In the same vein, the original writings of missionary organizations and eyewitnesses prove useful for tracking the arrival and establishment of Protestant missionaries. Some of these sources were published as personal travel accounts, such as *Peru* by Sir Clements Robert Markham.<sup>10</sup> Other organizations, such as the American Bible Society, disseminated primary accounts in missionary organization newsletters.<sup>11</sup> Another such example is the collected edition of the South American Missionary Society writings.<sup>12</sup>

### *Secondary Resources on the Post-Revolutionary Republic of Peru*

The utilized secondary sources on nineteenth-century Peru belong into three categories of research: political, philosophical and religious. S. J. Jeffrey Klaiber

---

<sup>9</sup> Rosa del Carmen Bruno-Jofré, *Methodist Education in Peru : Social Gospel, Politics, and American Ideological and Economic Penetration, 1888-1930* (Waterloo, Ont., Canada: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1988), 33.

<sup>10</sup> Sir Clements Robert Markham, *Peru* (London: Gilbert and Rivington 1880).

<sup>11</sup> American Bible Society, ed., *Bible Society Record*, Vol. 56–58. (Astor Place, New York: American Bible Society, 1911).

<sup>12</sup> Elizabeth Lydia Marsh Gardiner, *Records of the South American Missionary Society; Or, Fifty Years’ Work of the Church of England in South America (British Guiana Excepted)* (London: South American Missionary Society, 1896).

valuably bridges the categories of political and religious by emphasizing the extent of Latin American anticlericalism.<sup>13</sup> Klaiber's work finds a counterbalance in Mark Thurner's strictly political perspective.<sup>14</sup> Thurner turns his attention to the state and makes ancillary reference to political perspectives on the Church. Another conversation is struck between the religious and political based on the thematic commonality of education issues. In Peru, the earliest Protestant missionaries came as merchants, but, as Rosa del Carmen Bruno-Jofré's research indicates, the immigrant businessmen's arrival invited the gaze of European and North American missionary interests, particularly with regard to education.<sup>15</sup> The work of G. Antonio Espinoza overviews the Peruvian state's role in education and complements Bruno-Jofré's perspective. The philosophical thread of conversation is woven in as a complement to the early republican dialogue as to the religious rights of the people, which may be described as a pragmatic *modus vivendi* negotiation. The writings of Susana Nuccetelli are employed as a commentary on Positivism.

#### *Primary Resources on the Twentieth-Century Surge in Protestantism*

Primary sources from this century include the webpages of evaluated missionary organizations, e.g., *Las Asambleas de Díos*, which provide a first-hand presentation of the

---

<sup>13</sup> S.J. Jeffrey Klaiber, "Anticlericalism in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries," in Lee Penyak and Walter Petry, *Religion and Society in Latin America: Interpretive Essays from the Conquest to the Twenty-First Century* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2009).

<sup>14</sup> Mark Thurner, *From Two Republics to One Divided: Contradictions of Postcolonial Nationmaking in Andean Peru* (Durham, North Carolina: Duke University Press, 1997).

<sup>15</sup> Bruno-Jofré, *Methodist Education in Peru: Social Gospel, Politics, and American Ideological and Economic Penetration, 1888-1930* (Waterloo, Ont., Canada: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1988).

evangelicals' mission and purpose.<sup>16</sup> As the chapter also includes mention of contemporary Catholic developments, official Church pronouncements, such as papal bulls and encyclicals, are referenced, and key Catholic Church thinkers, including Gustavo Gutiérrez, are cited. The research of Rebecca Pierce Bomann provides an outsider's eye to the daily life of an *evangélico* in Bogotá, Colombia.<sup>17</sup> Her methods are rigorous and her conclusions are personal and revealing. Her work serves as a counterpart to my own experiences. As I am an evangelical who has volunteered throughout Central and South America, I have had frequent interactions with the evangelical Protestants of this region. Although these experiences do not achieve the rigorous standards of research, they greatly enriched my perspective, and therefore find formal voice in this chapter.

#### *Secondary Resources on the Twentieth-Century Surge in Protestantism*

Given the historical proximity of the surge in Latin American Protestantism, valuable secondary sources are found across the academic disciplines. Samuel Escobar, for example, works as a theologian to analyze missionary methods, particularly the Lausanne movement, from the colonial era to the present day. Escobar identifies the errors of colonial and post-colonial missionaries, and advocates for missions that preserve preexisting cultures and promote positive social change.<sup>18</sup> In contrast, Elizabeth E. Brusco undertakes an anthropological and religious study of the socially normative

---

<sup>16</sup> Las Asambleas de Dios Del Perú. Accessed February 13, 2015.  
<http://www.asambleasdediosperu.org.pe/asambleas-de-dios-del-peru-jen.html>

<sup>17</sup> Rebecca Pierce Bomann, *Faith in the Barrios: The Pentecostal Poor in Bogotá*. (Boulder, Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers, 1999), 58-66.

<sup>18</sup> Samuel Escobar, *The New Global Mission* (Downers Grove, IL: Intervarsity, 2003), 110.



machismo behavior patterns in Latin America in order to note the impact of Protestantism's asceticism, e.g. abstinence from alcohol, on the community.<sup>19</sup> Virginia Garrard-Burnett, for her part, researches as a historian in order to analyze the rise of Protestantism in Guatemala.<sup>20</sup> Garrard-Burnett's evaluation of spiritual practices indicates shifts in cultural norms.

Explaining *why* Protestantism surged will be accomplished by noting shifts in social normativity. R. Andrew Chesnut's scholarship shifts the paradigm of analysis by framing the Protestant missions in terms of market factors and quantitative yields. He utilizes economic concepts to describe the spiritual condition of Latin America and explains the increasing rate of Protestant conversions by tracing the success of this Pentecostal religious 'product.' When the Protestant movement gained a "critical mass" of adherents in the mid-twentieth-century, it introduced competition to the religious market and appealed to the needs of the popular classes.<sup>21</sup> This analysis is the most prominent interpretation of the statistical surge in Protestant adherents throughout the "Global South" in general, Latin America specifically, and Peru in particular.

The statistics utilized in this project are drawn from the Pew Research Center's November 2014 study entitled "Religion in Latin America: Widespread Change in a Historically Catholic Region." The survey is composed of more than 30,000 face-to-face interviews conducted between October 2013 and February 2014. The region defined as

---

<sup>19</sup> Elizabeth E. Brusco, *The Reformation of Machismo: Evangelical Conversion and Gender in Colombia* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1995).

<sup>20</sup> Virginia Garrard-Burnett, *Protestantism in Guatemala: Living in the New Jerusalem* (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1998).

<sup>21</sup> R. Andrew Chesnut, *Competitive Spirits: Latin America's New Religious Economy* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2003), 18.

“Latin America” for the purpose of the Pew study is inclusive of nearly all Spanish- and Portuguese-speaking countries and territories falling within the geographic limits of the region between Mexico and the Southern Cone of South America. Cuba, French Guiana, Suriname, Guiana, and Haiti were not included.<sup>22</sup>

#### *Primary Resources on Buckner International*

This historical review culminates in an evaluation of Buckner International’s present-day work in Peru. This organization’s cooperative attitude has made numerous primary sources available for review. Meeting with former Buckner President Dr. Ken Hall allowed this researcher to survey the overarching goal and ambition of Buckner.<sup>23</sup> Dr. Hall emphasized the importance of physical and spiritual nourishment and a full respect for indigenous culture. This ambition is echoed in Buckner’s practice of entrusting the in-country operations to Peruvians. Claudia de León, Director of Buckner Perú (BP), repeated this same message during an in-person interview.<sup>24</sup> Buckner Perú has worked cooperatively with the Peruvian government to establish a national foster care program. In May of 2014, the Baylor University Honors College funded my attendance at *Por su derecho a vivir en familia: Acogimiento Familiar y Adopción*, a conference jointly hosted by the Peruvian Ministry of Women and Vulnerable Populations, Buckner Perú, and Programa Integral Nacional para el Bienestar Familiar. The conference title

---

<sup>22</sup> Pew Research Center, “Religion in Latin America: Widespread Change in a Historically Catholic Region,” 5.

<sup>23</sup> Ken Hall, interviewed by Bonnie Cantwell (Baylor University: Waco, Texas), February 20, 2014.

<sup>24</sup> Claudia León Vergara, interviewed by Bonnie Cantwell (Lima, Peru), May 22, 2014.

may be translated as “For your Right to Live in a Family: Foster Care and Adoption.”<sup>25</sup>

The subject matter of this conference proved essential to the research project as both Peruvian government and Buckner Perú articulated their partnership and ambitions. Marisol Esperanza Cruz, Vice President of Perú, opened the conference, and preeminent ministers continued the program. From the perspective of the government, the creation of non-institutionalized orphan care is a sign of progress—a theme that echoes the Positivists of the 1800s—and for Buckner, it is an exemplification of Christian compassion. The two parties’ messaging and ministry of both organizations at the conference evinced the groups’ complementary motivations.

The research trip was complemented by an interview with the Organization of American States’ ambassador to Peru, Pablo Zúñiga.<sup>26</sup> Zúñiga’s interview situated Buckner’s work within the framework international diplomacy. As Zúñiga stated, the Catholic Church in Peru is stronger today than he has seen it in recent years. This unguarded observation ought to complicate the argumentation, and indeed, it served as an impetus for evaluating the role of the Charismatic Catholic movement in the fourth chapter of this thesis. Zúñiga offers a non-governmental, but politically astute, perspective—a value added to this project.

In light of these resources, it is clear that Buckner Perú is a suitable case study for surveying the continuity and dissonance between modern missions and its historical antecedents. Buckner’s contemporary work both resembles and rejects aspects of the

---

<sup>25</sup> “Encuentro Internacional: ‘Por su derecho a vivir en familia: Acogimiento Familiar y Adopción.’” International Conference hosted by the National Congress of the Republic of Peru (Lima, Peru), May, 23, 2014.

<sup>26</sup>Pablo Zúñiga, interviewed by Bonnie Cantwell (Lima, Peru), May 22, 2014.

colonial, nineteenth-, and twentieth-century models insofar as Buckner both works with the government and divides its ‘secular’ goals from its spiritual ends.

### *Project Overview*

By beginning with the colonial establishment of the Catholic Church and concluding with the case study of Buckner International’s operations in Peru, this thesis will address the development of Christian missions. In tracing the history of Protestant missionary models back to the introduction of Catholicism, the paper argues that the millennial growth of Peruvian Protestants built on the labors of earlier evangelicals, both Catholic and early Protestant. The concluding analysis of Buckner will serve as an argument that division of religious ends from secular projects valuably improves upon the colonial model. This line of analysis will be carried forth by an evaluation of each political era’s associated missionary model chronologically.

Chapter Two lays the foundation for the project at large by presenting the colonial Spanish Christianization project. The Spanish colonists undertook the immense task of reforming indigenous civilization after the fashion of Catholic Iberian norms. Although this project often wrested natives of autonomy and priests frequently confused compliance with contrition, the Spaniards were effective insofar as they imposed Spanish civil and religious structures on the Andean societies of Peru. The Catholic Church’s hegemony, established during this era, persisted in full force for centuries and, in many respects set the stage for Protestantism’s rise.

Given the Peru’s nineteenth century commitment to anti-clericalism, it is appropriate to evaluate the establishment of the Peruvian republic. Beginning with

*veintiocho de julio*, Peru's 1821 independence day, chapter three evaluates the political and religious milieu of nineteenth-century Peru. In this century, Peru opened its economic borders to international trade and accepted Protestantism alongside commerce. Englishmen and North Americans came for business, but brought their families and cultures with them. As an evangelical faith, Protestantism came into conflict with local religious beliefs and customs. The local-scale activity of vocational missionaries and evangelical residents provided Protestants with an opportunity for entry—a development that laid the foundation for the expansion of Protestant missionary activity in the late-twentieth-century.

Chapter four will evaluate the numerical surge of Protestant missionaries and the emergence of charismatic Catholic organizations in Latin America from the 1950s onward. The Protestant presence and messaging has challenged Catholicism's traditional predominance in the region. Many of the scholars listed in the literary review have focused their academic attention on this phenomenon. One may not neglect, however, the simultaneous resurgence of Catholicism in Peru. Gustavo Gutiérrez's seminal 1971 text, *A Theology of Liberation*, placed Peruvian clerics at the fore of a global movement in the Catholic Church: liberation theology.<sup>27</sup> Such a theology cannot be unwed from its context in colonial exploitation. Complemented by the development of Catholic Base Communities (CEBs) and expanded social services, the Catholic Church proved remarkably active in the late-twentieth century. Even in examining the expansion of Protestantism, due attention is owed to developments in the Catholic Church.

---

<sup>27</sup>Gustavo Gutiérrez, *A Theology of Liberation: History, Politics, and Salvation*, ed. and trans., Caridad Inda and John Eagleson (London: SCM, 2001).

This project reaches its denouement in chapter five. In this final statement, the historical lessons of the preceding pages will culminate in an evaluation of a present-day missionary organization, Buckner Perú. This organization will be evaluated by the same criteria as its predecessors, and will furthermore be comparatively assessed in light of the preceding generations. Concluding in this manner will allow the past to bear upon the present in a dynamic manner.

In the final chapter, chapter six, philosophical reflections will be introduced in order to situate Peru's Protestant missionary history into the universal condition. This reflection will be grounded in Buckner International's division of operations between secular and religious ends, a dualism that draws on the Rawlsian categories of the rational and reasonable. This dualism will be proposed as a solution to Peru's plague of inequality and exploitation, as expressed by Peruvian philosopher José Carlos Mariátegui.

In each chapter, a critical two-level analysis will be at play. On the first level, this thesis will evaluate the interaction of the missionaries, Catholic or Protestant, with the political authorities. This will define the social expectations under which the missionaries operate. Secondly, this study will evaluate the Protestants definition of efficacy, by inquiring as to what they expected of themselves. In the final chapter, a third layer will be added, as this thesis puts Buckner Perú's work in conversation with its missionary forerunners. By evaluating Buckner Perú, the best practices and most portent warnings of the preceding generations will emerge.

## CHAPTER TWO

### In the Name of Crown and of Christ: The Establishment of the Spanish State and Catholic Church in Colonial Peru

Thereupon Father Nicanor rose six inches above the level of the ground. It was a convincing measure. He went among the houses for several days repeating the demonstration of levitation by means of chocolate while the acolyte collected so much money in a bag that in less than a month he began the construction of the church. No one doubted the divine origin of the demonstration except José Arcadio Buendía.

—Gabriel García Márquez, *One Hundred Years of Solitude*

While the well-worn aphorism insists that the Spaniards sailed to the Americas for God, gold, and glory, in truth, Spanish *conquistadores* engaged in the conquest of the newly discovered hemisphere for the purpose of gold by the proxy of God. The papacy adjudicated the evangelization of the Americas to the Spanish and Portuguese crowns and included specific directives as to economic activity. Drawing from the Scholastic tradition of just war, the rulers perceived barbarianism as grounds for the imposition of Christian leadership. Subjugation, proponents of the just war theory argued, would mold the barbarian indigenous people into devoted discipleship. This ideal, clearly enshrined in the Spanish legal tradition, was not realized in actual practice. The Spanish social order in the Americas was rooted in religious ideals, but did not advantage evangelistic projects.

