

ABSTRACT

Virgil's Anna: *Unanima Soror*

Anna Lam

Director: Alden Smith, Ph.D.

The present study concerns Anna, the sister of Dido in Book Four of Virgil's foundational, Roman epic poem, the *Aeneid*. I analyze the intertextual relationship Anna's character shares with the nurse figure of tragedy, and how Virgil builds a new kind of tragic figure out of the Greek material—the tragic, maternal sister. Virgil further links Anna to the nurse figure by using specific incendiary language and by utilizing her deep religious and etymological origins as a mother/nurse goddess. These connections link her to the other two sisters of the *Aeneid*, Juturna and Acca, who are also fundamentally associated with motherhood. Within Virgil's narrative, these three sisters are employed to assist in the founding of Rome, the ultimate telos of the *Aeneid*.

APPROVED BY DIRECTOR OF HONORS THESIS:

Dr. Alden Smith, Department of Classics

APPROVED BY THE HONORS PROGRAM:

Dr. Elizabeth Corey, Director

DATE: _____

VIRGIL'S ANNA: UNANIMA SOROR

A Thesis Submitted to the Faculty of

Baylor University

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the

Honors Program

By

Anna Lam

Waco, Texas

May 2019

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter One: Introduction	1
Chapter Two: Anna and Dido: Redefining Tragic Sisterhood	20
Chapter Three: Anna as Kindler: Incendiary Language in Book Four	42
Chapter Four: Anna as Nurse: Further Connections	51
Chapter Five: Conclusion	67
Bibliography	69

CHAPTER ONE

Introduction

The *Aeneid* is complex and profound, qualities that Henry Nettleship, in his 1885 essay “Suggestions Introductory to a Study of the *Aeneid*,” argued had not been adequately considered among his contemporary scholars. Nettleship explained that Virgil could not be compared to Homer (which only exaggerated the deficiencies that critics of the *Aeneid* saw) but must instead be considered within the richer and vaster literary and historical context in which the *Aeneid* was written.¹ Such a project is a daunting one, but the present study of Anna, the sympathizing sister of Dido, is an attempt to contribute in a small way to this project. Consideration of Anna is inextricably linked to her captivating and emotionally alluring sister, Dido, the queen of Carthage. Virgil’s Dido is tenaciously passionate, her character endowed with a fearsomely benevolent love that is precariously balanced against an equally fearsome manic-depressive odium. Opposite this imposing and radiant figure is Anna, a character much humbler in stature, yet one who acts in a kind of “supporting role” to Dido—something much more interesting than a mere foil character. In her we find the

¹Henry Nettleship, “Suggestions Introductory to a Study of the *Aeneid*,” in *Lectures and Essays on Subjects Connected with Latin Literature and Scholarship*, (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1885), 98.

even-tempered constitution of a dear sister and confidante, and it is upon Anna that a truly sincere tragedy is foisted. Well-intentioned, but missing the mark, Anna seeks her sister's happiness yet in doing so ensures her doom. This chapter will examine the interpretations of Anna over the decades as a foundation for a fuller study of her character in the wider literary and historical context in which she is situated.

Beginning with suggestions from Macrobius and Servius, many have understood the *Aeneid* to have been indebted to a great many earlier poetic works,² one of which was Naevius' *Bellum Punicum*, the first Roman epic. Macrobius discussed Naevius' influence on Book 1,³ and one may accordingly hypothesize that a similar influence carried into Book 4, which picks up the narrative following Anna's tale.⁴ He likewise noted Naevius' treatment of both Anna and Dido as individual characters—a potential precedent for Virgil.⁵ Servius on the other hand offers an alternate tradition: *Varro ait non Didonem sed*

²See R. A. Smith, *Virgil*, (Wiley-Blackwell, 2011) for a fuller discussion of Virgil's various other poetic influences.

³Macrobius, *Sat. 6, 2, 31* in Emil Baehrens, *Fragmenta Poetarum Romanorum* (Lipsiae: Teubner, 1886).

⁴See Arthur Stanley Pease, *Publi Vergili Maronis Aeneidos Liber Quartus*, (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1967), pp. 18-21 for a much longer and more detailed discussion on the extent to which scholars have attributed influence in the *Aeneid* to Naevius.

⁵[C]uius filiae fuerint Anna et Dido Naevius dicit, "Naevius says Anna and Dido were his daughters" (Schol. Dan. *Aen.* 4, 9).

Annam amore Aeneae impulsam se supra rogam interemisse, “Varro said that not Dido, but Anna, killed herself on the funeral pyre, impelled by love of Aeneas” (Schol. Dan. *Aen.* 4, 682). Servius’ commentary thus indicates that existing versions of the story from which Virgil could have modelled Book Four already included Dido, Anna, and Aeneas. We can thus infer that Virgil was participating in a literary tradition very much alive in his time.

Part of the success of the *Aeneid* was that it was wrought from Rome’s splendid legendary past, as E. K. Rand has observed.⁶ Virgil masterfully assimilated material from the old legends of Rome’s ancestors,⁷ giving already deeply revered traditions a place in the poetic canon. This is not to say that Virgil was merely an imitator but instead that he was a creator building upon already well-respected literary traditions. This is again Nettleship’s view, shared by scholars like Richard Heinze, who argued in his influential 1903 *Virgils Epische Technik* that Virgil could only have written his epic after an “endless process of appraisal, consideration and reconsideration” of various preceding works in

⁶Edward Kennard Rand, *The Magical Art of Virgil*, (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1931).

⁷For a deeper discussion of the legendary Aeneas, see Sergio Casali, “The Development of the Aeneas Legend” in *A Companion to Vergil’s Aeneid and its Tradition* (John Wiley & Sons, 2014).

epic, epyllion, and tragedy that doubtlessly influenced the *Aeneid*.⁸ Of the books that wax tragic, none does so more overtly than Book Four.⁹ Heinze sees Anna's role as a confidante and go-between as a borrowing of the stock nurse figure in Hellenistic romantic literature. He states that her use is primarily a technical device whereby the audience learns of the heroine's deepest feelings without the poet resorting to a monologue. Virgil's decision to have the functional part of the nurse be played instead by a sister preserves, according to Heinze, the "elevated style that epic demands," and he considers Anna's role important for the dramatic and artistic effect of the fourth book (especially in its final, emotionally-charged scene) but not essential to its action.¹⁰

T. R. Glover similarly observes an elevation of style in the Dido episode, but also the remarkable way that story is told against the backdrop of history in the *Aeneid*, emphasizing Virgil's vast knowledge of and appreciation for Greek poets such as the tragedians and the Alexandrines.¹¹ Book Four is indeed

⁸Richard Heinze, *Virgils Epische Technik*, (Leipzig: B. G. Teubner, 1903), reprint, Los Angeles: California University Press, 1994, p. 208.

⁹Some scholars have argued that 'dramatic' is a more appropriate label than 'tragic' for the fourth book. See H. L. Tracy, "Aeneid IV: Tragedy or Melodrama?" *The Classical Journal* 41, 5 (1946): 199-202.

¹⁰Heinze (1903) 100.