The pursuit of glory complicates the religious component of the Spanish social order, as Spaniards fought to establish systems of honor in the new world. *Hidalgos*, second sons disadvantaged by primogeniture, gained access to the Americas based on

their pedigree as descendants of old Christian families. For these ambitious men, the colonies represented wealth and the maintenance of material means. To the crown, the *hidalgos* represented a pedigree of spiritual orthodoxy. The united crowns of Aragon and Castile had completed their campaign against the Islamic stronghold at Granada. This victory over the final Moorish stronghold at Granada in January 1492 bore tremendous spiritual and political significance. This success marked the culmination of the *Reconquista*, the re-conquest of the Iberian Peninsula. The Spanish monarchs perceived their success as a sign of divine favor. Within months of the fall of Granada, the monarchs began issuing edicts of expulsion against Muslims and Jews—to not be a Christian in Spain was simply not an option.<sup>1</sup> One's religious and political identity were therefore closely linked. Claiming Christian heritage indicated generations of loyalty to the crown and to the Church. On this account, *conquistadores*, the earliest American explorers, were of Christian heritage. Given that the crown equated Church participation to political loyalty, the *conquistadores* need not be missionaries, but merely good Spanish citizens in order to gain passage aboard a ship bound for American shores. Thus, the prerequisite Christian identity need not preclude the possibility that *conquistadores* sought financial and military success over, and against, evangelical engagement of the native people. For the specific task of Christianizing the people, the crown tasked vocational missionaries with evangelism efforts.

At least six different monastic orders operated in early colonial Peru. These included the Dominican, Franciscan, Augustinian, Carmelite, and Mercedarian orders. Members of the last group, “seculars,” committed their lives to the same ideals as their

---

<sup>1</sup> Norman Roth, *Conversos, Inquisition, and the Expulsion of the Jews from Spain* (Madison, WI: The University of Wisconsin Press, 2002), 271, 288.



peer monastics, but lived “in the world,” rather than in a monastery or church. This vast array of ecclesiastics found unity in their common authority of the Crown and the Church. Each arrived on a ship with Spanish flags, each heeded crown-sanctioned Papal dictates, and each sought to convert the indigenous people to the holy Catholic faith. While their dissimilarities texture the historical scene, the common purpose of evangelization proves most important.

A chronological analysis of the Catholic Church’s establishment in the newly encountered world will allow for the evaluation of three critical phases: conquest, establishment, and denigration. In each phase, the political and religious policy will be analyzed in light of indigenous responses.

### *Colonial Establishment: Conquest of the Crown*

The 1492 victory at Granada allowed for and inspired the American conquest on several fronts. Aragon and Castile now possessed the financial freedom to sponsor exploration. Although Christopher Columbus had called upon the Spanish monarchs consistently throughout the 1480s, his final entreaty to Queen Isabella of Castile could not have been timelier—he came, as popular history touts, in 1492. As the court, celebrated the final defeat of the Moors in Granada, Columbus procured the permission and funds for his long journey. Although it would be another forty years and six popes before Spanish ships reached the Peruvian coast, the framework of politico-religious understanding implemented in this foundational era persisted.

According to Iberian tradition, religious claim legitimated the expansion of Spanish rule and, when necessary, military action. King Ferdinand and Queen Isabella considered themselves divinely elected rulers, tasked with the conversion of non-

Christian peoples. Their grandson, Charles I, the first monarch of the Hapsburg dynasty, prioritized this objective, as displayed by his sympathetic ear to Las Casas. Three critical factors defined the Spanish understanding of politico-religious conquest: confidence in divine favor, as confirmed by the papacy; the supposed inferiority of the native people; and the exclusivity of Christian religious truth.

The Spanish posited a relationship of causality between divine favor and earthly victory. Accordingly, their success at Granada evidenced the moral rectitude of this conquest, and predicted a favorable prognosis for American exploits. As the unknown author of a 1571 treatise, *Defense of the Legitimacy of the Rule of the Kings of Spain in the Indies, in Opposition to Friar Bartolomé de Las Casas*, argued, the Spanish were rewarded with the Indies for their centuries-long struggle against the Muslims.<sup>2</sup> Hernán Cortés' ready conquest of the Aztec people further indicated that the conquest of American barbarians, persons not adhering to the Christian faith, was divinely ordained. Las Casas' contrarian position, to which the unknown author of this treatise responded, indicates the primacy of this reward-based theory of justice. The author's defensive posture likely resulted from a significant shift of perspective, as the righteousness of conquest came under increasing suspicion. Francisco de Vitoria, who agreed with Las Casas on few fronts, questioned the Spaniards' right to conquest by asserting, "It would be harsh to deny to those, who have never done any wrong, what we grant to [Muslims] and Jews, who are the persistent enemies of Christianity."<sup>3</sup> Such a statement distinguishes

---

<sup>2</sup>Lewis Hanke, *The Spanish Struggle for Justice in the Conquest of America* (Dallas, TX: Southern Methodist University, 2002), 164.

<sup>3</sup> Francisco de Vitoria, *1492: Discovery, Invasion, Encounter*, ed., Marvin Lunenfeld (Lexington, MA: Cengage Learning, 1990), 193.

the American conquest from the preceding *Reconquista*, by emphasizing the ignorance of the Amerindian natives in contrast to the belligerence of the Iberian adherents of Islam. This line of argumentation does not directly treat the claim that the Americas were a divinely bestowed prize for Spanish, but it does call for the establishment of this claim on grounds distinct from the *Reconquista* justification of reclaiming land from religious enemies.

The inferiority of American peoples and government, whether by nature or conditioning, defined the second elemental factor. The debate between Las Casas and Juan Ginés de Sepúlveda before the Council of the Indies indicates the centrality of this belief. From the earliest voyages, there was a Spanish presumption of superiority on the grounds of Christian faith and civilized behavior. Ironically, Spanish Scholastic scholars relied on the not-Christian teachings of Greek philosophers, primarily Aristotle, to bolster their claim to superiority. Francisco de Vitoria, a scholar at the famed University of Salamanca, described the indigenous people in saying: “by defect of their nature they need to be ruled and governed by others and that it is good for them to be subject to others just as sons need to be subject to their parents until of full age, and a wife to her husband.”<sup>4</sup> Accordingly, a deficient mental capacity necessitated Spanish rule.

A third definitive quality of Spanish engagement in the New World was the exclusivity of Christian religious truth. As the Nicene Creed, a fourth century doctrine endorsed by the Catholic Church into the present day, states:

---

<sup>4</sup> Ibid.

We believe in one God, the Father almighty, maker of heaven and earth, of all things visible and invisible . . . and in one, Holy Catholic and Apostolic Church. We acknowledge one Baptism for the remission of sins.<sup>5</sup>

This creed clearly explicates the Catholic Church's insistence on a singular religious truth. Salvation, pardon from the punishment merited by sin, came through the person of Jesus Christ alone, and Jesus Christ was one member of the triune Godhead.

Acknowledging the superiority, solidarity, and singularity of the Trinitarian doctrine was essential to conversion, and the practice of syncretism was anathema to this end. The prohibition of indigenous religious practices plagued the Spanish priests and politicians for centuries. While the extermination of syncretic practices came into expression during the Inquisition, early missionaries noted the similarities between the Christian god and the Inca deities. As the famed Inca historian Garcilaso de la Vega described it, the Pachacámac, the chief god of the Inca pantheon, could rightfully be called the Christian God because "the intention of the Indians was to give the name to the Most High God who gives life and being to the universe, as the name implies."<sup>6</sup> This accommodation, however, did not permit the continued worship of Pachacámac, but only the acknowledgment that the Inca were glimpsing a partial truth in their previous religious practice.

The demand of absolute religious loyalty distinguished the Spanish conquistadors from the earlier Inca conquerors. Under the Incan Empire, regional conquests were permitted to maintain *huacas*, holy sites devoted to regional gods and goddesses, so long

---

<sup>5</sup> Charles Joseph Hefele, *A History of the Christian Councils from the Original Documents* (Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2007), 350.

<sup>6</sup> Garcilaso de la Vega, *Royal Commentaries and the Incas and the General History of Peru*, Vol. 2 (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 2014), Kindle Edition.

as the conquered people acknowledged the superiority of the Inti and Coya, the sun and the moon gods who ruled the Incan Empire through the Sapa Inca and his bride.<sup>7</sup> Incan cosmology operated on a logic of mutuality, whereby dominant and passive forces were mutually dependent. Consider the relationship between Pachamama and Illapa: the fertility of the land is contingent on the provision of the rain, thus Illapa's thunder enables Pachamama's harvest.<sup>8</sup> In the same way, respect for the Sapa Inca required honor of the sun, and respect for the Coya necessitated reverence for the moon. It was within this cosmological framework that the Inca people understood the authority of the state and the conquest relationship. The Coya was not equal to the Sapa Inca, but she had a designated role that merited certain degrees of respect and worship. By the same reasoning, the Inca army did not consider the subjugated peoples equal, but they did consider them members of the empire who were allowed to retain independent customs so long as they paid the tokens of tribute owed to the conqueror. The Inca expected the Spanish to operate within this cosmological schema, but of course, this was not to be.

The Spaniards' conquest of the Andean region was doubly bound to misconceptions: first, the Andean people expected to retain their traditional lifestyles under Spanish rule, and second, the Spanish expected to effectuate total conquest of the Andean region with the *Reconquista* as their paradigm. The Andean people conceived of conquest as an act of participation in a new political order, but did not expect absolute subjection to cultural censorship. The Inca Empire conquered for the purpose of collecting tribute and building alliances. While the empire invited conquered peoples to

---

<sup>7</sup> John Frederick Schwaller, *The History of the Catholic Church in Latin America* (New York: New York University Press, 2011), 59.

<sup>8</sup> Irene Silverblatt, *Moon, Sun, and Witches: Gender Ideologies and Class in Inca and Colonial Peru* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1987), 22, 52.

participate in Incan religious customs, it did so only to build a basis for loyalty. Both the payment of tribute and the participation in Inca religious activities were community decisions. To send a daughter to an *aclla*, a sort of convent in the capital city of Cusco, was, in one sense, to make a sacrificial offering to the Sapa Inca. At the same time, sending one's daughter to a life of leisure at court was a tremendous honor.<sup>9</sup> Regardless of the morality of sending a young woman away for a lifetime, the Andean people comprehended the *aclla* system and understood how to navigate within it. When subjugated to the Incan Empire, the Andean people acknowledged the Incan gods and continued to worship their own—they paid a tax, but not at the expense of their lifestyle.

Spanish authorities altered the Andean tribute system in order to fulfill the Iberian agenda. Under Incan rule, the household, a husband and wife pair and their progeny, comprised the minimal tribute unit. The Spanish, however, subjected all men between the ages of eighteen and fifty to the pay tribute and serve *mita* labor.<sup>10</sup> A portion of the tribute was owed to the parish priest, and tithes were separately owed to the Catholic Church. Instead of sending one daughter to become an *aclla*, the Spaniards expected the whole family to participate in the Christian church.

According the logic of the *Requerimiento*, or “Requirement,” the Spanish crown required submission to the state and the Catholic state. The *Requerimiento* was the earliest presentation of the Christian salvation message in the Andean region, laid out an ultimatum: surrender or face the sword. Drafted by a team of Spanish religious and legal

---

<sup>9</sup> Ibid, 132.

<sup>10</sup> *Mita* labor was a form of tribute required by the Inca rulers of their subjugated conquests. The *mita* required by the Spanish was more exacting than its pre-Columbian antecedent. *Mita* often took the form of mining for precious metals, such as the silver found at Potosí. More information may found in Cheryl E. Martin and Mark Wasserman, *Latin America and Its People* (New York: Pearson, 2011), 89.

authorities in 1510, the *Requerimiento* best describes the formal purpose of colonization. As scholar Demetrio Ramos noted, the *Requerimiento* was a “notification of something already resolved.”<sup>11</sup> The conquistadors were required to pose two options to natives via this document: accept the Church, papal authority and Spanish King and Queen, or face warfare, forceful cession of property, and enslavement.<sup>12</sup> Since passive resistance was not an option, many critics judge the document to be an unfair presentation of the gospel message. Returning to the precedent of the Jewish and Moorish expulsion, however, the underlying justification of the document is elucidated: divine right kings have the duty to expand Christendom on earth, through political exercise, and in heaven, by winning souls. That was precisely the logic of the *Requerimiento*.

The practical implementation of the formal evangelistic statement further indicates the document’s inadequacies. The very presentation of the contract diminished the possibility of sincere conversion: un-translated words softly intoned do not an effective oration make. With mumbling Spanish words, the *conquistadores* outlined the terms of the agreement, and amidst great confusion, the Inca people resisted the imposing foreigners.<sup>13</sup> The document promised time to “ponder . . . understand . . . deliberate . . . and accept” the terms of the agreement, but soldiers prepared to fight rarely had the patience for such contemplation.<sup>14</sup> The conquistadors read the document to legitimate

---

<sup>11</sup> Luis N. Rivera, *A Violent Evangelism* (Louisville, KY: Westminster Press, 1990), 38.

<sup>12</sup> Cheryl Martin, and Mark Wasserman, *Readings on Latin America and its People*, Vol. 1 (Boston: Prentice Hall, 2011), 19.

<sup>13</sup> *Ibid*, 18.

<sup>14</sup> *Ibid*, 19.

their conquering activities, rather than to save the souls of natives—a persistent tension in the American colonization project.

The falsity of the *Requerimiento*'s promise is clearly, and divertingly, exemplified in “The Assault on Peru.” This document, written in the sixteenth century by the son of a Spanish captain and an Inca princess, offers an account of Atahualpa's reply to the Christian message. Atahualpa expressed confusion as to the doctrine of the trinity, the necessity for conversion, and the differences between native religions and Christianity. As the author tells it, the Spanish then grew impatient and killed more than 5,000 Inca people.<sup>15</sup> While the precise rendering of this story is likely embellished, the indication of competing military and missionary motivations is instructive. The Spanish presentation of military force and subsequent establishment of the Catholic Church, were possessed of political and spiritual ambitions. The political conquest found success, while the spiritual rewards proved more complicated.

### *The Establishment of the Catholic Church*

Incumbent on the colonial bureaucracy for financing and protection, ecclesiastical authorities in the Americas were constantly embroiled in the governmental negotiations and political dealings. The Church relied on the crown for the efficient collection of taxes, including the tithe, and needed the Spanish military to brave new trails and reach new people groups. Understanding the interconnectivity of these two forces, crown and Church, requires at least a simplified understanding of the colonial bureaucracy. The earliest monastic order to arrive in South America was the Dominican order. These early

---

<sup>15</sup> Unknown, “The Assault on Peru,” in *1492: Discovery, Invasion, Encounter*, Marvin Lunenfeld, ed. (Lexington, MA: Cengage Learning, 1990), 179.



missionaries were tasked with presenting the Spaniards' offer of Christian salvation and Spanish rule, as outlined in the *Requerimiento*. If the indigenous people did not readily submit to the Spanish authority, then the Spanish considered themselves legally sanctioned to attack and subjugate the native persons by force. According to another account of Atahualpa's first encounter with the Spanish evangelists, Atahualpa tossed missionary Friar Vicente's breviary in the air. Amidst great frustration the friar promptly returned to Pizarro and urged the Spanish to attack.<sup>16</sup> This event, recorded by a *conquistador*, Pedro de Cieza de León, vividly displays the faulty communication and depth of misunderstanding between the conqueror and the conquered. How could a Quechua speaking king, under the impression of his own divinity, conceive of the insult he cast in tossing a collection of pages? A man whose society kept record by the *quipus*, an archive of knotted, multicolored cords, was unlikely to appreciate the significance of letters and the art of bookmaking, much less the sacred scriptures therein. To oversimplify the matter, one might say that the earliest missionaries exercised little religious authority or influence, and were primarily functionaries of political dominance, despite official mandates to the contrary.

The colonial Catholic Church relied on the Spanish state for its economic and physical security, and therefore complied with its standards of socio-political normativity. The viceroyalty was the regional unit of colonial authority, and at the apex of colonial authority stood the viceroy. Second to the viceroyalty were the *Audiencias*, or "bodies comprised of three or more lawyers who acted as a courts of appeal and carried out

---

<sup>16</sup> Ibid, 211.

administrative functions over fairly large districts.”<sup>17</sup> Local governance was relegated to the *cabildos*, town councils.<sup>18</sup> The leaders of each level met the prerequisites of a racial hierarchy. Spanish-born *peninsulares* were preeminent in the social hierarchy, and American-born Spaniards, *criollos* were second. Beneath these two classes fell an assortment of *castas*, or mixed race persons, with the short list being: *castizos* (Spaniard and *mestizo*), *mestizos* (Spaniard and Indian), mulattoes (Spaniard and African), Indians and African Americans, and *zambos* (Indian and African).<sup>19</sup> This system gave comparative social priority to those who were “more Spanish” than their peers. The social capital of race was the critical currency of all political organization and ecclesiastical hierarchy in colonial Spain. Persons with indigenous blood, i.e. *castas*, could not assume high political office, but could exert regional authority through the *cabildos*. Likewise, generally speaking, *castas* could not enter the clergy as the Spanish were given to circumspection as to the indigenous person’s intellectual and spiritual capacity. As the historian Jose de Acosta disparagingly remarked, “we [Spaniards] do not believe that the Indians’ affairs deserve repute but treat them like game hunted in the hills and brought to us for our service and whim.”<sup>20</sup> Such condescension plagued defenders of the Indians, such as Las Casas, who wrote, “The Indian[s] . . . are not dull witted or stupid, but they are easy to teach and very talented in learning all the liberal arts, and very ready to

---

<sup>17</sup> Martin & Wasserman, 90.

<sup>18</sup> Ibid.

<sup>19</sup> Magali M. Carrera, “Creole Landscapes,” in *Mapping Latin America: A Cartographic Reader*, eds. Jordana Dym and Karl Offen (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011), 111.

<sup>20</sup> José de Acosta, *Natural and Moral History of the Indies*, ed., Jane E. Mangan (Durham NC: Duke University Press, 2002), 330.

accept, honor, and observe Christian religion and correct their sins.”<sup>21</sup> Although historians provided a ready testament as to the Amerindian peoples intellectual vivacity and creativity, the Spaniards presumed cultural superiority and excluded them from full social participation, both politically and religiously.

Although the native persons were excluded from religious leadership, they were subject to religious authority. The Spanish crown employed *curacas* to collect taxes, tithes, and *mita* labor from indigenous communities. In order to fulfill these economic demands, communities altered their established routines in order to fulfill Spanish expectations. This process of cultural adaption evolved as the Indians responded to changing Spanish policy. By the time the *conquistadores* arrived in Peru, Spain had adopted the 1512 Laws of Burgos, which provided moderate degrees of protection for indigenous persons. The Laws established an *encomienda* system wherein native labor was allotted to Spanish *conquistadores*. It was supposed to be a tutelage system, which would inculcate Spanish cultural and religious values in native persons. However, it more closely resembled slavery in practice. Spanish policies promoted evangelism, and many priests called for a dose of compassion in the implementation of these laws. The Spanish crown had a vested interest in indigenous conversions, as it was on the promise of saved souls that the papacy granted the crown title to the American lands.

Accordingly, both the Spanish monarchs and Catholic Church expected, and required, that the natives convert. According to the *Real Patronato de Indias*, as granted by the *Bull Universalis Ecclesia* of 1508, Spanish sovereigns were granted the authority to approve the foundation of all Cathedrals and churches, to approve the nomination of all

---

<sup>21</sup> Bartolomé de Las Casas, *In Defense of the Indians*, in *Latin American Philosophy for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, eds. Jorge J. E. Gracia and Elizabeth Millán-Zaibert (Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 2004), 43.

bishops and other prelates, and to approve nominations to lesser ecclesiastical dignities such that the King directly controlled ecclesiastical offices.<sup>22</sup> The *Patronato* further required that the king maintain church buildings and support missionaries.<sup>23</sup> As indicated in the *Requerimiento* and the *Patronato*, the project of colonization came at the cost of Christianization—the crown was responsible for establishing the Catholic Church in the Americas. This socio-political pressure is arguably the defining quality of colonial evangelical activity, as is evident in the construction of policy and implementation of the same.

The *Reducción General de Indios* clearly depicts the extent to which the Spaniards tailored policy toward the disruption of traditional Inca cultural practices. The Spanish colonization project relied on the idea of *ley divina y policía humana*, divine law and human civilization.<sup>24</sup> The coincidence of divine ordinance and social organization in this ideology indicates the extent to which Spaniards equated true community with Christianity. *Policía humana* was narrowly defined as a “town’s clean and attractive appearance,” but it was commonly used to describe orderly, gridded street layouts, well-constructed municipal buildings, and virtuous citizens.<sup>25</sup> Although Incan cities were gridded, and lined with well-constructed buildings, Viceroy Toledo believed the absence of a church in Inca villages hindered the effective Spanish governance and therefore implemented the *Reducción General de Indios*, an Indian resettlement program.

---

<sup>22</sup> Francis J. Weber, “Real Patronato de Indias” *The Historical Society of Southern California Quarterly* 43 (1961): 216.

<sup>23</sup> Ibid.

<sup>24</sup> Jeremy Ravi Mumford, *Vertical Empire* (London: Duke University Press, 2012), 4.

<sup>25</sup> Ibid, 45.

Through the resettlement project, the Peruvian viceroyalty forced more than a million peasant farmers into gridded towns and reduced the productivity of the land as a result. The General Resettlement was first addressed in the 1568 Junta Magna, and slowly implemented thereafter.<sup>26</sup> The goal of the program was to Christianize the community by establishing the physical presence of the Spanish state and Catholic Church. In their rush to build Spanish cities, the colonial authorities did not account for altitude differences and crop production. Viceroy Toledo inadvertently prioritized mass attendance over crop cultivation. He failed to recognize that established Andean socio-economic patterns allowed people to manage the harsh environment in which they lived.<sup>27</sup> While the government accidentally interrupted agricultural patterns, it very intentionally interfered with cultural patterns. Resettlement communities banned traditional customs such as the carrying of babies under clothes, while implementing new social practices such as a curfew two hours after nightfall and compulsory church attendance.<sup>28</sup> The efforts to obliterate pre-Columbian culture did not achieve the intended success, due to poorly crafted and implemented Spanish policy, and because of the intractable persistence of cultural mores.

### *Conclusion*

By the dawn of the nineteenth-century, the Spanish government had rendered Peru a nominally Catholic territory. As revolutionary fervor flared throughout Latin America, the Viceroyalty of Peru neared the critical transition to independence as

---

<sup>26</sup> Ibid, 7.

<sup>27</sup> Ibid, 87.

<sup>28</sup> Ibid, 98.

colonists and natives grew increasingly critical of the Spanish Catholic project of colonization. Although the Peruvian people broke from Spanish authority, they retained the Catholic Church as the official state religion for more than a century. During the colonial era, the local church became an established component of daily life, and, as the sovereign possessed the power of appointment, the bishopric assumed political influence alongside religious authority. Upon the republic's establishment, the Church retained influence, but ceded critical degrees of authority. Although republican secularism now challenged religious ideals, the legacy of the Church served as a cornerstone for the reconstruction of Peruvian social identity.

The Christianizing of the colonies laid the foundation for the later emergence of Protestant missions. Familiarity with Catholicism provided a religious context for Protestant missionary work. This claim must be accommodated to the reality that Catholicism's socio-political power entailed favor with the upper echelons of Peruvian society. On the local level, priests often made concessions to pacify their congregants. Ironically, this is evident in the introduction of extirpation procedures, often associated with the Spanish Inquisition. In 1569, the Catholic Church established the Holy Inquisition in Peru, but indigenous people were exempt from its jurisdiction until 1610, when the Church instituted the Extirpation of Idolatry.<sup>29</sup> The Extirpation movement endeavored to reform, rather than to irreparably punish, indigenous people. In the Iberian Spanish Inquisition, priests adjudicated the death penalty for confirmed acts of heresy, but in the Americas, indigenous people were subject only to warnings, beatings,

---

<sup>29</sup> Iris Gareis, "Repression and Cultural Change: the 'Extirpation of Idolatry' in Colonial Peru," eds., Nicholas Griffiths and Fernando Cervantes (Edgbaston, Birmingham: University of Birmingham Press 1999), 231.

imprisonment (primarily for wayward priests), and the signing of an *auto da fé*.<sup>30</sup> Extirpation consisted of inspections of native communities, *visitas de idolatría*, during which trained priests and/or the Archbishop of Lima searched out remnants of Pre-Columbian religious practices.<sup>31</sup> That these sites existed indicates a gap in Spanish intention and colonial reality. At the close of the colonial era, then, the indigenous people of Peru had been, generally speaking, exposed to Christianity with most having accepted the Church as a political institution. Speculations as to the religious sincerity of indigenous participation in the Catholic Church range widely, but for the purposes of this discussion, it is sufficient to note that Spanish law and custom were widely introduced, if not implemented, throughout the Viceroyalty of Peru.

---

<sup>30</sup> Ibid, 233.

<sup>31</sup> Kenneth Mills, "The Limits of Religious Conversion in Midcolonial Peru," in *The Church in Colonial Latin America*, ed. John F. Schwaller (Wilimington, DE: Scholarly Resources, Inc., 2000), 148-149.

## CHAPTER THREE

### A Chapter Concerning Toleration: Creating Space for Protestantism in the Nineteenth-Century Peruvian Republic

We must teach our children to dream because with dreams they will know what to believe in. They will know why to follow the law—civic, social and spiritual.

—Patricio Atkinson

While political pressure, religious fervor and monetary prospects fuelled Spanish missionaries and colonists, republican values and class tensions inspired Peru's nineteenth century revolution. To offer a general chronological overview of the struggle for independence and its aftereffects: Peru waged its war of independence (1820-1824), entered a period of instability (1821-1845), prospered economically during the Guano-export boom (1845-1870), faced and lost the War of the Pacific (1879-1883), and then found political stability in the so-called Aristocrat Republic (1895-1919).<sup>1</sup> For most of the nineteenth-century, then, Peru struggled to fill the void of the authoritative colonial governmental structures. In the absence of strong central authority, republican ideals failed to revolutionize local realities. The religious climate is, perhaps, the most elucidating example of this tension between theory and praxis.

The independence leaders' experience of the European Enlightenment resulted in a preference for a religiously neutral state environment stood in stark

---

<sup>1</sup> G. Antonio Espinoza, *Education and the State in Modern Peru: Primary Schools in Lima: 1821 - C. 1921* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), 3.



contrast to the Peruvian colonial custom. On the municipal level, Peruvians accepted the regional leadership of the town mayor, judge, and priest, which the Spanish previously established.<sup>2</sup> The Church was inseparable from the state. On the national level, the Catholic Church expected republican governments to heed papal authority—a source of tremendous tension. These differences of expectation indicate a disparate cultural identity. In redefining church and state relations, Peru relied on a *modus vivendi*. That is, the government deferred questions of what *ought* to be and instead functioned with what *is*. Within this system, the person or institution that wielded the most power set the social rules and standards.<sup>3</sup> In the absence of a strong central state, this pragmatic attitude was adopted on the local level, such that national policies were applied differently regionally: while the republicans promoted their egalitarian rhetoric, large landowners exploited the poor. As anticlerical legislation passed through congress, local priests continued to wield tremendous authority. In the midst of this variable environment, Protestants arrived on the Peruvian shore. Mostly merchants, they came with their families for economic gain and brought the expectation of free religious practice with them. By negotiating with local power structures, the Protestants established houses of worship and invited missionaries to join them. Despite the fact that Peru's republican government recognized Catholicism as the official religion, Protestants were able to find a foothold in the country.

---

<sup>2</sup> S.J. Jeffrey Klaiber, "Anticlericalism in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries," in eds., Lee Penyak and Walter Petry, *Religion and Society in Latin America: Interpretive Essays from the Conquest to the Twenty-First Century* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2009), 163.

<sup>3</sup> John Rawls, *Political Liberalism* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005), 73.

This chapter will address the challenges and opportunities that Protestants faced while moving into Peru in the nineteenth-century. It will examine how anticlericalism worked against the Catholic Church, while at the same time opening a window for Protestants. Furthermore, chapter will further examine the Protestants purpose in coming to Peru, taking note of both coincidental incentives and intentional pretexts for missionary work. Finally, it will examine the negative sanctions placed on Protestant missions, indicate their grit that withstood this climate, and conclude with an evaluation of early twentieth century policy changes that made way for the expansion of Protestant missionary activity. In sum, the chapter will demonstrate that the renegotiation of church and state relations during the uncertain political climate of the early Peruvian republic both eroded Catholic religious hegemony and allowed the seeds of Protestantism to take root.

### *Precarious Politics: Establishing a Republic*

Although political landscape of nineteenth century Peru was not favorable to Protestants, it was, for the first time since the establishment of colonial rule, likewise inhospitable to the Catholic Church. In the midst of republican fervor, the Peruvian congress passed no fewer than three constitutions in its first fifty years of operation, with each succeeding constitution further delimiting the Catholic Church's authority. Importantly, these constitutions maintained Catholicism as the state religion, but demarcated the boundaries of religious and

governmental authority.<sup>4</sup> This process of constitutional development began prior to the boom in guano exports, but continued throughout this era of economic flourishing. Without a clear constitutional identity, and with an ambiguous relationship to the Catholic Church, Peru came to face the further issue of European businessmen. By the 1850s, these immigrants, along with their families, began arriving in Peru. The Protestants found mid-century Peru in a time of political flux and economic growth. Operating within the space between legality and local level acceptability, they began building religious infrastructure to support and expand their community of believers.

The Catholic Church's tense relationship with the Peruvian republic did not, as intuition may suggest, originate in the Independence Wars. It must be granted that dealings with the Vatican were strained in this era, as the revolutionary movement undermined the Church-sanctioned Spanish claim to settlement of the Americas. On the local level, however, priests were among the most enthusiastic supporters of revolution. Military and political officers collected ecclesiastical tithes as wartime contributions, while militant clergy participated in warfare.<sup>5</sup> Speaking exclusively of the Church in Peru, early revolutionary movements utilized religious structures to bolster their wartime efforts. Immediately after the war, the Church retained influence and favor. The

---

<sup>4</sup> Indeed, it was not until ratification of Peru's 1979 Constitution that Peru acknowledged the separation of church and state. Article 86 of the 1979 document identifies the Catholic Church as an important part of Peruvian culture distinct from Peruvian government. Kevin Boyle and Juliet Sheen carefully articulate the importance of this development in their 2003 *Freedom of Religion and Belief* report.

<sup>5</sup> Mark Thurner, *From Two Republics to One Divided: Contradictions of Postcolonial Nationmaking in Andean Peru* (Durham, North Carolina: Duke University Press, 1997), 37.

liberal priest Francisco Javier de Luna Pizarro, for example, was elected to the Peruvian constitutional assembly.<sup>6</sup> The republic's legal codex formally protected the Church's monopoly on the religious marketplace for more than a century after independence, although political and juridical leaders rarely enforced the law. Although the adherents to the Enlightenment and Positivism sought to delimit Peru's religious identity, their rhetoric did not disrupt the exclusive purchase of the Catholic Church on the Peruvian religious market. Subtle shifts, however, did reduce the government's religious association, thereby creating space for the introduction of Protestantism.

*Revoking Privileges: Limiting the Catholic Church and Leaving Space for the Protestants*

The post-revolutionary Peruvian government sought two goals at once: to tighten control of its Catholic diocese and to limit papal interference in civil society. The first goal is evident in the Reform of the Regulars of 1826. This action allowed the government to confiscate convents and monasteries in order to establish fortresses and schools. The law further stipulated that a would-be-nun or -monk must reach twenty-five years of age prior to taking vows.<sup>7</sup> This seems to have been a means of preventing the spread of Spanish loyalism in the ranks of the clergy. Operating within this framework, Simón Bolívar, for example, led a military occupation of a Franciscan monastery near Huancayo. Mariano Paz

---

<sup>6</sup> Klaiber, "Anticlericalism in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries," 160.

<sup>7</sup> Ibid, 161.