¹¹T. R. Glover, *Studies in Virgil*, (London: E. Arnold, 1904): p. 50-51.

preoccupied with feminine experience in much the same way the plays of Euripides are. Tragedy concerned with conflict, and Virgil depicts Dido faced with a struggle to resist passion as Phaedra did in Euripides' *Hippolytus*. Just as Phaedra is manipulated by Aphrodite into falling in love and subsequently kills herself, Dido is just as callously manipulated by Venus (though Glover notes that Dido's love may have happened without the additional encouragement).¹² Glover's account of Dido is that Virgil presents her as both woman and queen. She is just shy of divinity (despite the many appropriate comparisons), yet she is no girl, having been taught by both the bitter and sweet experiences of life. She has all the tenderness and sympathy of a woman, yet the regal carriage and stately accomplishments of a queen. Her sensibilities are endowed with that distinctly Roman sense of womanly decorum and modesty, *pudicitia*, which rests deeply and immovably in her conscience. This last characteristic, Glover says, is the crucial aspect of Dido's character that Anna underestimates. He identifies Dido's sister with the stock sister of Greek tragedy, particularly Ismene, calling her Cyrenic and "a woman of the 'common-sense' school, not at all of an imaginative habit."¹³ In this way, she bears resemblance to Phaedra's nurse in

¹²Ibid., 164-169.

¹³Ibid., 174.

the *Hippolytus*, whose similar disregard for moral scruple is a defining characteristic.¹⁴ Anna encourages Dido to act contrary to her conscience, and in doing so directly participates in her sister's undoing.¹⁵

That Dido belongs in the company of other tragic heroines is a point made by Norman W. DeWitt in his "The Dido Episode as Tragedy."¹⁶ Like these women, she is of noble birth, thus lending a similarly splendid palatial setting to the fourth book's narrative. DeWitt also points to other features of Book Four that are shared with tragedy, such as the lack of reference to time, passages with a lyric flavor, and the presence of stock characters. To this last feature, DeWitt likens Anna to tragic stock figures such as Ismene, the sister of Antigone, or Phaedra's nurse in the *Hippolytus*. Ascanius carrying Helen's mantle to Dido evokes Medea's children carrying the deadly robe to Jason's bride. Suicide was also common among tragic characters, and Book Four does

¹⁴H. W. Garrod agrees on the resemblance of the characters in Book Four to those of the *Hippolytus*: "Vergil set himself to give us a queen of tragedy. Clearly he worked at Dido and Anna with his eye on Phaedra and the Nurse in Euripides' *Hippolytus*. He meant to give us a story of ὕβρις and the inevitable ἄτη that follows upon it. The book is conceived throughout in the spirit of Athenian drama: and it is tragic in form as well as in conception"; H. W. Garrod, *English Literature and the Classics: Tragedy*, (1912): 152.

¹⁵Glover (1904) 189.

¹⁶Norman W. DeWitt, "The Dido Episode as a Tragedy," *The Classical Journal* 2, 7 (1907): 283-288.

not lack for in tragic irony.¹⁷ The most important tragic element of the fourth book, however, is its plot. The action of the story bears itself out tragically; a queen otherwise preeminent in virtue and fortune dooms herself, due to her intrinsically passionate personality, to a fate partially undeserved.

Herbert H. Yeames notes that the tragedy of Dido poses a very important problem for the modern reader, whose instinct might be to condemn Aeneas' seemingly callous abandonment of the queen. Indeed, Virgil would seem to risk the esteem of his hero in favor of his lover, Dido, by making her too sympathetic a character. She meets Aristotle's criteria for a tragic figure, arousing the essential feelings of fear and pity, and being an essentially noble figure who fails due to her own error.¹⁸ Yeames compares the disease-like quality of Dido's passion to that of Phaedra's, yet carefully distinguishes her as the nobler character. Dido ever remains a queen, going to the end with a dignity unsullied by any casting of vengeful slander, as Phaedra did. The effect of such a tragic

¹⁷DeWitt writes, "Dido and Anna sacrifice to Phoebus, Ceres, and Lyaeus—the gods that preside over the foundation of the cities and the arts of peace; but she was soon to forget her city and to leave unquenchable enmity to her posterity. Perhaps the irony of the banquet scene is even greater. She invokes Jupiter, the god of guests, and by her guest she was to fall. She calls upon Bacchus, the giver of joy, but her happiness was so soon to pass away. She prays for kindly Juno to be near, and Juno proved the unkindest of all to her. Last of all, she prays that the day may be a joyous one to the Tyrians and to them who have come from Troy, while the fourth book ends with a curse and a legacy of hatred."

¹⁸Herbert H. Yeames, "The Tragedy of Dido. Part I," *The Classical Journal* 8, 4 (1913): 140-43.

depiction of the neglect of duty (on the part of both lovers) is, as Yeames argues, to make “a powerful plea for the old Roman morality, to which Rome must return if she is to achieve the great destiny [Virgil] sees in store for her, a destiny to be achieved only by character.”¹⁹ The poetic dualism of passion and duty is essential to the *Aeneid*, a dualism that anticipates its resolution in Rome’s destiny.

The theme of contesting forces and its symbolic expression is explored in depth by Viktor Pöschl in his flagship 1962 work *The Art of Vergil*. To Pöschl, Juno is the symbolic manifestation of the chaotic forces that oppose the organizing forces of Jupiter at the divine level. On the human level, chaotic passion and tempered order are embodied by Dido and Aeneas, respectively.²⁰ For Pöschl, Dido’s character and story cumulatively add tragic emphasis to the poem. Further, the simile comparing Dido to the huntress goddess Diana foreshadows the hunt that will lead to her destruction. Virgil stresses the queen’s innate humanity and generosity, rendering the reversal of her fortunes all the more tragic. Her tragedy, Pöschl writes, is the result of how her inherent character interacts with her inherent situation. Dido’s undoing is her destiny, a destiny tied to that of her city at large. Anna’s words to Dido in *Aen.* 4,682 imply

¹⁹Ibid., 149.

²⁰Viktor Pöschl, *The Art of Vergil*, (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1962): 18.

this larger context, and Pöschl regards Dido's well-intentioned sister with favorable opinion.²¹ Anna's words to Dido appeal to the parts of her better nature that make her truly noble—her desire to see her city flourish, her profound capacity for compassion, and a longing for children. All these things Anna awakens, but they were already within her to begin with.

For Arthur Stanley Pease, whose 1967 commentary on the fourth book is still, in many ways, the industry standard, the theme of the *Aeneid* is the twin origins of Rome and Augustus, and Virgil's epic was endowed with the all richness of its Homeric epic inheritance.²² The fourth book functions to describe a delay in the crucial founding of Rome much as Circe and Calypso stall Odysseus' return to his home in Ithaca. Extensive use of dramatic elements complement its epic elements; Pease points to the central part that conflict—a hallmark of tragedy—plays within Book Four,²³ and he identifies Euripides'

²¹"Anna is not the lascivious insinuator found in the Attic drama. She is not a Euripidean nurse, no Menandrian confidante. Her first words are those of a tender, loving sister . . . She engenders the idea in Dido's already loving heart that the exposed kingdom needs a protector and that only Aeneas can bring about the real greatness of Carthage," *ibid.*, 76.

²²Pease (1967) 3.

²³"Among the dramatic incidents of the *Aeneid*, however, none is more outstandingly tragic than the Dido episode, both in those larger conflicts of laws and of duties so dear to the Greek dramatists and also in the minor details similarity to tragic technique. . . This clash of love and duty, of the *violentia* and passion of the moment with a far-sighted *pietas* toward gods and race, furnishes the main dramatic conflict of the book, and is found in each of its two principal character," from Arthur Stanley Pease, *Publi Vergili Maronis Aeneidos: Liber Quartus*, (1967): 8-9.