Soldán, a Peruvian historian writing in the mid-nineteenth century, explained the necessity of occupation by noting that the monastery was a “purely Spanish establishment.”<sup>8</sup> As Church lands now could be confiscated by the republican government, and religious orders could be sanctioned for political purposes, the primacy of economic realities and government priorities came to supersede Church power and influence.

In a similar move, the Peruvian government challenged the papal authority to appoint bishops. The Spanish crown had exercised the right of the *Patronato Real* during its reign and the republican government and the Peruvian government demanded the same. After some contest, the issue came to a conclusion in 1874, when Pope Pius IX issued a papal bull formally granting the government the right to appoint all bishoprics.<sup>9</sup> As a technicality, this compromise affirmed papal authority by permitting the pope to approve the government’s nomination.<sup>10</sup> Notably, the government had been exercising the right to nominate its own bishops prior to receiving papal approval, so, the agreement actually ceded power back to the Church. This agreement indicates the republic’s intention to maintain peaceable relations with Catholic Church, even as it demonstrated the extent of its autonomy.

The conflicting ends of increasing secular state authority and appeasement of traditional religious structures may be attributed to the tension

---

<sup>8</sup> Ibid.

<sup>9</sup> Schwaller, *The History of the Catholic Church in Latin America*, 153.

<sup>10</sup> Klaiber, “Anticlericalism in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries,” 160.

between the elite class' attachment to positivist ideas after mid-century and adherence to Catholic practices at the local level. At the time of revolution, leaders such as Simón Bolívar and José de San Martín were versed in the great European thinkers of the Enlightenment, ranging from Jean-Jacque Rousseau to Adam Smith.<sup>11</sup> Their intellectual progeny in the latter half of the nineteenth century were likewise familiar with continental European intellectual currents, most pertinently, Positivism. Positivism offered a theory of history wherein societies progressed from lesser states to better states. It privileged empirical, scientific knowledge over religious faith.<sup>12</sup> Political leaders favored this philosophy because it presented an optimistic projection of state development and asserted Peru's potential for international power. According to the philosophy, early republican Peru was in the "metaphysical" stage, the second of three stages. The three stages are evolutionary, such that the first, the theological stage, is most basic, while the metaphysical is intermediate, and the final, the positive stage, brings society into fulfillment. In the coarse thought of the theological age, "free play is given to spontaneous fictions admitting of no proof."<sup>13</sup> The metaphysical stage refines its intellectual milieu by appealing to "personified abstractions or deities," and the positive stage offers a perfect understanding of reality by

---

<sup>11</sup> Rosa del Carmen Bruno-Jofré, *Methodist Education in Peru : Social Gospel, Politics, and American Ideological and Economic Penetration, 1888-1930* (Waterloo, Ont., Canada: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1988), 2.

<sup>12</sup> Susana Nuccetelli, *Latin American Thought: Philosophical Problems and Arguments* (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 2001), 183.

<sup>13</sup> August Comte, *General View of Positivism*, trans. J.H Bridges (London: Trubner and Co., 1851), 24.

presenting an “exact view of the real facts of the case.”<sup>14</sup> Given this structure, one may readily discern the wary regard politicians of this milieu held with regard to the Catholic Church. For these men, the Church represented the theological age, wherein religion was adopted universally to the exclusion of the scientific process. Interestingly, the Positivists held a more favorable perspective on the Protestant faith, which was contemporaneously introduced.<sup>15</sup> The Protestant faith, as expressed in Peru, emphasized literacy and education—two critical components of an advancing society, and an indication of Peru’s status in the metaphysical, rather than the theological, stage. As Mark Thurner vividly describes, “Peru skidded into the twentieth century as an ‘aristocratic republic’ governed by positivist patricians . . . with the broken legacy of ‘fictitious prosperity’ under the ‘guano state.’”<sup>16</sup> Both the prominence of Positivism and the promise of wealth set the stage for the emergence of Protestant missions in the region.

From 1845 to century’s end, natural resource exports boomed and Peru increasingly attracted attention from international business firms. Independence liberated Peru from Spanish mercantilism, and as the contemporary English explorer Sir Clements Robert Markham wrote in 1880:

The gain to the country [after independence] was immediate. All monopolies disappeared, trade was thrown open to the world; foreign merchants and settlers arrived, and the state of tutelage in

---

<sup>14</sup> Ibid.

<sup>15</sup> Bruno-Jofré, *Methodist Education in Peru*, 33.

<sup>16</sup> Thurner, *From Two Republics to One Divided*, 18.

which Peruvians of Spanish descent had long been kept, gave place to free and unrestrained contact with outside civilization.<sup>17</sup>

Markham's bias is evident, but his sentiments accurately reflect those of his Peruvian contemporaries. Peru did gain considerable access to the global community after declaring independence, but this relationship did not flourish until much later in the century.

*Pretexts and Priorities: the Establishment of Protestant Missions*

While the majority of Protestants came to Peru for mid-century economic incentives, a few Protestants made their way to Peru during and immediately following the revolution. Rosa del Carmen Bruno Jofré offers an example of on such individual: James Diego Thomson, a Scottish Baptist missionary. During the latest years of the revolution, Thomson established a relationship with San Martín, then the Protector of Peru. With the support of the British and Foreign School Society and the British and Foreign Bible Society, Thomson journeyed to Peru and established a network of public schools known as the Lancasterian schools. Thomson's work excited discussion concerning the universalization of education in the young republican state, but after the war's end and his departure in 1824, the republic faced more pressing concerns. The schools were a short-lived precursor for later Protestant educational establishments that flourished in the late-1800s. Between 1824 and the start of the guano boom in the 1840s, caudillo rule prevented national development and stifled the emergence of economic growth. This period came to an end with the guano's

---

<sup>17</sup>Sir Clements Robert Markham, *Peru* (London: Gilbert and Rivington 1880), 153.



commercialization, which attracted British and North American businesses to Peru, and made international investors an integral piece of Peruvian economics.<sup>18</sup> As a result, Peru also attracted the attention of Protestant mission organizations. The most common cause of missionary activity was, quite simply, that foreigners moved to Peru and built churches for themselves. Once established, these churches turned their gaze outward, and invited native Peruvians into their fold. Since the earliest business ties were established with England, it comes as no surprise that the earliest Protestant churches and missions organizations were Anglican. As the letter of a late nineteenth century minister, Pastor Zink, indicates, even small towns were able to obtain support from an Anglican organization, the South American Missionary Society, established in 1844. According to Zink, a town in northern Chile, comprised of 4,000 or 5,000 persons, requested and received a chaplain after the church members guaranteed to fund half of his salary (with the other half provided by the Society).<sup>19</sup> The British residents who requested the support were a minority population of town, so the chaplain was expected to pastor the believers while evangelizing to the Chilean townspeople. This pastoral evangelism is evident on a larger scale, as the South American Missionary Society also established a presence in Callao, port city supplying Lima, in 1864 for the purpose of ministering to the 1,000 British

---

<sup>18</sup> Bruno-Jofré, *Methodist Education in Peru*, 10.

<sup>19</sup> Pastor Zink, "Rio Claro, April 26, 1887" in Gardiner, Elizabeth Lydia Marsh, *Records of the South American Missionary Society; Or, Fifty Years' Work of the Church of England in South America (British Guiana Excepted)* (London: South American Missionary Society, 1896), 88.

subjects living there.<sup>20</sup> In short, Protestant missionary support followed business interests.

Upon arrival in Peru, Protestant immigrants identified a critical social need, namely education, and sought a remedy, both for the Peruvians' interests and their own. Throughout the nineteenth century, the Peruvian education system was subject to municipal authority, with minimal national oversight.<sup>21</sup> This decentralization bore two critical consequences for Protestants living in Peru. First, it meant there was no assurance of established public education in their new home, and second, it meant there was sufficient space between law and practice for the Protestants to establish their own educational systems, as local authorities possessed the power to approve the establishment of regional schools. This regionalism is representative of nineteenth century Peruvian structure at large—local legislation and opinions were of primary importance. Importantly, however, the national government did establish minimal regulations on the curriculum content of the private schools. In 1850, these private education regulations “referred vaguely to having sufficient religious, moral, and teaching capacity to establish a school,” and by 1876, schools were required to possess an “official teaching license issued by municipal authorities as well as having a clean and well-ventilated school building.”<sup>22</sup> This legislative development suggests that as the federal government stabilized, it developed its interest in the content and

---

<sup>20</sup> Ibid, 11.

<sup>21</sup> G. Antonio Espinoza, *Education and the State in Modern Peru: Primary School in Lima: 1821 - C. 1921* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), 1.

<sup>22</sup> Ibid, 24.

construction of private schools, but not so great an interest as to inhibit their teachings. This was particularly critical for the Protestants who, in entering the business of education, intruded on the traditional grounds of the Catholic Church. As the education system was underdeveloped, regionalized, and subject to minimal national oversight, the Protestants established independent educational centers for themselves, and furthermore used education as a means to evangelize.

Critical to the development of the school system was the outward turn of the institution: the inclusion of Peruvian nationals in the school. At the Anglican-founded school in Callao, twenty out of the eighty initial pupils were Peruvians. This statistic indicates an inclusive spirit, as do the early ministry activities of the Anglicans in the region. The British community in Callao established a church alongside the school, and hosted Bible classes in Spanish to encourage community participation.<sup>23</sup> Since the support of the school and church came from a missionary organization, this external focus does not come as a surprise. However, since the organization ministered at the request of settled British families, the maintenance of an ‘open door’ to the community proves significant. Notably, the foreign community’s interest in the well-being of the school, church, Peruvian people. Although Thomson’s earlier work was highly effective and received national attention, it was short-lived. In contrast, these later schools and churches ministered on the local level and for sustained periods of time.

The Protestant-established schools garnered attention for their practical advantages, but the sponsors maintained the schools’ Christian identity and prioritized the sacred over the secular. The missionaries understood the two ends

---

<sup>23</sup> Bruno-Jofré, *Methodist Education in Peru*, 11.

as complementary, such that learning to read would be advantageous in social advancement, but also prove a critical tool for spiritual growth as it granted laymen independent access to Scripture. The Protestant doctrine of the ‘priesthood of believers,’ places a premium on the believer’s access to the Bible, and such access could be provided through education. In this way, the schoolhouse was both a place for equipping believers and introducing unbelievers to the faith. This sound model for missions was only as effective as its permission to operate, and as the century advanced, the Protestant schoolhouse increasingly became a target for political discussions of religious tensions.

Debate over the national education policies both waxed and waned throughout the nineteenth-century, with the variance owed to the party in power. Although the schools were established and overseen by municipal governments, national leaders intermittently concerned themselves with the debates as to proper policy and best practices. This is evident in missionary James Diego Thomson’s early press for universalized education in 1824, and in the 1867 congressional debate on the matter. President Mariano Ignacio Prado, a staunch positivist and liberal, oversaw the 1867 Constitutional Congress. To the outrage of conservative Catholics, Prado’s congressional allies supported legislation that would permit the teaching of any religious doctrine in all education levels.<sup>24</sup> The issue came to naught in the following year, as Prado fell from power, but this eruptive moment indicates the underlying tensions in the state. Decentralization allowed for peaceable political practices despite latent ideological conflicts. Pluralistic

---

<sup>24</sup> Espinoza, *Education and the State in Modern Peru*, 67.

perspectives threatened violence, but for the most part, the state's *modus vivendi* of decentralization kept tensions at bay.

The Penzotti case, an instance of acute religious intolerance, valuably bespeaks the milieu of tolerance. Francisco Penzotti, an Italian missionary sponsored by the American Biblical Society, journeyed to Arequipa, a colonial city in southern Peru, in January of 1889. There, Penzotti peddled Bibles and faced criminal charges from the local bishop for his employment. Charged with the “introduction of immoral books,” Penzotti was jailed for 90 days on this occasion, and imprisoned once more in the summer of 1890. On this second occasion, Penzotti was accused of “leading religious services other than the Catholic service and conducting baptisms and marriage.”<sup>25</sup> These charges are important on three accounts: first, they are exceptional, and second, they demonstrate the power of the local authority, and third, they indicate the established power of the Catholic Church. Penzotti drew public attention to his plight by contacting media outlets in the United States. In 1890, the *New York Herald* published a letter written by Penzotti, and unleashed a firestorm of international commentary. Years later, in February 1913, the *Bible Society Record* published a piece on the Penzotti case. The author identified himself an Englishman who had spent six months in Peru prior to the Penzotti's attention-getting 1890 publication in the *New York Herald*. In his own words, the author expresses his reaction thus:

As I had just been in Peru . . . where we had been unmolested, I was surprised, and hunted up two of the leading

---

<sup>25</sup> Bruno-Jofré, *Methodist Education in Peru*,

foreign residents of Lima, who had been with me at the church service, and asked them whether the New York newspaper account was correct. They replied in substance: “Certainly. He is accused of holding public services, which is against the constitution of the country.”<sup>26</sup>

The author went on to inquire as to whether or not the service had been public, to which the men replied, “No there was a screen in front of the door.”<sup>27</sup> These reminiscences clearly demonstrate the exceptional nature of the Penzotti case. The unexpected event attracted global attention. Indeed, it incited commentary from the England’s Prime Minister, Lord Salisbury, who demanded the “liberation of Penzotti, or that at least his case be brought immediately before the Supreme Court.”<sup>28</sup> Importantly, two lower courts had previously acquitted Penzotti. On the local level, the bishop ably persuaded authorities to jail Penzotti on two occasions, but as the case worked its way through the court system, the bishop’s influence waned. The critical factor in both the success and, in this case, demise of Protestant missions was locality. The bishop’s local influence further demonstrates the Catholic Church’s continued political clout. Protestants emerged in spite of the Catholic Church’s opposition by gaining the favor of local leaders when possible, or appealing to international pressures and liberal favor when not.

---

<sup>26</sup> “February, 1913: Bible Society Record” in American Bible Society, ed., *Bible Society Record*, Vol. 56–58. (Astor Place, New York: American Bible Society, 1911) 24-25.

<sup>27</sup> Ibid.

<sup>28</sup> Ibid, 26.

*Setting the Stage: the Conclusion of the Nineteenth Century and Opening of the Twentieth*

The exceptional difficulty posed by the Penzotti case did not set precedent for Protestant persecution, but instead paved the path toward the Toleration Act of 1915. President José Pardo guided the legislation through congress at the start of his third term.<sup>29</sup> Although missionaries operated widely in the country without official sanctions, incidents of violence indicated the necessity of a national standard. For example, the eruption of violence in 1913, directed at Seventh Day Adventists in Platería, Puno, provided the incentive for protective legislation. The Adventist missionaries had effectively won numerous converts from among the Platería people and thereby incited the anger of local Catholic priests. The Adventist accounts of this on-going tension relies on the framework of spiritual warfare, whereby divine intervention is offered as an explanation for the unfolding of physical events.<sup>30</sup> The act maintained Catholicism as the national religion, but gave formal protection to Protestant missionaries serving in Peru.<sup>31</sup> This legislation permitted the Protestants, at work in schoolhouses and churches, to keep about their work, and laid the foundation for later eruption of Protestantism in the twentieth century.

At the close of the nineteenth century, paltry numerical results of the Protestant missionaries' work in Peru prompted one missionary historian to

---

<sup>29</sup> Schwaller, *The History of the Catholic Church in Latin America*, 203.

<sup>30</sup> Arthur Whitefield Spalding, *Origin and History of Seventh-day Adventists* (Washington D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1962), 63-64.

<sup>31</sup> Ibid.

describe missionary efforts in South America as a “sadly humiliating” endeavor.<sup>32</sup> Although the various denominations consistently received government tacit permission to operate, and ably established a multitude of schools, the Protestants lacked converts, and therefore, according to contemporary definitions, proved ineffective. The institutional method of establishing Western European social structures, i.e. the schoolhouse and the church, failed to woo Peruvians to the faith. It was only with a shift in missionary strategy in the late twentieth century that the tides of Protestant fortune turned, and the denomination began to amass new members.

---

<sup>32</sup> A.C. Thompson, *Protestant Missions: Their Rise and Early Progress*. (New York: Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions, 1903),12.



## CHAPTER FOUR

### Preference for the Protestant: The Twentieth-Century Surge in Peruvian Protestant Population

[The Dominican friars] deliberated on the following points among themselves. Weren't these people human beings? Wasn't justice and charity owed to them? Had they no right to their own territory, their own kingdoms? Have they offended us? Aren't we under obligation to preach them the Christian religion and work diligently toward their conversion?

—Bartolomé de Las Casas, summarizing the Dominican Friars' criticisms of the treatment of native persons in the Americas

In both the colonial era and the post-revolutionary republic, the state assumed control of Christian acculturation, but in the most recent century, this template has been written anew. The colonial missionaries took to the project with vehemence and, by a test of will, made opposing parties comply. The republican government maintained the status of the Catholic Church, but compromised on the maintenance of cultural hegemony. Evangelization efforts in the twentieth century were primarily the work of North American Protestant missionaries who presented the offer of Christian salvation to indigenous persons and who then shared their faith, perpetuating the process from person-to-person, neighbor-to-neighbor. In this process, church leadership has switched hands. No longer is it held by a foreign archbishop or mission board, no longer is it passed from government to individual—instead, this modern iteration of Christian evangelism presents itself distinctively as a movement of and by the people. This chapter

will identify Protestantism's influences in Latin America by a) noting its increasing number of adherents, and b) analyzing its effects on the local Catholic Church.

The evangelical movement of and by the people is proper to twentieth century Protestants and Catholics alike. Whether expressed as Pentecostal revivals or as charismatic Catholicism, an increasing degree of responsibility is invested in the laypersons. Divesting formal church leaders of leadership by degree has enabled radical shifts, such as the preference for the poor and the predominance of women in the church. In sum, this contemporary era of Latin American missions may be termed democratic in so far as Latin American missions in the twentieth and twenty-first centuries have operated on a paradigm of egalitarianism. By investing in marginalized classes, *los pobres* and women, Protestant missionaries have facilitated individual conversion experiences and transformed *barrio* culture. This broad trend can be evaluated in attentive detail by an examination of Peru in particular. Peruvian religious leaders and laypeople have reflectively refined and revised the country's rich church history throughout the centuries, delimiting the hegemony of the Catholic Church along the way.

### *The Parameters of Protestantism*

Protestantism is sweeping across Latin America and the so-called global south, and Pentecostalism is leading the charge. The Pew Research Center's fall 2014 report indicates that eighty-four percent of Latin Americans were raised Catholic, but only sixty-nine percent currently identify as such. At the same time, nine percent of Latin Americans were raised Protestant, but nineteen percent currently claim the faith. To speak of Peru specifically, sixty-six percent of presently practicing Protestants were

raised Catholic.<sup>1</sup> These statistics indicate a) that the Catholic predominance in the population by percentile is faltering, b) that the Protestant population is gaining adherents, and c) that the majority of presently practicing Protestants converted from Catholicism.<sup>2</sup> This data will come into its full historical context through an evaluation of Protestantism's distinctive spiritual qualities.

The most popular Protestant denomination in Peru is Pentecostalism. Indeed, sixty-five percent of Protestants in Latin America adhere to Pentecostalism.<sup>3</sup> Despite its prevalence, one would be hard pressed to find someone who readily identified as a Pentecostal. While in the United States, persons would likely take effort to indicate what sort of Protestant they were, in Latin America, the primary identifying category is simply being Protestant. In the United States, one might say, "I attend a Methodist Church, but my husband is Baptist," but in Latin American the distinction collapses. The determinative characteristic of a Latin American Protestant is being *not*-Catholic. As a substitute for the denominational distinction, Latin Americans have adopted the general term "*evangélico*," literally translated, "evangelical" as in "evangelical Christian."<sup>4</sup> By adopting a special term, the Protestants of Latin America signal their identity as a type of believer distinct from the Catholic Church. In order to maintain the integrity of this

---

<sup>1</sup> Pew Research Center, "Religion in Latin America: Widespread Change in a Historically Catholic Region," 4.

<sup>2</sup> Interestingly, the percentage of unaffiliated persons has doubled from four percent to eight percent. This trend has not received ample attention in the literature. R. Andrew Chesnut does offer the indirect comment that religious pluralism grants permission to deviate from social normativity (*Competitive Spirits: Latin America's New Religious Economy*, New York: Oxford University Press 2003, 18).

<sup>3</sup> Pew Research Center, "Religion in Latin America: Widespread Change in a Historically Catholic Region," 8.

<sup>4</sup> Ibid, 4.

distinction, the term *evangélico* must not be confused with the term “Pentecostal” or “charismatic.” While Pentecostalism is commonly considered a denomination, it is actually a descriptive category of Christian religious worship. Pentecostalism is marked by an emphasis on the third member of the Trinity, the Holy Spirit, and entails charismatic worship such as speaking in tongues and divine faith healings.<sup>5</sup> While many *evangélicos* are Pentecostal, Pentecostal is a broader category inclusive of both charismatic Protestants and charismatic Catholics.<sup>6</sup> In the United States, Pentecostalism is commonly conflated with the Assemblies of God, the largest Pentecostal denomination, so the distinction may be easily overlooked. The definitions in Latin America are, however, critical to an appropriate analysis of the situation at hand. This chapter examines evangelical Protestants generally speaking and references Pentecostal Protestants and Catholic specifically as necessary.

The claim to the name *evangélico* may at first seem odd, as both Catholic and Protestant Christians espouse the activity of evangelism. Stepping back from policy and into practice, however, the differences are made clear. In Peru, for example, seven percent of Catholics claim to “share their faith with others at least once a week,” while thirty-eight percent of Protestants claim the same. In the more religious country of Guatemala, an epicenter for Catholicism and Protestantism alike, the percentages are thirty-four and fifty-three, respectively. Unsurprisingly, the differential in Brazil, where

---

<sup>5</sup> Henri Gooren, “The Pentecostalization of Religion and Society in Latin America,” *Exchange* 39 (2010): 355.

<sup>6</sup> R. Andrew Chesnut, “A Preferential Option for the Spirit: The Catholic Charismatic Renewal in Latin America’s Religious Economy,” *Latin American Politics and Society* (45) 2003: 57.

Protestantism has spread rapidly, comes in at twenty-nine percent.<sup>7</sup> The Protestant claim to the name *evangélico* is understandable in light of these statistics. Given the active engagement in evangelization, the growth is likewise unsurprising.

The proactive and dynamic character of Protestant Pentecostalism makes the church flexible in the mission field—a likely source of its numerical success. This mode of operational functionality is common to its origin. Although Pentecostalism is likely a composite of numerous nineteenth-century evangelism movements, the denomination identifies its formal founding to the 1906 Azusa Street Revival in Los Angeles, California.<sup>8</sup> Azusa Street provides an epicenter for Pentecostalism’s outward spread and a point of origin to which the most prominent Pentecostal organizations cling. Speaking in tongues and faith healings marked the revival and attracted the attention of spiritual persons across the country. Both the Church of God in Christ (COGIC) and the Assemblies of God (AG) trace their heritage to Azusa, and both organizations have forwarded Azusa’s evangelistic paradigm onto the global mission field. AG in particular has exported evangelism efforts southward into Latin America.<sup>9</sup> Given the expectation of spontaneity, Pentecostal mission boards, such as AG’s, emphasize the importance of Spirit-led, situation-specific Christian activity rather than the implementation of standard church policy.

The Pentecostal priority of Spirit-led revivalism has resulted in a de-emphasis on formal training for the pastorate and a promotion of church leaders based on their

---

<sup>7</sup> Ibid, 6.

<sup>8</sup> Allan Heaton Anderson, *To the Ends of the Earth: Pentecostalism and the Transformation of World Christianity* (New York: Oxford University Press 2013), 45.

<sup>9</sup> Ibid, 53.

characteristics. “Spiritual gifts” such as faith and healing abilities are valued over and against degrees and diplomas. This trend is consistent with Pentecostalism’s founding precedent of Spirit-led, revival and the immediacy of divine revelation and healing. This shift from formal training to in-church discipleship yields valuable effects for the propagation of the faith. Given that Pentecostal leaders and lay people raise up leaders from within the congregation and community, they are able to send out missionaries and found new churches without the delay of seminary training. The absence of formal training furthermore fosters a spirit of cooperation, inviting all members of the church to realize their potential for spiritual activity and impact. As one scholar astutely observed, “In Pentecostal practice, the Holy Spirit is given to every believer without preconditions.”<sup>10</sup> This empowerment erases the otherwise rigid line between “clergy” and “laity.” The softening of the divide bodes well for traditionally disenfranchised groups, particularly indigenous persons and women. This phenomenon led field expert R. Andrew Chesnut, to define Latin American Pentecostalism as “participatory authoritarianism.”<sup>11</sup> By coining this term, Chesnut explicates both the high investment of authority in church leaders and the egalitarian selection process. This is evidenced by the monopoly of indigenous persons on the Protestant pastorate in Latin America. While the majority of Catholic clergy in Peru were non-Latin American, as of 1982, the majority of Pentecostal pastors are Latin American.<sup>12</sup> This transition from external, international

---

<sup>10</sup> Allan Heaton Anderson, *An Introduction to Pentecostalism: Global Charismatic Christianity* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2014), 200.

<sup>11</sup> R. Andrew Chesnut, *Competitive Spirits: Latin America’s New Religious Economy* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2003), 60.

<sup>12</sup> *Ibid*, 57.

oversight, to in-country management of the church is termed “indigenization.”<sup>13</sup> The Protestant denominations of Peru have, by and large, adopted this strategy.

Protestants in Peru have developed a church structure independent of their early North American missionary connections. The vast majority of Protestants in Peru are Pentecostal, and eighty percent of these Pentecostals belong to an *Asambleas de Dios del Perú* congregation.<sup>14</sup> *Las Asambleas* is a well-developed and highly organized network of churches operating under the guidance of a fully Peruvian *junta ejecutiva nacional*, or executive board.<sup>15</sup> Although *Las Asambleas* is an affiliate of the Assemblies of God, its North American founder, their online publications make no reference to the founding organization.<sup>16</sup> Further, the development of autonomous ministries indicates that the Peruvian *Asambleas* is not under the paternalistic eye of the Assemblies. This autonomy exemplifies the indigenization movement and indicates the full-breadth of Pentecostalism’s entrenchment in some sectors of Peruvian cultures. The Peruvian people have appropriated and forwarded the Pentecostal movement.

### *The Social Results of Protestantism*

The emergence of Protestantism in Latin America has led to numerous, often unexpected, outcomes. It has coincided with the increased popularity of charismatic

---

<sup>13</sup> The trend toward a Protestant indigenous pastorate does not necessarily indicate an improvement over the Catholic tradition. The benefits and burdens of the high church tradition cannot be weighed on scale—they are matters of value apart from data analysis.

<sup>14</sup> David Bundy, “Historia de Las Asambleas de Dios Del Perú.” *The Journal of the Society For Pentecostal Studies* 13, no. 1 (Spring 1991).

<sup>15</sup> “Junta Ejecutiva Nacional.” *Las Asambleas de Dios Del Perú*. Accessed February 13, 2015. <http://www.asambleasdediosperu.org.pe/asambleas-de-dios-del-peru-jen.html>.

<sup>16</sup> *Ibid.*

Catholicism, entailed the ebbing of *machismo* values among *evangélicos*, and created a new political voting block. These three trends share a common significance as they indicate that Protestantism compromises traditionally held values. These trends are true of Latin America at large and Peru in particular, where Protestants compose a fledgling minority of the country with seventeen percent of the population identifying as Protestant.

The presence of Protestantism tends to promote active Catholicism in a given region, as is evinced in the surging popularity of Charismatic Catholicism alongside Pentecostal Protestantism. The precise causes of this shift are difficult to discern, but the coincidence alone makes the consideration worthwhile. Historian Virginia Garrard-Burnett, an expert on the rise of Protestantism in Guatemala, directs attention to the Second Vatican Council and the development of liberation theology in Latin America. She notes that Vatican II dates to 1965, making it a contemporary of Protestantism's rise. According to Garrard-Burnett, these two movements transformed Catholics from "fatalists" to "activists."<sup>17</sup> This shift from fatalism to activism entailed a movement from dormant faith to active social power. In the same way that Pentecostalism's premise of faith healings presents the opportunity to live in a physically and spiritually healthy community, so too did the Liberation Theology offer a reward, albeit delayed, to those who were suffering. An explicit promise of better days is emphasized in both theologies. Liberation Theology holds special purchase on Peru's history as the movement's foremost champion, Dominican F. Gustavo Gutiérrez, is a Peruvian national. Echoing

---

<sup>17</sup> Virginia Garrard-Burnett, "Like a Mighty Rushing Wind: The Growth of Protestantism in Contemporary Latin America" in Penyak and Petry, *Religion and Society in Contemporary Latin America* (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 2009), 199.



the cries of Las Casas, Gutiérrez describes liberation theology as an uprising of the Latin American people who bear “their poverty on their shoulders.”<sup>18</sup> Importantly, Gutiérrez defines Liberation Theology as an empowering perspective wherein poverty possesses distinctive advantages. In his words, “The poor person is someone brimming over with capacities and possibilities, whose culture has its own values, derived from racial background, history and language.”<sup>19</sup> Such rhetoric well emphasizes the shift toward activism. The rise of *comunidades eclesiales de base* (CEBs) and the Catholic Charismatic Renewal (CCR) further exemplify the rallying of the base, and tether the three movements to the rise in Protestantism.

The values of the Liberation Theology and the priorities of charismatic Protestantism are jointly reflected in the establishment of CEBs, or base communities. Although largely defunct in the present day, the CEBs were designed to be neighborhoods of intensive religious focus.<sup>20</sup> They are both rural and socialist, which meant that for their strong theoretical foundation, they are not an accessible option for the masses of urban poor. Although this movement was unable to provide a sustainable means of social empowerment and economic equity on the grand scale, the priority of these values persisted. The communities shared the priorities of Liberation Theology and charismatic Protestantism by addressing the needs of the embodied soul, but differed insofar as the communities directed their focus to the creation of physical well-being

---

<sup>18</sup> Gustavo Gutiérrez, “The Task and Content of Liberation Theology,” in *The Cambridge Companion to Liberation Theology*, ed., Christopher Rowland (New York: Cambridge University Press 2007), 20.

<sup>19</sup> Ibid, 25.

<sup>20</sup> Rodney Stark and Buster G. Smith, “Pluralism and the Churching of Latin America,” *Latin American Politics and Society* (54) 2012: 42.

rather than the reliance of spiritual assistance. Although this end was never fully realized, the attention to the value of community was carried forth by the Charismatic Catholicism Revival (CCR).

Like the contemporary Protestant Pentecostal movement, CCR is led by laypersons and focused on the third person of the Trinity, the Holy Spirit. The movement began in 1967, sixty years after the Azusa Street Revival, at Duquesne University in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. The movement began at a spiritual retreat led by two university professors who had received the charismata under the guidance of Presbyterian charismatics.<sup>21</sup> Given these founding circumstances, the parallels to Protestant charismatic worship are unsurprising. Like the regular Protestant home meetings, CCR is formatted as a weekly prayer group attended by upwards of thirty participants.<sup>22</sup> This formatting makes the CCR community responsive to the immediate needs of its members, as was the case in the *comunidades*. The emphasis on spiritual healings and glossolalia, speaking in tongues, makes the meetings a vital aspect of the believer's life—it is a source of physical and spiritual redemption.<sup>23</sup> While data on CCR is not readily available, the Vatican estimates indicate that more than seventy million Catholics belong to CCR, with as many as twenty-two million in Latin America. In the midst of a changing religious climate, CCR valuably diversifies the Catholic Church by emphasizing activity on the local scale.<sup>24</sup> The construct of a CCR clearly replicates the

---

<sup>21</sup> Chesnut, "A Preferential Option for the Spirit," *Latin American Politics and Society*, 60.