Medea and Apollonius' *Argonautica* as works particularly influential to Virgil.²⁴ He further sketches Aeneas and Dido as allegories for Augustus and Cleopatra, respectively. Dido, like Cleopatra, was an African queen driven from her homeland by her brother and who detained an important Roman at her palace through the winter before committing suicide at his departure.²⁵ Aeneas and Augustus are alike in that each is committed to the Roman ideal of *pietas*, and, though often regarded as Stoic with respect to self-restraint, each has the ability to lapse into vengeful anger. Both also ultimately forego personal gratification (and the woman involved) for the greater good of their responsibilities. Pease further delineates Aeneas and Dido as opposite one another in philosophies, with Dido tending toward Epicureanism where Aeneas tends toward Stoicism, though neither character necessarily represents a paragon of either philosophy.²⁶ Still, while Aeneas may be accused of being cold and unfeeling, Pease points to important phrases highlighting Aeneas' Stoic suppression of feeling.²⁷ Aeneas is

²⁴Servius wrote: *Apollonius Argonautica scripsit et in tertio inducit amantem Medeam; inde totus hic liber translates est*, "Apollonius wrote the *Argonautica* and introduced a love-struck Medea in the fourth book; from here this whole book has been conveyed" (*Aen.* 4,1).

²⁵Pease (1967) 25-26.

²⁶Though admired by many for his *pietas*, Aeneas was not without his flaws. For the extent to which Aeneas is an "ideal" Stoic, see C. M. Bowra, "Aeneas and the Stoic Ideal," *Greece & Rome* 3, 7 (1933): 8-21.

²⁷[O]bnixus curam sub core premebat, "Resolute, he was pressing care beneath his heart" (*Aen.* 4,332); multa gemens magnoque animum labefactus amore, "Groaning much, and his mind shaken by a great love" (*Aen.* 4,395); magno persentit pectore curas; / mens immota manet, lacrimae

the epic's hero, yet at times he is a rather passive agent. For Pease, he is also a tragic figure whose delay in Carthage is his tragic flaw. Finally, Pease considers Anna a foil to Dido, similar to Chalcioppe in Appollonius' *Argonautica*: she is a close companion, she is matter-of-fact in her judgements, and her presence heightens the story's pathos.

These important works certainly point up, among other things, the marked complexity of the *Aeneid*. In what is perhaps the signal work of Virgilian scholarship of the mid-twentieth century, Brooks Otis has argued for the success of the *Aeneid* despite its complexities. He writes that, of the famous epics, "Only the *Aeneid* aspired to be both heroic and civilized, both remote and contemporary, both Homeric and Augustan."²⁸ For Otis, Virgil's success was that he revived the work of his literary ancestors, having no live genre to work with himself. He followed in Homer's footsteps in his treatment of the mythical past, yet he uniquely imbued the narrative with his own subjective voice, producing what Otis likened to a 'psycho-drama.'²⁹ In this way Virgil could depict not only the struggle of his hero against external forces of *furor* but also

voluntur inanes, "He felt cares in his great heart" (*Aen.* 4,448-449); *demisit lacrimas dulcique adfatus amore est*, "He let fall tears and was addressed by sweet love" (*Aen.* 6,455).

²⁸Brooks Otis, *Virgil, A Study in Civilized Poetry*, (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1964), reprint, University of Oklahoma Press, 1995: p. 2-3.

²⁹Otis (1964) 42; Heinze (1903) 371.

against those within himself—a psychological portrait of the semi-divine man which was the first of its kind. Virgil accordingly divides the *Aeneid* between the internal psychological struggle (the first six books, or the Odyssean *Aeneid*) and the conflicts with outside enemies (the last six books, or the Iliadic *Aeneid*). The Dido episode falls within the former, wherein Virgil sensitively renders the emotional responses of Aeneas (who, for example, is deeply affected by the depictions on the frieze of the temple of Juno), but especially of Dido. Virgil's usage of various epithets for his characters is one way in which he inserts his subjective voice into the narrative, as when he describes Dido as *infelix* (*Aen.* 1,712; 4,68), “a finger-pointing word . . . the word for those who oppose fate or whom fate opposes but are yet worthy of true pity.”³⁰ Likewise, the moralizing tone of her words addressed to *pudor* (*Aen.* 4,24-27) reflects Virgil's own judgements. Virgil thus differed from the other great epicists such as Homer and Apollonius by including dramatic content delivered with a subjective voice while still adhering to some basic parts of the epic formula.

As Julia T. Dyson has observed, Virgil seems to both admire the beauty of Epicureanism and at the same time negate its truths.³¹ Just as Aeneas in many

³⁰Otis (1964) 70.

³¹Julia T. Dyson, “Dido the Epicurean,” *Classical Antiquity* 15, 2 (1996): p. 203-221.

ways falls short of the Stoic ideal, so too does Dido poorly execute her brand of Epicurean philosophy. She fails to abide by truly Epicurean principles, and even if she had been successful in her pursuit of such principles, she would still have been at odds with the divine machinations working against her. Virgil gives Dido words with echoes of Lucretian language, and her embodiment of ironies reflects the internal paradoxes of the philosophy. Pamela Gordon similarly investigates the presence of Lucretian influence within Book Four and especially where the points where it intersects with the Homeric tradition.³² Namely, Aeneas' delay in Carthage parallels Odysseus' in Phaeacia, and by Virgil's time there already existed a topos of associating the Epicureans with Phaeacians.³³

James O'Hara has written extensively on the caution one must exercise when interpreting the *Aeneid*. It is a national epic, and many have read it through a lens of Virgil's optimism at the coming age of Augustus. Those in the Harvard School, however, have read it with a pessimistic eye for its pessimistic readings. O'Hara argues that either interpretation is incomplete, writing that "Vergil expresses both the age's hope for the peace of a Golden Age under

³²Pamela Gordon, "Phaeacian Dido: Lost Pleasures of an Epicurean Intertext," *Classical Antiquity* 17, 2 (1998): p. 188-211.

³³Ibid., 189.

Augustus, and its fear that this hope might be deceptive and illusory."³⁴ J. Swanepoel follows that the task of reading Dido's character is part of what complicates this process, given the sympathy with which Virgil appears to regard her.³⁵ Her story is commonly read as tragic given its similarities to the works of Euripides, which begs the question of what Dido's tragic flaw is. The difficulty of this question emphasizes the tragic bent of the fourth book, and the question of Dido's guilt is certainly not a new one.³⁶ It is unclear to what extent Dido is simply manipulated by relentless, divine forces (partially absolving her of guilt) or acts as a moral agent who suffers from the consequences of her own actions. Swanepoel suggests that both explanations are needed if the fourth book is to be read as tragic. True, Juno and Venus play their role in manipulating Dido, but Virgil's use of specific language (*culpa*, *pudor*, and *crimen*) indicates that Dido played her part as well. As far as Anna participates, Swanepoel sees her as Dido's *alter ego* whose advice "on the one hand makes an appeal to Dido's mind and on the other hand appeals powerfully to her feelings and induces an

³⁴James O'Hara, *Death and the Optimistic Prophecy in Vergil's Aeneid*, (Princeton University Press, 1990): p. 6.