<sup>22</sup> Rodney Stark and Buster G. Smith, "Pluralism and the Churching of Latin America," 43.

<sup>23</sup> Chesnut, "A Preferential Option for the Spirit," 61.

<sup>24</sup> Gooren, "The Pentecostalization of Religion and Society in Latin America," 359.

*comundiades* ' priority of meeting the needs of the community, while the encouragement of lay leadership reflects the Pentecostal practice of the same.

Arguably, the rise in Catholic charismatic worship is an effect of the Protestant movement termed "Pentecostalization." Indeed, the Church admitted as much at the 1976 Meeting of the General Secretaries of the Latin American Episcopal Conferences. The "Comunicado Mensal" issued by the conference stated, "In relation to the latter [Assembly of God], we think that a correct and just appreciation of the charismatic groups can establish a point of attraction which offers an alternative to the disquietude of our times."<sup>25</sup> The loss of Catholic parishioners comprised, at least in part, this disquietude. Two researchers, Rodney Stark and Buster G. Smith, undertook a formal sociological analysis of this trend by testing the hypothesis that, "Catholic mass attendance will be higher where Protestants have been more successful." They found the correlation between the percent of Protestant and Catholic attendance to be  $r = 0.451$ , significant beyond the .05 level, and concluded that, "where Protestants have been more successful, the Catholic response has been more energetic."<sup>26</sup> The effect of Protestantism, then, includes not only the conversion of Catholic flock to the Protestant faith, but also the reinvigoration of the Catholic Church by the adoption Protestantism's charismatic worship, most commonly expressed as Pentecostalism.

Moving beyond the religious sphere of immediate influence, it is evident that egalitarian Protestantism has challenged and reshaped traditional Latin American social values, such as race and gender. Given that Latin American Christianity is largely a movement of and by the people, and that it is a movement inclusive of marginalized

---

<sup>25</sup> Ibid, 62.

<sup>26</sup> Stark and Smith, "Pluralism and the Churching of Latin America,"44.

persons, the analysis of gender is significant. To return to the example of the *Las Asambleas*, recall that the board was composed entirely of Peruvian natives. It should also be noted, however, that the executive board is entirely composed of Peruvian men, inviting the discussion of gender egalitarianism in Latin American Pentecostalism. By evaluating the indigenous ownership of the project, the democratic depth of the movement comes into clear focus, but without the gendered component, the argument falls short.

Traditionally, women have been barred from the pastorate in most Protestant denominations and the Catholic Church. The Latin American cultural context, in particular, has propagated a fundamental mistrust of female sexuality. This suspicion of women arose in the colonial era and held steady until the women's rights movements of the twentieth century. The framework for gender theory is evident in the legal codex, *Las Siete Partidas*, which was effective during the early colonial period and reaffirmed in 1811. This document perceived women as a lusty threat to men and therefore gave men absolute power over their households in order to protect the all-important family honor from the tarnish of sexual scandal.<sup>27</sup> The new republics maintained this patriarchal structure, passing the problem across the nineteenth-century and into the twentieth.<sup>28</sup> In the twentieth-century, a shift in gender identities came underway, particularly among the evangelical Christians. As of 2014, seventy-one percent of Peruvian Protestants believe

---

<sup>27</sup> Arlene J. Díaz, "Vicente Ochoa, Dead Many Times: Gender, Politics, and a Death Sentence in Early Republican Caracas, Venezuela," in *Gender Sexuality and Power in Latin America Since Independence*, eds. William French and Katherine Bliss (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2007), 33.

<sup>28</sup> Elizabeth Dore, "One Step Forward, Two Steps Back: Gender and the State in the Long Nineteenth Century," in *Hidden Histories of Gender and the State*, eds. Elizabeth Dore and Maxine Molyneux (Durham: Duke University Press, 2000), 18.

that “Protestant/Evangelical churches should allow women to become pastors.”<sup>29</sup> This supermajority indicates a trend toward egalitarianism in Christian leadership. As a counterbalance to this argument, however, one must note that women are not members of the *Las Asambleas*’ executive board even though, across Latin America, female *evangélicas* outnumber males by a ratio of two to one.<sup>30</sup> These women are evangelists, vested with the authority to share their faith, and despite their absence from formal church leadership, they are utilizing their numerical advantage to push back on traditional limitations. As women share their faith among themselves during private home visits and public exchanges, they obtain a greater sense of responsibility and self *outside* the home.<sup>31</sup> Furthermore, as men come into the church, they are expected to assume a greater sense of responsibility and self *within* the home.

Throughout Latin America, evangelicalism is enacting a “reformation of machismo,” wherein men are encouraged to assume feminine virtues for the sake of their faith and family. The reformation manipulates traditional machismo values in order to advantage women and children. Men were always expected to earn the family income, but now they are additionally required to bring it home rather than wasting a paycheck on alcohol and other women. As Brusco describes the transition in terms of a shift in values whereby, “aggression, violence, pride, self-indulgence, and individualistic orientation in the public sphere are replaced by peace seeking, humility, self-restraint.”<sup>32</sup> This

---

<sup>29</sup> Pew Research Center, “Religion in Latin America: Widespread Change in a Historically Catholic Region,” 267.

<sup>30</sup> Chesnut, *Competitive Spirits*, 43.

<sup>31</sup> Ibid, 142.

<sup>32</sup> Elizabeth E. Brusco, *The Reformation of Machismo: Evangelical Conversion and Gender in Colombia* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1995), 137.

reformation culminates in a “collective orientation and identity within the church and home.”<sup>33</sup> Instead of a male versus female dichotomy, this new culture is comprised of a male and female complementary. The new gender dynamic pertains to the evangelical definition of piety, which conflates social and economic ills with sin. For example, a pastor may preach that debt is a sufficient condition for poverty, and then claim that debt is analogous to a bodily sin.<sup>34</sup> Such argumentation relies on a tacit understanding of the sacrosanct goodness of the Christian community, of which the husband and wife pair is the most fundamental unit. Debt harms the family, as needs go unmet in favor of repayment. Furthermore, it hinders the Christian community, as tithe is unable to be offered. On these two accounts, debt is considered sinful. This high regard for family stability with regard to financial responsibility brings to mind the traditional Andean regard for the husband-wife tribute pair and communal identity. This Christian regard for social order is expressed both locally and nationally.

Among Peruvian Protestantism’s foremost results stands the formal organization of *evangélicos* in democratization projects. Evangelical Christians played a determinative role in the election of President Alberto Fujimori in the 1990 election. Fujimori so rallied the Protestant electorate that his opponent, Mario Vargas Llosa, and the Catholic Church ran an anti-evangelical campaign prior to the second round of voting.<sup>35</sup> Although Fujimori’s presidency was quickly mired by the period of economic instability known as “Fuji-shock,” the Protestants’ ability to rally a voting base indicates

---

<sup>33</sup> Ibid.

<sup>34</sup> Philip Jenkins, *The New Faces of Christianity: Believing the Bible in the Global South* (New York: Oxford 2006), 94.

<sup>35</sup> Paul Freston, *Evangelical Christianity and Democracy in Latin America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 134.

the *evangélicos*' cohesion of religious and social identity. To borrow from the words of Peruvian author Mario Vargas Llosa, Fujimori offered the "illusion that it is, at last, 'the people that govern.'"<sup>36</sup> This phrase well bespeaks the Christian democrats' optimism about the electoral process and their capacity to eliminate government corruption. Following the model of Populism, however these Christian parties tend only to emerge at election season. Neither of the two major Protestant political parties, the Fraternidad Internacional de Pastores Cristianos (The International Brotherhood of Christian Pastors, FIPAC) and Concilio Nacional Evangélico del Perú (the National Evangelical Council of Peru, CONEP), established sustainable voting blocks in the national congress.<sup>37</sup> However, these political organizations demonstrate the bottom-up development of twentieth-century Protestantism. This missionary model emerged as a grassroots movement and it continues to work from the margins of society inward.

### *Conclusion*

The project of Christianization in Peru has seen many iterations and mutations, and the twentieth-century is seemingly the most "successful" of the many. Unlike in the colonial era, Protestant missionaries of the twentieth-century had no power to coerce Peruvians into the church. Furthermore, unlike in the republican era, Protestant missionaries did not themselves face government-imposed limitations on their activities. By investing the Gospel message in native Peruvians, missionaries were able to reach the poor and marginalized people of Peru. By challenging the cultural Catholic hegemony,

---

<sup>36</sup> Alma Guillermoprieto, *Looking for History: Dispatches from Latin America* (New York: Vintage Books, 2001), 175.

<sup>37</sup> Freston, *Evangelical Christianity and Democracy in Latin America*, 142.

Protestants have forged new paths for indigenous empowerment, gender roles, and political engagement.

Descriptive analyses of the twentieth-century surge are, of themselves, valuable, but something more must be added. By examining the continued engagement of Protestant organizations in Peru today, one may perceive the culmination of Peru's five hundred year Christianization project and the two centuries of Protestant presence.



## CHAPTER FIVE

### Buckner Perú Case Study: A Culminating Consideration

Beautiful is the moment in which we understand that we are no more than an instrument of God; we live only as long as God wants us to live; we can only do as much as God makes us able to do; we are only as intelligent as God would have us be.

—Óscar Romero, Archbishop of San Salvador

After centuries of missionary efforts, the Protestants of Peru entered the twenty-first century poised for progress. Having built on the colonial Christianization project, the republican acceptance of religious diversity, and the twentieth-century growth in Protestant congregants, non-Catholics in Peru found themselves with a collective voice in the twenty-first century. In the past fifteen years, Protestant history has unfolded both in the high offices of policy makers and in the dusty streets trod by evangelists. A culminating case study will offer an example of one organization's undertaking to effect positive social change in present-day Peru.

In the ongoing dialectic of history, old ideas meet dissenting notions and engage in the dynamic of mutual criticism leading to a new formulation. For the sake of rhetorical ease and argumentation, this thesis presents Buckner Perú (BP) as the present iteration of the synthesis in Peruvian Protestant missions.<sup>1</sup> BP combines elements of the

---

<sup>1</sup> Distinguishing between “Buckner International” as a parent organization and “Buckner Perú” as a subsidiary will prove crucial to this chapter's argumentation, so I will refrain from using the abbreviation “Buckner.”

three preceding eras into its operational strategy. From the colonial era, BP borrows the element of government cooperation. From the nineteenth-century, BP implements an emphasis on humanitarian services, such as education and healthcare. And, from its rough contemporaries, the twentieth century Protestants, it has imbibed an emphasis on indigenous leadership and localized responsibilities. BP identifies the treatment of Peru's spiritual, psychological, and physical needs as its primary operational goals. At once, BP is both a policy changer and a community builder, an international organization and an indigenous project, a secular functionary and an evangelical light—a missionary in a mission field and a neighbor in a hometown. Having worked with Buckner in Peru for one month during the summer of 2013 and having met with the director of in-country operations in 2014, I will draw on my own personal experiences to describe the organization's structure and operations.

### *An Overview of Buckner Perú's Operational Strategy*

BP first identified a social ill that needed addressing in Peru—institutionalized orphan-care—and then developed a strategy for working with the Peruvian government to change orphan-care policies. It invited the support international advisory organizations, such as United Nations' Children's Rights and Emergency Relief Organization (UNICEF) in order to legitimate and bolster the petition. UNICEF proved a powerhouse partner to Buckner in advocating for, and implementing, a nationalized foster care system. As a trusted international entity, with considerable research and policy resources, UNICEF introduced the social science research to validate BP's proposal. According to its 2009 study of orphan and foster care in Romania, institutionalized

children are “far more physically stunted” than foster cared children. In fact, institutionalized children fell behind normal growth by one month for every 2.6 months spent in the orphanage.<sup>2</sup> This compelling statistic has become a rallying cry for the Peruvian Buckner team. It is one they cite often in interviews and tout in public communications.<sup>3</sup> Social science research legitimates the foster care initiative and brings the initiative into the realm of secular social activism. The BP team does not impose its faith on the government, but instead speaks the language of the milieu. In this way, BP mimics the tactics of Bartolomé de Las Casas, who did not challenge the Spaniards’ religious paradigm, but instead argued within it. Las Casas employed religious rhetoric to turn the Spanish argument in his favor. So too does Buckner Perú participate in the secular value schematic of the Peruvian government by providing scientific evidence and inviting internationally known organizations to validate its intentions—an adroit tactic that has proven effective.

In less than a decade, BP has successfully developed a foster care program for the Peruvian government and developed a strategy to make the program an integral part of Peruvian social policy. In 2006, Buckner representatives opened conversation with President Alejandro Toledo’s administration. While presenting the idea of foster care to the political leadership, Buckner representatives met Claudia León Vergara, then an employee of the National Program for Family Wellbeing (Programa Integral Nacional para el Bienestar Familiar, INABIF). León, a trained attorney, agreed to assume responsibility for the project as an employee of Buckner International and became the

---

<sup>2</sup> Gallianne Palayret, ed., “Children Under the Age of Three in Formal Care in Eastern Europe and Central Asia: A rights-based Regional Situation Analysis,” (UNICEF 2013), 40.

<sup>3</sup> Giugliana Mendoza Fry, interview by Bonnie E. Cantwell (Lima, Peru), June 2013.

founding director of Buckner's regional subsidiary organization, Buckner Perú. In the past decade, León has worked under three Peruvian presidents, and has met dozens of directors, ministers and vice ministers of pertinent government departments. Despite the difficulty of making and re-making points of connection, León has made steady progress. In 2007, the Ministry of Women and Vulnerable Populations (Ministerio de la Mujer y Poblaciones Vulnerables, MMPV), at that time known as the Ministry of Social Development, agreed to a trial run of the foster care program, and in 2008 a group of eight children became the first Peruvians to find placement in foster care homes.<sup>4</sup> Since that modest start, Buckner has continued to support the program and slowly transitioned power from BP as an external organization to the government's own departments.

Although BP has directed the development of Peru's foster care program, the organization has simultaneously sought opportunities to return responsibility to the Peruvian government. As León stated, "we are helping but it is [the government's] responsibility."<sup>5</sup> A premier strategy to this end has been the petition for formal legislative policy. This strategy actively undermines the colonial comparison, as BP looks to cede power back to the state rather than to exert continued external influence. In January 2014, BP saw the project move a step closer to full government incorporation as the Peruvian Congress passed the Law of Foster Care, Ley 30162 de Acogimiento Familiar.<sup>6</sup> This law establishes foster care's objective, definition and particularities. It

---

<sup>4</sup> Claudia León Vergara, "Foster Care Update from Claudia León, Director of Buckner Perú NGO," 2009.

<sup>5</sup> Claudia León Vergara, interview by Bonnie E. Cantwell, Lima, Peru, May 22, 2014.

<sup>6</sup> Congreso de la Republica Peruana, "Ley de Acogimiento Familiar: Ley N 30162," *Sistema Peruano de Información Jurídica* in *El Peruano*, April 1, 2015. <http://spij.minjus.gob.pe/Normas/textos/290114T.pdf>.

does not, however, include a funding clause—a top priority for León—so the program remains dependent on the cobbled support of BP, INABIF, MMPV, and contributing organizations such as UNICEF.

At the international conference hosted by the Peruvian National Congress in May 2014, both Buckner and the Peruvian National government affirmed this trajectory. Peru's Vice President, Marisol Espinoza Cruz, opened the event while Carmen Omonte Duran, Minister of MMPV, offered introductory remarks. The panel discussions and keynote speaking spots were filled with international affiliates of Buckner and local Peruvian leaders. León moderated a discussion on the application process for prospective foster care families. Representatives from Chile, the Dominican Republic, and INABIF Peru explicated their present operational practice in order to promote mutual edification and improvement.<sup>7</sup> The Dominican Republic's National Council for Children and Adolescence (Consejo Nacional Para La Niñez Y La Adolescencia, CONANI) invited León as a special advisor in the development of their own foster care system.<sup>8</sup> The dialogue in Peru exemplified the international conversation that BP began nearly a decade ago. The conversation is not dominated by a U.S. representative, but is instead a collaborative effort in which Latin American countries contribute to an on-going conversation. BP, for its part, continues to cede financial and managerial responsibility for foster care to the Peruvian government, and has begun increasingly to invest in local level ministries.

---

<sup>7</sup> Claudia León Vergara, Estela Ortiz, Alberto Padilla, Martha Rodríguez, and Nancy Tolentino, "Políticas Sociales de Protección: 'Programas de Fortalecimiento Familiar En La República Dominicana,' y 'Acogimiento Familiar: Retos Y Desafíos En La Aplicación de La Medida de Protección.'" *Encuentro Internacional*, Lima, Peru, 2014.

<sup>8</sup> Claudia León Vergara, interviewed by Bonnie Cantwell, (Lima, Peru), May 22, 2014.

### *Drawing Lines of Connection*

BP's operations bear resemblance to the nineteenth-century evangelical emphasis on providing community resources. Through BP's Family Hope Centers (FHCs), the organization is able to meet the physical needs of Peru's impoverished people. Essentially, an FHC is a localized *barrio* resource center. At these centers, BP provides educational resources, regular health clinics, and food subsidies. Just as the Mision Patagonica, the Anglo-American Society, and the South American Missionary Society utilized education as a ministry tool in the nineteenth- and early-twentieth centuries, so too does BP utilize supplementary education resources, e.g. Saturday morning tutoring sessions, as an outreach to the local community.<sup>9</sup> By providing educational resources, missionary agencies are able to fulfill a social and spiritual need at once. As an early-twentieth-century missionary to Puno, Peru, stated, "Only the rudiments of reading, writing, and arithmetic were given; but even that meager education enabled the Indians to read God's word and to avoid being cheated in business transactions."<sup>10</sup> This dualistic approach of meeting practical needs and making proactive spiritual gains is mirrored in BP's social outreach programs.

It is the expressed opinion of BP's missions programming coordinator, Giugliana Mendoza Fry, that community-wide change begins with the next generation.<sup>11</sup> BP's programming is therefore aimed at raising children in an environment of Christian

---

<sup>9</sup> Bonnie Cantwell, Field Research (Lima, Peru), June 2013.

<sup>10</sup> Quoted in Dan C. Hazen, "The Politics of Schooling in the Nonliterate Third World: The Case of Highland Peru," *History of Education Quarterly* 18, no. 4 (1978): 16.

<sup>11</sup> Giugliana Mendoza Fry, Lima, Peru interview by Bonnie E. Cantwell (Lima, Peru), June 2013.

influence. To this end, the FHCs have implemented a spiritual lesson plan: Feed My Sheep (*Apacienta Mis Ovejas*, AMO). AMO is meant to develop a child's spiritual, mental, emotional, and social development and to "motivate children to think about, understand, and desire a relationship with God."<sup>12</sup> At Pamplona, the largest and oldest Peruvian FHC, the AMO program ministers to 80 children. The format accommodates the children's half-day school schedule. Since children ages three to six do not attend class in the morning, they are invited to the FHC for AMO. Conversely, in the afternoon, children seven to twelve come after attending morning classes.<sup>13</sup> This comprehensive programming strategy differs in format from the nineteenth-century Protestant models as BP is distinct from academic tutoring, but like it insofar as both capitalize on the social prize of education in order to engage the community in Christian learning.

Buckner's community investments through the FHCs extend beyond educational resources and spiritual outreach to children. According to self-reported data, the FHC at Pamplona opened in 2011 and regularly assisted 60 families in that year. In 2014, that number nearly doubled with 100 families receiving assistance at the FHC. BP reported ten primary results of their community investment: a reduction of family violence, drug awareness and prevention among adolescents, improved children's hygiene, a diminishing in bodily parasites from three to one per capita, an reduction in family hemoglobin complications, the development of family life plans, the provision of marital counseling, the prevention of water contamination for forty families, more than 300

---

<sup>12</sup> Buckner Perú, "AMO," Centros de Esperanza Familiar, accessed March 23, 2015, <http://www.bucknerperu.org/amo-fortaleciendo-los-corazones-de-nuestros-ninos-y-ninas/>

<sup>13</sup> Bonnie Cantwell, Field Research (Lima, Peru), June 2013.

counseling sessions, and building alliances with local community leaders.<sup>14</sup> None of these results rely on salvation reports or accounts of spiritual life changes, but each of them attests to positive social change. There is, however, a gap between social improvement and spiritual ignition. The first could merely be the fulfillment of a Positivist or scientist dogma, but the latter is the domain of a religious conviction.

A wariness as to authoritative abuses marks Buckner International's operational strategy and BP's ministry format. To borrow phrasing from former Buckner International President, Dr. Ken Hall, BP assumes an "anthropological" approach to missions. In describing this approach, Hall identifies three primary features. First, the missionary should serve the targeted people group by meeting physical needs. Second, the recipient of assistances should not feel obligated to participate in the missionary's religious practices. And third, missionaries should be wary of touting authority when presenting the Gospel.<sup>15</sup> These three priorities indicate Buckner's interest in genuine conversion experiences rather than an impressive tally of "souls saved." BP fulfills this schematic by providing community resources without making spiritual demands. In fact, short-term mission teams enact most of BP's "evangelism" efforts. The every day routines of the FHC are, in this way, distinct from the targeted evangelistic outreaches provided by short-term North American teams. As Hall states, "Short-term missions work is the twenty-first century model of evangelism . . . . A follower of Christ, who

---

<sup>14</sup> Buckner Perú, "Consultoría Técnica," Centros de Esperanza Familiar, accessed March 23, 2015, <http://www.bucknerperu.org/consultoria-tecnica/>.

<sup>15</sup> Ken Hall, interviewed by Bonnie E. Cantwell (Baylor University: Waco, Texas), February 20, 2014.



happens to be an American, becomes a friend to a Peruvian and shares Christ.”<sup>16</sup>

Accordingly, the community is not pressured into religious activity by FHC leaders, but invited to participate by amiable visitors. The long-term success of this format is subject to circumspection. BP does have intentions to develop adult Bible studies and expand its spiritual resources, but it does not presently have such programming available to the community.

In its youth transitional homes, BP does pair Gospel teaching with aid services. The program, entitled *Residentado Juvenil*, invites youth who have reached the age of maturity in orphanages to “develop their dreams and aspirations” in a supportive living environment.<sup>17</sup> To offer a rudimentary sketch of the program: there are two BP transitional homes: one in Lima and one in Cusco. Girls, ages eighteen to twenty-four in Lima and eighteen to twenty-three in Cusco, are invited to live in this “structured home-like setting” after completing their allotted time at a Catholic or state-sponsored orphanage.<sup>18</sup> While in the transitional home, the girls receive room and board, education at a technical institute, job training, and mentoring.<sup>19</sup> The program is meant to prepare the girls to lead successful, independent lives. BP utilizes its spiritual resources unto this end. Unlike in BP’s other ministries, the transitional home format entails focused attention on matters of faith. The girls participate in “church, community and school activities,” generally speaking.<sup>20</sup> Given that the residents arrive at the home from a

---

<sup>16</sup> Ibid.

<sup>17</sup> Buckner Perú, “Residentado Juvenil,” Programas, accessed March 23, 2015, <http://www.bucknerperu.org/residentado-juvenil/>

<sup>18</sup> Buckner International, “Programs Overview,” Peru, accessed March 23, 2015, <http://www.buckner.org/our-work/peru/>.

<sup>19</sup> Ibid.

diverse array of backgrounds, a respect for individual circumstances is in order; as former president Hall emphasized, the residents were not required to adopt Protestant beliefs or affirm Buckner's theological positions.<sup>21</sup> When the girls do gather for weekly Bible study, they are permitted to dialogue freely, and individual expressions of the Christian faith, or doubts as to the same, do not merit reprimand in the homes.<sup>22</sup> This model resembles the colonial model in that the homes operate on the paradigm of Christian thought, but differ by allowing multivariate expressions of faith. Even so, this emphasis on sustained missionary discipleship is an anomaly within the Buckner model.

On the level of the FHCs, Buckner Peru's "anthropological" approach differs from the explicitly evangelical strategy taken up by contemporary Pentecostal Protestants. As Pentecostals operate in the void of formal church leadership and/or an institutional hierarchy, their evangelical strategy is not sensitive to the threat of strong-arm imposition and authoritative manipulation. Protestants in Peru share their faith frequently, with, on average, nearly forty percent presenting the gospel each week.<sup>23</sup> By the same reasoning, Pentecostal evangelists are not afraid to promote spiritual "peer pressure." While BP does encourage positive social development, it does not employ Christian premises to argue for healthy family relationships. FHCs are, essentially, religiously neutral environments that emerge from a Christian culture. In contrast,

---

<sup>20</sup> Ibid.

<sup>21</sup> Ken Hall, interviewed by Bonnie E. Cantwell (Baylor University: Waco, TX), February 20, 2014.

<sup>22</sup> Bonnie Cantwell, Field Research (Lima, Peru, June 2013).

<sup>23</sup> Pew Research Center, "Religion in Latin America: Widespread Change in a Historically Catholic Region," 6.

charismatic Protestant and Catholics barter for converts by promising relational and physical healing as a result of evangelicalism. Rebecca Pierce Bomann's account of Pentecostalism in Bogotá, Colombia elucidates this maneuver. Bomann identifies three posts in the path to conversion: contact with the church, an experience of the supernatural, and the moment of surrender.<sup>24</sup> The Pentecostal poor of Bogotá have desperate material needs (e.g. protection from violence, healing for disease, and economic instability). Evangelical churches cast these desperate material circumstances as spiritual needs. The conversion experience is, therefore, an act of spiritual and physical surrender as *evangélicos* appeal to divine power for the satisfaction of their needs.<sup>25</sup> The spiritual surrender requires a social change, such that *evangélicos* are expected to display their faith through daily actions. In many cases, this requires the adoption of new behavioral norms. For example, a Pentecostal man cannot attend worship one morning and go to the *discoteca* the next night. Instead, must be self-disciplined in displaying his loyalty to one social entity. Attempting to participate in both lifestyles, results in exclusion from the church.<sup>26</sup> Since the Pentecostal community promises physical and spiritual healing for its own members, and social change is considered a demonstration of conversion, social norms stand as a barrier to church entry. BP differs in that it does not pose such a barrier to entry and seeks to meet physical needs without obligating the community to produce a profession of faith.

---

<sup>24</sup> Ibid, 58-66.

<sup>25</sup> Ibid, 134-148.

<sup>26</sup> Robert Brenneman, *Homies and Hermanos* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 143.

These differing operational strategies derive from the different starting points and premises of the Pentecostal movement and BP. Pentecostalism assumes that genuine conversion *will* result in improved spiritual and physical wellbeing. Even in the absence of material resources and educated personnel, Pentecostal leaders promise positive social improvement by the adoption of Christian priorities and principles. BP, in contrast, has material resources to alleviate immediate suffering and qualified personnel to develop the community. Buckner therefore does not require spiritual conversion to be a solution to physical hunger. BP can serve a meal as an act of ministry without bartering for a spiritual experience. In commenting on this strategy, Hall expresses a high degree of comfort with a ministry that does not result in conversions. As he states, “we love people even if they never love our Lord.”<sup>27</sup> In short, Buckner, unlike its peer Pentecostals and missionary antecedents, is more interested in *ministry* than *evangelism*.

Although Buckner differs from the patent evangelistic Protestant model, it finds company in its contemporary peer, World Vision. World Vision, a U.S.-based NGO, similarly distributes power from the central U.S. office to offices abroad. In each region of operation, World vision has a board of directors and a steering committee, and each country likewise has a board. An international oversight board is composed of individuals elected from the regional and country leadership teams.<sup>28</sup> This organizational structure allows for the board’s diverse composition. The international board includes

---

<sup>27</sup> Ken Hall, interviewed by Bonnie E. Cantwell, February 20, 2014.

<sup>28</sup> Thomas Getman, interviewed by the Berkley Center for Religion, Peace & World Affairs, February 26, 2009, 14.

Austrians and Australians, Colombians and Canadians, Malaysians and Malians.<sup>29</sup> This board composition indicates an ambition to be globally rooted and centrally run, a priority common to World Vision and Buckner International alike. As World Vision states in its goal, its priority is to “build on existing local efforts” and to “enable local leadership.”<sup>30</sup> To draw another parallel, World Vision, like Buckner International, strives to improve individuals’ quality of life holistically. The metrics of organizational success are based on “improving child well-being,” a process achieved through meeting physical *and* spiritual needs. In the balance of these two priorities, Thomas Getman, World Vision’s retired Executive Director for International Relations, expresses disinterest in maintaining the expressly evangelical identity of the organization. He states, “I think faith-based is a better way to see [WV’s operations]. It gives you freedom to take it where you’re going to take it. It gives Muslims the freedom to question what they want to question and even to feel solidarity as a monotheistic religion.”<sup>31</sup> This open-handedness as to the identity of the organization mirrors the messaging of Buckner’s “anthropological” approach.

### *Conclusion*

By operating as an institution, e.g. policy work, and adopting the attitude of an individual, e.g. FHC endeavors, Buckner Perú represents a unique era in Peruvian

---

<sup>29</sup> “About Us: Board of Directors,” World Vision International, accessed March 18, 2015, <http://www.wvi.org/board-directors>

<sup>30</sup> “About Us: Our Model for Implementing Programs, World Vision International, accessed March 18, 2015, <http://www.worldvision.org/about-us/how-we-work/our-model-for-implementing-programs>.

<sup>31</sup> Getman, interviewed by the Berkley Center for Religion, Peace & World Affairs, 16.

Protestant missions. On the national level, BP works to change policy, but its ambition is not to forward a Christian agenda. Instead, BP relies on secular paradigms, such as social science, to promote “universal” values. In so doing, BP fulfills the mandate of James 1:27 to “visit orphans and widows in their affliction,” without making explicit reference to Christian motivations.<sup>32</sup>

Moving to its local-level agenda, BP carries over a similar respect for the pre-existing paradigm of the community by refusing to impose its religious beliefs on people whom BP serves. The mild exception to this general trend is the transitional homes, wherein Christian messaging is more prevalent than in the FHC. Additionally, BP relies on the evangelical support of short-term missionaries to articulate the Christian Gospel. BP’s actions define the organization as *ministry*-focused rather than a *missionary* minded. By insisting on serving others, but not demanding a spiritual conversion in response, BP favors a holistic improvement of communities over a markedly spiritual improvement of the same. This separates BP from all of its missionary forerunners in Peru.

---

<sup>32</sup> James 1:27 (ESV)

## CHAPTER SIX

### A Concluding Philosophical Reflection on Contemporary Protestant Missions in Peru

“One never quite stops believing . . . some doubt remains forever.”  
—Gabriel García Márquez, *Of Love and Other Demons*

Buckner International’s deference to humanitarian good above a spiritual agenda bespeaks a trend in pluralistic societies at large. As U.S. sociologist Dr. Peter Berger argues, “Most of the world is fiercely religious. What is new is to take as a fundamental fact that we actually live in a secular as well as a religious world, and the two coexist and interact in many ways. Understanding the intersections is essential.”<sup>1</sup> Both Buckner and World Vision accept governments’ secular status, and intend to live out their own Christian convictions by serving others rather than coercing others into accepting Christian convictions. Berger defines this as a “pluralism of mind.”<sup>2</sup> Such a mentality is in contrast to the intentions and ambitions of all preceding missionary models evaluated in Peru, and demonstrates a congruency with the Western philosophical and political ideas.