³⁵J. Swanepoel, "Infelix Dido: Vergil and the Notion of the Tragic," *AKROTERION XL* (1995): 30-46. Swanepoel is also careful to note that the poet's sympathy for Dido is not something which is agreed upon by all. For one such diverging view, see L. Feder, "Vergil's Tragic Theme," *Classical Journal* 49, 5 (1954): p. 197-209.

³⁶W. S. Anderson, *The Art of the Aeneid*, (New Jersey: Prentice Hall, 1969): p. 44.

awareness of the greatness which could result for her people from such a marriage."³⁷ Anna begins as Dido's close confidante, but she increasingly isolates herself, sending Anna as her proxy and then eventually even cutting her off.

Dido's likeness to other tragic women has been explored extensively. Grace Starry West has compared her to Virgil's Andromache, whose story he continues following Homer's and Euripides' treatments.³⁸ Both are called *infelix*, and both desire fidelity to their dead husbands while at the same time they are unable to achieve such perfect loyalty. Comparison of these women shows that Dido's resolution to die is the result of an immense self-pride that Andromache lacks. D. Herbert Abel identifies Dido as a tragic heroine for whom Anna is a literary foil, such as Ismene is to Antigone or Chrysothemis to Electra.³⁹ Howard Jacobson has compared Dido to Euripides' Helen. Both are queens who fled from Africa as refugees; they are loyal to their dead husbands; they reject the advances of local suitors; they accept shipwrecked strangers; and they both contemplate suicide.⁴⁰

³⁷Swanepoel (1995) 38.

³⁸Grace Starry West, "Andromache and Dido," *The American Journal of Philology* 104, 3 (1983): 257-267.

³⁹D. Herbert Abel, "Medea in Dido," *The Classical Bulletin* 34, 5 (1958): 51-56.

⁴⁰Howard Jacobson, "Vergil's Dido and Euripides' Helen," *The American Journal of Philology* 108, 1 (1987): 167-168.

The duration of Aeneas' stay in Carthage is marked by a sense of foreboding due to the threat Dido poses to Aeneas' mission. K. Paul Bednarowski highlights the looming threat of deception throughout the entirety of the fourth book by pointing out the comparison of Dido to Diana which echoes that of Nausicaa to Artemis in the *Odyssey*.⁴¹ Like her, Dido poses a threat to Aeneas' journey to his (future) home as Nausicaa does to Odysseus.⁴² Raymond J. Starr remarks that Anna's advice to Dido to *indulge hospitio causasque innecte morandi*, "Grant hospitality and weave reasons for delaying" (Aen. 4,51) is a particularly remarkable indication of the vast intertextual program between Virgil and Homer.⁴³ Starr notes that weaving is an essentially feminine task which Penelope, Circe, and Calypso all perform in the *Odyssey*, and Penelope famously used it as a tactic of delay as Dido will now attempt. Steven Farron argues that even as Dido poses a threat to Aeneas' mission, the apparent sympathy which Virgil encourages the reader to feel for her (and which he may

⁴¹K. Paul Bednarowski, "Dido and the Motif of Deception in Aeneid 2 and 3," *TAPA* 145 (2015): 135-172.

⁴²Hom. *Od.* 6.102-9.

⁴³Raymond J. Starr, "Dido and Penelope in Virgil, 'Aeneid' IV, 50-53," *Latomus*, 68, 4 (2009): p. 910-914.

indeed have felt himself⁴⁴) suggests a tacit critique of Aeneas' mission.⁴⁵ Anna too has been read as a significant obstacle to Aeneas' mission; James Burbidge finds in *Aen.* 4,440 (*fata obstant placidasque viri deus obstruit auris*, "The fates opposed, and a god blocked his gentle ears") a reference to the Homeric motif of blocking one's ears to the song of the deadly Sirens. In this comparison, Anna and Dido are equivalent to Sirens, once again highlighting the threat they pose to Rome's foundation.⁴⁶

Some scholars have pointed to oblique references to deception as they apply to Dido and Anna's relationship. Anthony A. Barrett has questioned whether Anna were as loyal to her sister as she would at first seem. He has pointed out that Dido's words at *Aen.* 4,435-36 conjure the specter of an alternate tradition that depicted Anna as Aeneas' lover instead of Dido,⁴⁷ and so we cannot deny the possibility that Virgil implies some foul play.

⁴⁴Although William Warde Fowler has observed that though Virgil's heart may have sympathized with Dido, his judgement unequivocally went with Aeneas and his attendance to *iustitia, pietas, and fides*; see W. Warde Fowler, *Death of Turnus*, (1919): 153.

⁴⁵Steven Farron, "The Aeneas-Dido Episode as an Attack on Aeneas' Mission and Rome," *Greece & Rome* 27, 1 (1980): p. 45.

⁴⁶James Burbidge, "Dido, Anna and the Sirens (Vergil Aeneid 4.437 ss.)," *Materiali e discussion per l'analisi dei testi classici* (2009): p. 105-128.

⁴⁷Antony A. Barrett, "Anna's Conduct in Aeneid 4," *Vergilius*, 16 (1970): p. 21-25.

Rebecca Armstrong has written that, “The *Aeneid* is a storehouse of literature, filled with references and allusions not only to other epics, but also to a vast range of different genres from tragedy, lyric, elegy, and epigram to history and ethnography.”⁴⁸ The discursiveness of the *Aeneid* thus lends it both a certain complexity and impressiveness. The conflicts so central to the *Aeneid* certainly owe something to the milieu within which Virgil was writing, as Rome was indeed on the precipice of important political changes. Indeed, Virgil himself was no stranger to internal conflict, for within the poet we find a man somewhere between a Roman and a Celt, between philosophy and poetry.

The next chapters will examine in more detail the variety and richness of connections to be made within the *Aeneid* with respect to Virgil’s Anna. Chapter 2 will explore the intertextual relationship Anna shares with her tragic counterparts, specifically the nurses and sisters of tragedy. I will discuss how the likeness of her motivations, her role, and her speech to that of the nurse support the conclusion that Book Four assumes an actively tragic register. Chapter 3 will explore the semantic relationship between the nurse figure and the famous incendiary language of the fourth book. Finally, Chapter 4 examines Anna in

⁴⁸Rebecca Armstrong, “The *Aeneid*: Inheritance and Empire,” *Epic Interactions: Perspectives on Homer, Virgil, and the Epic Tradition Presented to Jasper Griffin by Former Pupils*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006): p. 131.

relation to Virgil's creation of a new kind of stock figure in the *Aeneid*. Anna's character in many ways combines elements of the sister and the nurse of tragedy; she is literally a sister, but her behavior is foundationally maternal, a quality found in the two other sisters of the *Aeneid*: Acca and Juturna. This chapter will explore the etymological and religious connections that Virgil creatively assimilates to create this new kind of tragic character and explore what implications these characters offer to our reading of the *Aeneid* as a whole.