Berger’s answer to the quandary of pluralism follows upon on the ideas of John Rawls, as expressed in *Political Liberalism*. Rawls likewise proposes a dualism: he divides the person into “reasonable” and “rational” parts and then attempts to

---

<sup>1</sup> Peter Berger, “A Discussion with Peter Berger, Professor Emeritus at Boston University,” interviewed by the Berkley Center for Religion, Peace & World Affairs, 2.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid, 2.

accommodate both. Two qualities characterize reasonableness: a willingness to propose and abide by fair terms of cooperation in an environment of reciprocal cooperation, and the ability to recognize and bear burdens of judgment.<sup>3</sup> By comparison, rational interests are the individual's personal ends. In selecting and seeking these ends, the rational person does not engage in social cooperation—it is a self-interested and self-motivated endeavor.<sup>4</sup> BP operates reasonably when it employs statistics to indicate the importance of a loving home environment for children. That is, Buckner accepted the legal structure and existing paradigms at play in Peru when making its case for foster care. This was an essentially reasonable proposal. Now, of course, BP derives its belief in the “goodness” of a healthy childhood from its rational Christian faith. Indeed, Buckner International, as an organization, exists to “transform the lives of vulnerable children, enrich the lives of senior adults, and build strong families through Christ-centered values.”<sup>5</sup> This is a rational end because it expresses the *telos* of BP as an entity. As Berger elucidates this rational/reasonable distinction: “The deeply committed Catholic brain surgeon is an example: when he operates, he operates in an entirely secular paradigm.”<sup>6</sup> This example holds for BP's work on the legislative level, but is more challenging to apply on the local level.

BP operates within the tension of rendering physical services now and providing spiritual salvation for later. While the Liberation Theology movement placed tremendous

---

<sup>3</sup> John Rawls, *Political Liberalism*, (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005), 58-59.

<sup>4</sup> Ibid, 51.

<sup>5</sup> Buckner International, “Our Mission and Vision,” Who We Are, accessed March 23, 2015, <http://www.buckner.org/who-we-are/>.

<sup>6</sup> Berger, “A Discussion with Peter Berger, Professor Emeritus at Boston University,” 6.



stock in the coming divine salvation from physical and spiritual ills, and present-day *evangélico* pastors rely on spiritual healing in the present moment, Buckner cautiously defers the question of Christian salvation to short-term missionaries. BP endeavors to respect pre-existing cultural norms without denying its founding message, to operate under reasonable constraints to fulfill rational ends. This tension is present even in Buckner International's mission statement, which expresses the intention to "transform lives," through "Christ-centered values."<sup>7</sup> The phrasing is critical: Buckner does not claim to transform lives through Christ's power, but rather through general Christian morals. This allows Buckner to work on the neutral ground of common consensus, e.g. a community wants clean water and Buckner provides it. Buckner International may therefore act as a ministry organization, if not missionary one.

This conscious respect for individual determinism proactively delimits BP's role in the Peruvian plague of inequality. Whether expressed as colonialism, *gamonalismo*, or populism, Peru's history attests to moments of exploitation at the behest of powerful national and international actors. José Carlos Mariátegui, a philosopher writing in the early-twentieth-century, defines *gamonalismo* as the over-under system of suppression operational in Peru from the colonial era to present. Although Mariátegui wrote in the context of Marxist thought, his survey of Peruvian inequality gives voice to a common Peruvian sentiment. The *gamonal* is the heir to the colonial elite, in that he has inherited the power of the *latifundi*, which derived its wealth from the *hacienda*.<sup>8</sup> Abstracting this

---

<sup>7</sup> Buckner International, "Our Mission and Vision," Who We Are, accessed March 23, 2015, <http://www.buckner.org/who-we-are/>.

<sup>8</sup> José Carlos Mariátegui, "Seven Interpretative Essays on Peruvian Reality: The Problem of the Indian," in *Latin American Philosophy for the 21st Century*, ed. Jorge J.E. Gracia and Elizabeth Millán-Zaibert (Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 2004), 259.

term from its immediate context, the *gamonal* becomes a powerful symbol for social inequality. By clearly elucidating this problem, the symbol comes to demand respect for vulnerable persons. Mariátegui argued that the elite have continually exploited the poor in Peru, an argument supported by the twentieth-century rise in populism. Populist parties, which emerged in the 1930s, perpetuated the institutional restraint of the Peruvian people and affirmed Mariátegui's premise that oppression of the elite is a post-colonial Peruvian plague.<sup>9</sup> In order to evade this oppressively unequal power structure, the persons wielding authority must consciously divest themselves of power in order to enable the dependent persons' free action. BP's insistence on creating space for individual religious determination while providing resources for physical well being fulfills this high calling. It furthermore indicates, however, evangelism may only be possible when individuals have obtained requisite community trust on the grounds of equality.

The currents of conversation and trends of missionary models throughout the centuries, from the colonial era to Buckner's present day operations, indicate the evolutionary nature of history. Ideas rise, are challenged, compromised, and transformed. Missionary histories are no different. Keen ideological debates persist, but critical shifts in practice accompany legislative changes and moments of marketplace opportunity. The twentieth-century surge in Protestantism may well be the work of Providence, but it is simultaneously the climax of a four-hundred-year Christianization project and one hundred years of Protestant influence. That the trend may be traced does not reduce the

---

<sup>9</sup> Steve Stein, *Populism in Peru* (Madison, WI: The University of Wisconsin Press, 1980), 7.

significance of its occurrence. Instead, it indicates the participation of a singularity within universality—the vast chains of causality that tie past to present to future.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

### *Conducted Interviews*

- Fry, Giugliana Mendoza. Interview by Bonnie E. Cantwell. Lima, Peru. June 2013.
- Hall, Ken. "The Buckner Missionary Model." Interview by Bonnie E. Cantwell. Baylor University: Waco, TX. February 20, 2014.
- Horton, Dennis. "Efficacy of Short-Term Mission Trips." Interview by Bonnie E. Cantwell, February 25, 2014.
- León Vergara, Claudia. A Conversation with the Director of Buckner Perú. Interview by Cantwell, Bonnie. Lima, Peru. May 22, 2014.

### *Primary Sources*

- American Bible Society, ed. *Bible Society Record*. Vol. 56–58. Astor Place, New York: American Bible Society, 1911.
- Beach, H.P. *Protestant Missions in South America*. New York: Young People's Missionary Movement of the United States and Canada, 1900.
- Buckner Perú. "Consultoría Técnica." Centros de Esperanza Familiar. Accessed March 23, 2015. <http://www.bucknerperu.org/consultoria-tecnica/>.
- Children Under the Age of Three in Formal Care in Eastern Europe and Central Asia: A Rights-Based Regional Situation Analysis*. UNICEF, 2013.
- Comte, August. *General View of Positivism*. Translated by J.H. Bridges. London: Trubner and Co., 1851.
- Congreso de la Republica Peruana. "Ley de Acogimiento Familiar: Ley N 30162." El Peruano. Sistema Peruano de Información Jurídica, April 1, 2015. <http://spij.minjus.gob.pe/Normas/textos/290114T.pdf>.
- Gardiner, Elizabeth Lydia Marsh. *Records of the South American Missionary Society; Or, Fifty Years' Work of the Church of England in South America (British Guiana Excepted)*. London: South American Missionary Society, 1896.

- Getman, Thomas. Interview by Berkley Center for Religion, Peace & World Affairs, February 26, 2009.
- Gibbon, Edward. *The History of the Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*. Vol. I. VIII Baudry's European Library, 1840.
- Gutiérrez, Gustavo. "The Task and Content of Liberation Theology." Edited by Christopher Rowland. *The Cambridge Companion to Liberation Theology*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- "Junta Ejecutiva Nacional." *Las Asambleas de Dios Del Perú*. Accessed February 13, 2015. <http://www.asambleasdediosperu.org.pe/asambleas-de-dios-del-peru-jen.html>.
- Las Casas, Bartolomé de. *In Defense of the Indians*. In *Latin American Philosophy for the 21st Century*, edited by Jorge J.E. Gracia and Elizabeth Millán-Zaibert. Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 2004.
- León Vergara, Claudia. Estela Ortiz, Alberto Padilla, Martha Rodríguez, and Nancy Tolentino. "Políticas Sociales de Protección: 'Programas de Fortalecimiento Familiar En La República Dominicana,' y 'Acogimiento Familiar: Retos Y Desafíos En La Aplicación de La Medida de Protección.'" *Encuentro Internacional, Acogimiento Familiar y Adopción: Por su Derecho a Vivir en Familia*. Lima, Peru, 2014.
- "Luther Bagby Collection," n.d. #1337. The Texas Collection, Baylor University.
- Markham, Sir Clements Robert. *Peru*. London: Gilbert and Rivington, 1880.
- Mariátegui, José Carlos. "Seven Interpretative Essays on Peruvian Reality: The Problem of the Indian." In *Latin American Philosophy for the 21st Century*, edited by Jorge J.E. Gracia and Elizabeth Millán-Zaibert. Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 2004.
- Peter Berger. A Discussion with Peter Berger, Professor Emeritus at Boston University, January 20, 2015. Berkeley Center for Religion, Peace & World Affairs.
- Schwartz, Ed. *Trophies of God's Grace: "...God Gave the Increase."* Cleveland, Ohio: Baptist Mid-missions, 1996.
- Religion in Latin America: Widespread Change in a Historically Catholic Region*. Pew Research Center, November 13, 2014.
- Thompson, A.C. *Protestant Missions: Their Rise and Early Progress*. Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions, 1903.

World Vision International. "About Us: Board of Directors." About Us. Accessed March 18, 2015. <http://www.worldvision.org/about-us/how-we-work/our-model-for-implementing-programs>.

———. "About Us: Our Model for Implementing Programs." About Us. Accessed March 18, 2015. <http://www.wvi.org/board-directors>.

### *Secondary Sources*

Aguiar, Christine, Rosefeld, Josh, Stevens, Beth, Thanasombat, Sup, and Masud, Harikca. "An Analysis of Malnutrition Programming and Policies in Peru." paper prepared for the International Economic Development Program at the Gerald R. Ford School of Public Policy and School of Public Health, University of Michigan, April 2007.

Alcalde, Cristina M. *Woman in the Violence: Gender, Poverty, and Resistance in Peru*. Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press, 2010.

Anderson, Allan Heaton. *To the Ends of the Earth: Pentecostalism and the Transformation of World Christianity*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2013.

Bomann, Rebecca Pierce. *Faith in the Barrios: The Pentecostal Poor in Bogotá*. Boulder, Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers, 1999.

Boyle, Kevin, and Juliet Sheen. *Freedom of Religion and Belief: A World Report*. New York: Routledge, 2003.

Brenneman, Robert. *Homies and Hermanos*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012.

Bruno-Jofré, Rosa del Carmen. *Methodist Education in Peru: Social Gospel, Politics, and American Ideological and Economic Penetration, 1888-1930*. Waterloo, Ont., Canada: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1988.

Bundy, David. "Historia de Las Asambleas de Dios Del Perú." *The Journal of the Society For Pentecostal Studies* 13, no. 1 (Spring 1991).

Butterworth, Douglas, and Chance, John K. *Latin American Urbanization*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1981.

Chambers, Sarah C. "New Nations and New Citizens: Political Culture in Nineteenth-Century Mexico, Peru, and Argentina." *Blackwell Companions to World History: A Companion to Latin American History*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 2010.

- Chesnut, R. Andrew. "A Preferential Option for the Spirit: The Catholic Charismatic Renewal in Latin America's Religious Economy." *Latin American Politics and Society* 45 (2003).
- . *Competitive Spirits: Latin America's New Religious Economy*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2003.
- Cleary, Edward L., and Hannah W. Stewart-Gambino, eds. *Power, Politics, and Pentecostals in Latin America*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1997.
- Dore, Elizabeth, and Molyneaux, Maxine, eds. *Hidden Histories of Gender and the State*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000.
- Escobar, Samuel. *The New Global Mission*. Downers Grove, Illinois: Intervarsity, 2003.
- Espinoza, G. Antonio. *Education and the State in Modern Peru: Primary School in Lima: 1821 - C. 1921*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.
- Fernandez, Bina. *Transformative Policy for Poor Women: A New Feminist Framework*. Farnham, Surrey, GBR: Ashgate Publishing Group, 2012.
- French, William, and Katherine Bliss, eds. *Gender Sexuality and Power in Latin America Since Independence*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2007.
- Freston, Paul. *Evangelical Christianity and Democracy in Latin America*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- García, María Elena. *Making Indigenous Citizens: Identities, Education, and Multicultural Development in Peru*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2005.
- Garrard-Burnett, Virginia. *Protestantism in Guatemala: Living in the New Jerusalem*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1998.
- . *On Earth as It Is in Heaven: Religion in Modern Latin America*. Wilmington, Delaware: Scholarly Resources, Inc., 2000.
- . *Protestantism in Guatemala*. United States of America: University of Texas Press, 1998.
- Gareis, Iris. "Repression and Cultural Change: the 'Extirpation of Idolatry' in Colonial Peru." Edited by Nicholas Griffiths and Fernando Cervantes. Edgbaston, Birmingham: University of Birmingham Press 1999.
- Gooren, Henri. "The Pentecostalization of Religion and Society in Latin America." *Exchange* 39 (2010): 355–76.

- Guillermoprieto, Alma. *Looking for History: Dispatches from Latin America*. New York: Vintage Books, 2001.
- Guillermoprieto, Alma. *The Heart That Bleeds*. New York: Vintage Books, 1994.
- Gutiérrez, Gustavo. *A Theology of Liberation: History, Politics, and Salvation*. Edited and translated by Caridad Inda and John Eagleson. London: SCM, 2001.
- Gutmann, Matthew C. *Changing Men and Masculinities*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003.
- Hazen, Dan C. "The Politics of Schooling in the Nonliterate Third World: The Case of Highland Peru." *History of Education Quarterly* 18, no. 4 (1978): 419–43.
- Irrázaval, Diego. *Inculturation: New Dawn of the Church in Latin America*. Eugene, Oregon: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 1998.
- Jenkins, Philip. *New Faces of Christianity*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Klaiber, Jeffrey L. *Religion and Revolution in Peru, 1824-1976*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1977.
- Kohn, Margaret, and Keally McBride. *Political Theories of Decolonization: Postcolonialism and the Problem of Foundations*. Oxford Scholarship Online, 2011.
- Lacy, Creighton. *The Word Carrying Giant: The Growth of the American Bible Society (1816-1966)*. South Pasadena, CA: Creighton Lacy, 1977.
- Martin, Cheryl E. and Mark Wasserman. *Latin America and Its People*. New York: Pearson, 2011.
- Nuccetelli, Susana. *Latin American Thought: Philosophical Problems And Arguments*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 2001.
- Penyak, Lee M., and Walter, Perry J. *Religion and Society in Latin America: Interpretive Essays from Conquest to Present*. Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books, 2009.
- Rawls, John. *Political Liberalism*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2005.
- Recinos, Harold J. *Good News from the Barrio: Prophetic Witness for the Church*. Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 2006.



- Rieger, Joerg. "Theology and Mission Between Neocolonialism and Postcolonialism." *Mission Studies* 21, no. 2 (2004): 201–27.
- Rivera, Luis N. *A Violent Evangelism: The Political and Religious Conquest of the Americas*. Louisville, Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 1992.
- Schwaller, John Frederick. *The History of the Catholic Church in Latin America: From Conquest to Revolution and Beyond*. New York: New York University Press, 2011.
- Spalding, Arthur Whitefield. *Origin and History of Seventh-day Adventists*. Washington D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1962.
- Stark, Rodney, and Buster G. Smith. "Pluralism and the Churching of Latin America." *Latin American Politics and Society* 54 (2012).
- Stein, Steve. *Populism in Peru*. Madison, WI: The University of Wisconsin Press, 1980.
- Turner, Mark. *From Two Republics to One Divided: Contradictions of Postcolonial Nationmaking in Andean Peru*. Durham, North Carolina: Duke University Press, 1997.