CHAPTER TWO

Anna and Dido: Redefining Tragic Sisterhood

As thorough as Virgilian scholarship has been and as far back as it reaches, Carthaginian Anna, the tritagonist of the fourth book of the *Aeneid*, has received less consideration than she deserves. She is discussed often only in brief remarks when intended to augment a larger discussion concerning Dido. While Dido assuredly has the bigger role, Anna is fully a part of the narrative of the *Aeneid* and its rich and broad intertextual field. This chapter will present a fuller account of Anna than has previously been afforded her—analyzing her speech and action and devoting significant attention to identifying the intertextual points of contact that connect Anna to the nurse figure of Greek tragedy. The nurses of Greek tragedy were important prototypes for Anna—the source material that explains much of her characterization. This serves to highlight that Virgil has chosen not to model the Carthaginian sisters of Book Four on famous sisters of tragedy, such as Antigone and Ismene or Electra and Chrysothemis, but characterize the relationship as a mother-daughter one. In doing so Virgil is able to achieve heightened tragic effect without relocating the center of conflict from that between Dido and Aeneas. In the process, however, Virgil elevates Anna to the status of a tragic figure herself.

Scholars have tended to liken Anna to the stock nurse figure of tragedy—a comparison that is eminently justified. The tragic nurse appears in works such as Aeschylus' *Libation-Bearers*; Euripides' *Hippolytus*, *Andromache*, and *Medea*; and Sophocles' *Women of Trachis*. The nurse is generally an elderly woman (although some appropriate comparisons might be made with the handmaid in *Andromache*) who has raised the hero/heroine and thus developed robust emotional ties to this character. This makes her a likely choice as a confidante and one who can be entrusted with messages containing sensitive information. For these tragic nurses, Homer's Eurykleia of the *Odyssey* is an important predecessor, and Anna shares a great many qualities with all of these figures, not least of which is an apparent tendency towards motherly doting.¹ That Anna is extremely fond of Dido there is without doubt, yet her affection surpasses the general concern typical of tragic sisters, and her manner, motivations, and level of interest and involvement in Dido's romantic affairs are more amenable to those of the nurse of tragedy. Like these women, who act as confidantes, advisors, messengers and go-betweens, so too does Anna play all of these roles at various stages in Book Four.

Anna is first introduced as a confidante to Dido, who approaches her in line 8: *cum sic unanimam adloquitur male sana sororem*, "...when she, barely sane,

¹Thelma B. DeGraff, "Antigone and Dido," *The Classical Weekly* 25, 19 (1932): 149.

thus speaks to her sister of one accord.” The first word used in connection with Anna is *unanimam*, and no more fitting an epithet could be applied. The word stresses Anna’s like-mindedness with Dido, and we shall see that the precise nature of this quality is somewhat like a unity both of feeling and of purpose. Their intimacy is so cultivated that they are acquainted with each other’s deepest confidences. This term of endearment, often applied to family members or other close relations,² is a fitting characteristic around which much of the consideration of Anna pivots.

First, the usage of *unanima* to describe Anna is very much like Homer’s usage of the Greek *ὁμόφρων*, meaning ‘agreeing’ or ‘united.’³ The word appears a few times in the Homeric corpus, and of these instances it is notably used to describe Persephone and her mother after they have been reunited in the Homeric *Hymn to Demeter*: ὡς τότε μὲν πρόπαν ἦμαρ ὁμόφρονα θυμὸν ἔχουσαι / πολλὰ μάλ’ ἀλλήλων κραδίην καὶ θυμὸν ἴαινον / ἀμφαγαπαζόμεναι: ἀχέων δ’ ἀπεπαύετο θυμός, “Then for the whole day,

²Samuel Glen Harrod, “Latin Terms of Endearment and of Family Relationship: A Lexicographical Study Based on Volume VI of the Corpus Inscriptionum Latinarum,” PhD diss., (Princeton University, 1909): 46-47.

³Liddell, Henry George, Robert Scott, Henry Stuart Jones, and Roderick McKenzie, *The online Liddell-Scott-Jones Greek-English lexicon*, (Irvine, CA: University of California, 2011), s.v. “ὁμόφρων”; Ingo Gildenhard, *Virgil, Aeneid, 4.1-299: Latin Text, Study Questions, Commentary and Interpretative Essays*, (Open Book Publishers, 2012): 56, has pointed out the similarity of this Greek word to the Latin *unanima*. He has also pointed out the fact that Dido is described as *semianimis germana* as she is dying, highlighting just how great the degree of separation between the two women, once *unanimae*, has become by the end of Book Four.

having like minds, they comforted the heart and soul for each other in many ways, embracing tenderly, and their hearts abandoned sorrow" (434-436). As Gregory Nagy commented on these lines, "It is a religious principle that Demeter and Persephone, on the occasion of their mother-daughter reunion, are 'like-minded.'"⁴ Demeter is especially fond of her daughter, a fondness expressed in the unison of their hearts. This is the same fondness Dido and Anna share and is similar enough to be described by Virgil in the same sense that Homer has described Demeter and Persephone's.⁵

As Arthur Stanley Pease notes, this kind of like-minded person is exactly who is needed to access the private thoughts of the otherwise psychologically distant queen we meet in book one.⁶ This queen, who is first portrayed in the public sphere, is stately and deeply engaged in the founding of her city: *iura dabat legesque viris, operumque laborem / partibus aequabat iustis aut sorte trahebat*, "Laws and ordinances she gave to her people; their tasks she adjusted in equal shares or assigned by lot." However, when Dido is struck by a *caecus ignis*, an "unseen fire," which begins to eat away at her, the first person to whom she

⁴Gregory Nagy, "Homeric Hymn to Demeter," *The Homeric Hymns: Interpretative Essays*, ed. Andrew Faulkner (Oxford University Press, 2011), <http://www.uh.edu/~cldue/texts/demeter.html>.

⁵Also cf. Od.6.180.

⁶Arthur Stanley Pease, *Publi Vergili Maronis Aeneidos: Liber Quartus*, (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1967): 93.

relays her private feelings is Anna in the first dialogue of Book Four. This is, as Pease has noted, a useful device whereby the audience may become acquainted with the feelings of the heretofore emotionally remote queen, yet it also sets up Anna as Dido's most intimate companion.

Via Dido's conversation with Anna, Virgil communicates Dido's anxiety regarding Aeneas and the newfound flame that has begun and will continue to vividly consume her. Anna listens patiently as Dido recounts the heroic qualities she has observed in Aeneas but confesses her conflicted thoughts owing to the vow she made to Sychaeus. Dido's agitated emotional state is conspicuous: *sic effata sinum lacrimis implevit obortis*, "Having thus spoken, she filled her bosom with flowing tears" (*Aen.* 4, 30). It is thus fitting that Anna respond to Dido's honesty with great sympathy and reassurance. Indeed, Anna's role and continued presence in Book Four is contingent on just such a sympathetic disposition. As she makes clear, she desires that her sister experience the great joys of life, among which are both conjugal and parental affection:⁷

*solane perpetua maerens carpere iuventa,
nec dulcis natos Veneris nec praemia noris?
id cinerem aut manis credis curare sepultos?*

"Will you waste your youth, always grieving and alone,
knowing neither children nor the sweet rewards of Venus?"

⁷Pease (1967) 115.

Do you think that ashes or buried shades care for that?"⁸ (*Aen.* 4, 32-34)

In these lines, Anna emphasizes both that it would be a great loss should Dido forego marriage and children as well as emphasizes the loneliness attendant upon a life without them. She further notes the vulnerability of Dido's nascent kingdom, surrounded by no shortage of hostiles, noting the practical advantages of allying Carthaginian and Trojan forces.

*hinc Gaetulae urbes, genus insuperabile bello,
et Numidae infreni cingunt et inhospita Syrtis;
hinc deserta siti regio lateque furentes
Barcaei. quid bella Tyro surgentia dicam
germanique minas?*

From this place the Gaetolian cities, a race unconquerable in war, both the unbridled Numidians and inhospitable Syrtis surround you; from that, a region deprived with drought and Barcaeans raging far and wide. Why should I speak of wars rising in Tyre and the threats of your brother? (*Aen.* 4, 40-44)

From both of these passages, Anna expresses two distinct qualities: a sincere interest in seeing her sister happy, and a tendency toward expediency. She does not want Dido to forego the opportunity to have children or to experience love. She thinks practically and materially. The dead are not souls but merely ashes, and she focuses on what the material benefits a union with Aeneas would entail—namely, safety from surrounding hostile peoples.

⁸All English translations are my own.

This kind of introduction to Anna's character already situates her squarely within the allusive program between the *Aeneid* and Greek tragedy. The nurses of tragedy are regularly introduced as advisors. Deianeira's nurse in Sophocles' *Trachiniae* is one such example. This play opens with a tearful and distressed Deianeira relaying her past troubles with marriage and current anxieties about her husband's whereabouts. These anxieties are met with a response from her nurse, who responds with sympathy for her plight: δέσποινα Δηάνειρα, πολλὰ μὲν σ' ἐγὼ / κατεῖδον ἤδη πανδάκρουτ' ὀδύρματα / τὴν Ἡράκλειον ἔξοδον γοωμένην, "My lady Deianeira, much have I beheld you wailing and most miserable, weeping for the departure of Herakles." (*Women of Trachis*, 49-51)

Helen Karydas has pointed out how this opening functions as a *captatio benevolentiae* meant to dispose Deianeira favorably towards the advice she will subsequently receive. By indicating that she is aware of and sympathetic to Deianeira's present emotional condition, the nurse prepares her for the suggestions she will offer:

πῶς παισὶ μὲν τοσοῖσδε πληθύεις, ἀτὰρ
 ἄνδρὸς κατὰ ζήτησιν οὐ πέμπεις τινά,
 μάλιστα δ' ὄνπερ εἰκὸς Ὑλλον, εἰ πατρὸς
 νέμοι τιν' ὥραν τοῦ καλῶς πράσσειν δοκεῖν;
 ...ὥστ' εἴ τί σοι πρὸς καιρὸν ἐννέπειν δοκῶ,
 πάρεστι χρῆσθαι τάνδρῳ τοῖς τ' ἐμοῖς λόγοις.

“How you abound in so many children, but
you send none of them to search for your husband,
but Hyllus especially could go, if he
has any concern that his father is well;
...Therefore if I seem to suggest anything profitable,
it is time to use persuade your son.” (54-57, 59-60)

Deianeira’s nurse proposes that she send one of her children to try to find Heracles, advocating for action rather than passivity. The advice she gives is action-oriented, a feature commonly characterizing advice from tragic nurses. Anna’s first words to Dido follow a similar formula expressing sympathy tantamount to a *captatio benevolentiae*⁹ immediately followed by action-oriented advice. Anna, like Deianeira’s nurse, recognizes grief and responds to it with sympathy meant to garner goodwill (*Aen.* 4, 32): *solane perpetua maerens carpere iuventa[?]* “Will you be wasted of your youth, forever alone and grieving?” She gives advice with the implication that inaction will only sentence the one grieving to more grief and ends her speech to Dido by advocating for action rather than passivity, essentially giving her a plan to follow: *tu modo posce deos veniam, sacrisque litatis / indulge hospitio causasque innecte morandi...* “Only ask pardon of the gods, with acceptable sacrifices having been made, be generous in your hospitality, and weave reasons for delay” (*Aen.* 4, 50-51). Deianeira’s nurse sets a precedent for Anna. She is first a sympathetic listener, and then she is a

⁹Helen Karydas, *Eurykleia and Her Successors*, (Rowman & Littlefield, 1998): 79.

materialistic problem-solver—i.e., she finds solution in the material. Anna follows suit by lending her own sympathizing heart to her sister and then offering advice to be proactive. She is emotionally intuitive and does not waste time or opportunity being overwhelmed by whatever moral difficulties Dido cannot overcome. Anna detects the agony in her sister's heart, identifies the cure for it, and advises accordingly.

It is worth noting at this juncture that this kind of sympathetic response is atypical of the tragic sister. For this reason, although Anna is herself Dido's sister, the influence of characters such as Ismene and Chrysothemis is more tenuous and only serves to strengthen her connection to the tragic nurse. If anything, Ismene and Chrysothemis rebuke to their troubled sisters and on the whole tend to be less enterprising. On the one hand, Anna does appear to have in common with them a certain practical outlook on life. These sisters are literary foils to the heroines, and many have accordingly taken Anna's brand of level-headed pragmatism as a contrast to Dido's penchant for the melodramatic.¹⁰ When Anna offers her advice to Dido, she focuses on the physical benefits of a union with Aeneas, whether these are children (*dulcis natos Veneris*) or the military strength of an alliance (*Aen.* 4, 47-49): *quam tu urbem, soror,*

¹⁰Pease (1967) 93; and Ellenor Swallow, "Anna Soror," *The Classical Weekly* 44, 10 (1951): 147.

*hanc cernes, quae surgere regna / coniugio tali! Teucrum comitantibus armis, / Punica se
quantis attolet Gloria rebus!* “How great a city and kingdom you will see rise,
sister, by a marriage of such kind! And with allied Teucrian arms, by which
Punic glory will exalt itself!” However, the comparison breaks down when one
considers that Chrysothemis and Ismene tend to determine that what is
practically good is the minimization of risk. They are the exact opposite of
opportunistic advocates of action, urging restraint where Anna and the nurses
recommend action. At most we can say that both Anna and the tragic sister
serve to contrast their sisters at some level, but ultimately Anna is more suited to
the company of the tragic nurse.

Further, Chrysothemis and Ismene’s views are marked by a necessary
tension with their sisters’ more principled outlooks. Even if we take Dido as the
more principled of the two, she and Anna share a far greater degree of rapport,
evidenced by the fact that Dido both confides only in Anna and *accepts* her
advice. The difference lies primarily in motivation, for Ismene and
Chrysothemis act to save themselves, whereas Anna seeks to help her sister.
Anna is thus endowed with a very different emotional constitution that will bear
itself out in its own tragic way. She has sympathy for her sister, who is *luce magis
dilecta* to her. Though Anna does tend toward pragmatism whereas Dido tends

toward emotional intuition, Anna still has much in common with her sister in that she also operates out of feeling at one with Dido's.

Indeed, the salient point in which Anna's characterization differs from the sisters' and aligns with the nurse's is presence of Anna's sheer emotional investment in Dido's happiness and fortunes. While Anna is pragmatic, action-oriented, and her advice tends toward expediency, it must be duly noted that Anna does not need to suppress much in the way of emotion to arrive at her conclusions. Instead, the general impression seems to be that Anna is operating out of a deep affection for her sister, and that this has in some way blinded her from reading her sister correctly—or, at least, led her to underestimate the degree of respect Dido truly has for the vow she made to her dead husband.

These points must be emphasized because Anna is often too swiftly relegated to the category of "foil," and the discussion of her stops there. However, she is not a true foil to Dido and to take her as such is to misunderstand her essential role. If anything, she is able to discern the latent desires in her sister, and her advice openly affirms them. Her presence at Dido's death stresses the tragic tenor of Book Four, and she suffers her own tragedy because of ways in which she is rather like Dido. She fails to recognize more reasonable—if not wiser—courses of action *because* of her emotional biases, and for this reason Anna could only have made Dido's same mistake. Ismene and

Chrysothemis are truer foils than Anna could ever be. Ismene's timidity casts Antigone's boldness into stark relief. Chrysothemis' tepid resignation and complacency starkly contrasts with Electra's unremitting grief. The resulting strain in their relationships with their respective sisters is fundamentally different from the harmonious relationship Virgil depicts between Anna and Dido.

Because of the strong emotional bond between the two, Dido places a considerable amount of trust in her sister. Anna indeed appears to maintain a certain amount of authority at the beginning of Book Four, as Dido freely accepts Anna's advice to her. Anna's privilege as a confidante and counsellor along with a motherly tendency follows the strong precedent set by the nurse figure as counsellor to her mistress in the tradition of tragedy. The nurse of Orestes in *Libation Bearers*, Kilissa, is characterized by her affection and devotion in the lines which she describes caring for Orestes as an infant and the great sense of loss she feels at learning of his death. Hermione's nurse in *Andromache* is another figure whose affectionate motherly qualities can be seen as reflected in Anna's character. She consoles a clearly distraught Hermione and exercises a parent-like authority over her: ἀλλ' εἴσιθ' εἴσω μηδὲ φαντάζου δόμων / πάροιθε τῶνδε, μή τιν' αἰσχύνῃν λάβῃς, "But go within and do not appear before the house in front of them, lest you bring dishonor" (876-77). So too does Anna instruct Dido

at the end of her speech about how to treat her guest and ensure that he stays in Carthage. This nearly parental authority is not afforded either sister of tragedy.

Anna shares important characteristics with the nurse of *Medea* as well.

Helen Karydas writes, “The importance of the Nurse in *Medea* lies...in her ability to understand deeply Medea’s nature and predict her reactions.”¹¹ She pities

Medea and her misfortunes, saying: χρηστοῖσι δούλοις ξυμφορὰ τὰ δεσποτῶν /

κακῶς πίτνοντα, καὶ φρενῶν ἀνθάπτεται, “The ills having befallen the master

accompany the servant who is honest, and it grapples with her soul” (54-55). As

Pietro Pucci further remarks, in her opening *rhesis* the nurse “borrows” some of

Medea’s own language to imply “that she feels as her own Medea’s misfortunes

and grieves.”¹² Because of this sympathy of feeling and ability to understand

her, the nurse rightly becomes afraid for Medea’s innocent children when she

perceives her mistress’ anger. Her ability to commiserate with Medea is what

gives her the insight that allows her to anticipate her erratic behavior.

Both Anna’s desire to help her sister and her tendency toward expediency

are also embodied in Phaedra’s nurse in *Hippolytus*, who in many ways

represents the fullest realization of the nurse figure’s dramatic possibility in

tragedy. She ignites the action of the play and orchestrates its dramatic turning

¹¹Karydas (1998) 112.

¹²Pietro Pucci, *The Violence of Pity in Euripides’ Medea*, (Ithaca and London, 1980): p. 38-40.

point; she has the most lines in the play after Hippolytus; she is verbally adroit, both philosophizing and advising; and, most importantly, she is an intimate participant in the tragedy of her mistress. The similarities between Dido and Phaedra have been well-observed,¹³ and we may easily substitute Anna for the role of the nurse in the *Aeneid*. Phaedra's nurse is also a confidante and the first to understand Phaedra's inner conflict over her secret passion for Hippolytus. Though initially horrified, the nurse proceeds to act as a go-between for Phaedra and Hippolytus. Ultimately, she is both unsuccessful and in fact triggers the successive dramatic turn of events, starting with Hippolytus' revulsion at her suggestions, and ultimately leading to both his death and Phaedra's. The nurse of *Hippolytus* has also been accused of moral leniency,¹⁴ but this is a more ungenerous view than is necessary. Phaedra's nurse only acts as she does when she learns that Phaedra intends to kill herself to escape her feelings, thus she draws back from her previous alarm and seeks an alternative that could save Phaedra's life. Although sincere in her attempts to help Phaedra, she manages to secure her destruction, thus encouraging the audience to experience both of Aristotle's requisite emotions for tragedy—pity (because of how devastatingly

¹³Norman W. DeWitt, "The Dido Episode as a Tragedy," *The Classical Journal* 2, 7 (1907): p. 287.

¹⁴W. S. Barrett, *Euripides, Hippolytus*, ed. and comm., (Oxford, 1964).

the nurse fails to help her mistress) and fear (because what began as her purely good intention was ultimately warped so grotesquely into fulfilling its opposite end). Anna shares this important—even admirable—quality with her, as well as the logistical roles of confidante and go-between. As Phaedra’s nurse acts out of concern for the safety of her mistress, so does Anna act out of love and compassion for her sister. These connections inform our understanding of Anna’s character and situation, because they help provide the dramatic backdrop against which Virgil stages the fourth book of the *Aeneid*—what Vassiliki Panoussi calls the tragic “allusive subtext,” which adds to the overall tragic tenor of the fourth book’s narrative.¹⁵

The extent, then, to which the closeness of Anna and Dido’s relationship deteriorates is all the more tragic. Anna initially takes the stage, like Dido, with a coolness and marked ability to make sound judgement. She has the trust of her sister and the confidence to give her what she believes to be the right advice. However, the story goes through a *peripeteia* when Mercury visits Aeneas to tell him to leave Carthage, and his *telos* has shifted from one goal to another.¹⁶ When Dido learns of this, it has the effect of dramatically redefining the relationship

¹⁵Vassiliki Panoussi, “Vergil’s Ajax: Allusion, Tragedy, and Heroic Identity in the *Aeneid*,” *Classical Antiquity* 21, 1 (2002): 95-134.

¹⁶Christine Perkell, *Reading Vergil’s Aeneid: An Interpretive Guide*, (University of Oklahoma Press, 1999): p. 86.

between Anna and Dido. Whereas Anna previously instructed Dido with her advice from a position of authority and trust, Anna is now relegated to a much lesser role as messenger.

For this role there is an established trend of nurses in tragedy acting as messengers as well. Orestes' nurse is sent to summon Aegisthus at the beginning of *Libation-Bearers*; Deianeira's nurse bears the news of her death to the chorus in *Women of Trachis*; and Medea sends her nurse to summon Jason. So too does Dido send Anna to Aeneas in order to appeal for time because she has supposedly developed the confidence of Aeneas as well. Anna proceeds as she is bidden, and Virgil paints a touching picture of her attempts: *Talibus orabat, talisque miserrima fletus fertque refertque soror*, "She says such things, and her poor sister bore and bore back such tearful appeals" (*Aen.* 4,437-38). These lines are semantically connected to line 31, in which Anna is responding to Dido's emotions and her flowing tears (*lacrimis obortis*) and offering advice to her (*Anna refert*). In both instances she internalizes her sister's feelings to which she becomes inextricably linked. As a messenger, however, not only does Anna respond to her sister's emotions, but in doing so "bears" them as well, both figuratively her sympathizing feelings, and literally in the messages she bears to Aeneas.

By pitifully carrying her sister's tears back and forth, ultimately to no avail, Anna fulfills her a pivotal role in sharing Dido's sense of denigrated pride. Virgil indicates that Anna is *miserrima*, very miserable, bearing Dido's *fletus* back and forth. This comment is, as Pease observes, a likely injection of the poet's own subjective sentiment. It is the poet's recognition of both the poignancy of Anna's attempts to help her sister despite the unlikelihood of success and of her own emotional distress. Thus, Anna herself becomes a tragic figure, as she has evoked the pity and fear of the audience and of the poet himself.

After Anna's unsuccessful supplications, the next we hear of her is that she is noticeably absent from Dido's inner thoughts now: *hoc visum nulli, non ipsi effata sorori*, "She spoke of this vision to no one, not even her sister" (*Aen.* 4,456). This abnormal estrangement marks the turning point in Anna and Dido's relationship. Anna has now failed on two separate occasions to help her sister—neither was her advice successful nor her attempts to persuade Aeneas. Dido, now resolved to die, is completely and utterly alone in her grief. At the same time, her psychological deterioration proceeds at a worryingly rapid pace. Yet again she will approach Anna, only this time without any intention of relating the true nature of her feelings or plans. Again, the tragic effect is felt in Virgil's new characterization of her emotional state and the false demeanor that Dido assumes, a demeanor that alienates her from Anna's companionship: *et maestam*

dictis adgressa sororem / consilium vultu tegit ac spem fronte serenat, “And having approached her sorrowing sister with words, she concealed the plan with a front and beamed hope in her looks” (*Aen.* 4,476-77). Dido approaches her no longer *unanimam sororem*, but now her *maestam sororem*. It is both fitting and poignant that her initial epithet has been replaced by one approximately meaning “crestfallen,” because even now Anna still shares in her sister’s defeat and wounded pride, even if she is separated from her.

Neither does Dido allow Anna the chance to try to change her mind. She approaches her sorrowing sister feigning a hopeful mood because she recognizes that Anna’s fealty could prevent her from proceeding with her intended suicide. Thus, her manner and speech veil her intentions. She tells Anna to assist her in preparing for magical rites, though Anna, oblivious, is in actuality preparing for Dido’s death. Perhaps Anna still believes that she would be the first to know of Dido’s intentions, but she is unaware that a rift now lies between herself and her sister: *non tamen Anna novis praetexere funera sacris / germanam credit, nec tantos mente furores / concipit aut graviora timet quam morte Sychaei. / ergo iussa parat*, “Nevertheless, Anna does not believe that her sister hides her funeral with these extraordinary rites, nor does she imagine that she could have such madness in mind and fears nothing more serious than Sychaeus’ death. Therefore, she does as she is told” (*Aen.* 4,500-503). Perhaps Anna is simply too trusting and believes

her sister's earlier claim: *hunc ego si potui tantum sperare dolorem, / et perferre, soror, potero*, "If I have been able to foresee to this great sorrow, I will be able to endure it, sister" (*Aen.* 4,419-20). It may be more likely, however, that Virgil is depicting the distinct motherly tendency which creates this blindness to Dido's machinations. Anna is like the mother who can see no wrong in her child, and Dido realizes that she can deceive her sister by assuming a false front. Dido perhaps even takes advantage of Anna's continuing love and likely guilt at her failure to help by having her prepare the pyre she plans to commit suicide upon: *tu secreta pyram tecto interiore sub auras / erige et arma viri, thalamo quae fixa reliquit / impius, exuviasque omnis lectumque iugalem, / quo perii, superimponas*, "Erect a pyre in the inner court under the skies in secret, and place the arms of the man, which he left fixed in the marriage bedroom, the impious one, and place upon it all his possessions and the bridal bed, by which I perish" (*Aen.* 4, 494-97). Regardless of Dido's reasons for having Anna build the pyre, the effect is poignant. Anna, operating under the assumption that she is attempting to help her sister once more, ironically attends to the construction of Dido's funeral pyre. This defines her role as a *maesta soror*, that she is rendered completely and tragically incapable of helping her sister—an incapacity that she will not recognize until the very end—but instead aids most intimately in the very undoing of her dear sister.

Despite whatever good intentions Anna had for aiding her sister, Dido assigns part of the blame for her own tragic circumstances to Anna: *tu lacrimis evicta meis, tu prima furem / his, germana, malis oneras atque obicis hosti*, “You, sister, conquered by my tears, first loaded these misfortunes and threw me, mad, to that enemy” (*Aen.* 4, 548-49). Even in her near-delirium Dido is perceptive, recognizing that her sister’s flaw is to be too sympathetic to her distress, evidenced by her usage of *evicta*. It is regrettable, and most likely also intended for tragic effect, that Anna is blamed for what should rightly be the gods’ fault. Though she certainly played her part in helping to inflame Dido, it was the combined influence of Venus and Cupid that initiated her love.

Nevertheless, though Dido ultimately punishes herself, she makes sure to include Anna in the punishment for the role she played. Dido in her final curse to Aeneas, recalls parts of the Homeric *Hymn to Demeter* again. Like the finality of Persephone’s wedding to Hades, she too will descend to the shades below. As she does so, she will invoke some of the same names of those who were witness to the rape of Persephone: *Sol, qui terrarium flammis opera omnia lustras, / tuque harum interpres curarum et conscia Iuno, nocturnisque Hecate triviis ululata per urbes*, “O Sun, whose rays survey all that is done on earth; and Juno, agent and witness of my unhappy love; Hecate, whose name is wailed by night in city streets” (*Aen.* 4,607-609). The sun and Hecate were the only two deities to hear Persephone’s

screams as she was dragged to the underworld. The only other god to be aware of the rape was Zeus, who sanctioned his brother's "marriage." Similarly, Dido invokes Juno, the goddess who orchestrated her "marriage" to Aeneas on the hunting expedition. Like Demeter, who hears her child's screams and rushes to look for her, so does Anna hear the wailing of women and rush to her sister's side: *Audiit exanimis, trepidoque exterrita cursu / unguibus ora soror foedans et pectora pugnis / per medios ruit ac morientem nomine clamat*, "Swooning, her sister heard, and in dismay rushed through the throng, tearing her face with her nails, and beating her breast with her fists, as she called on the dying woman by name" (*Aen.* 4,672-74). The picture of grief is like that of the mother Demeter at the loss of her child.

Anna also feels a keen sense of betrayal at Dido's actions: *me fraude petebas?* "Did you seek me for your fraud?" (*Aen.* 4,675) She complains of the cruelty and unfairness of the deception toward her and is deeply troubled at her own role in her sister's death: *his etiam struxi manibus patriosque vocavi / voce deos, sic te ut posita, crudelis abessem?* "Did these hands indeed build the pyre, and did my voice call on our father's gods, in order that, when you were lying thus, I, cruel one, should be far away?" (*Aen.* 4,680-81). Anna's reaction to losing Dido strongly evokes the feelings of pity and fear that are necessary for the final scene, thus making her character indeed a tragic one. Anna's flaw is her ignorance,

which is partly aided by her blinding affection for her sister. The motherly protectiveness she has for Dido only comes too late, and too late does she realize what she had really done for Dido.

Anna is portrayed as both caring and trusting, and these two attributes put her at serious risk of both aiding in Dido's undoing and of suffering her own tragedy as a result. At the beginning, she gives her advice that she thinks will satisfy her desires because she loves Dido and wants to see her happy, and she is so moved by Dido's tears that she feels reassured that it *will* make her happy. Yet her own love for Dido blinds her to the fact that she has a very real commitment to principle. While well-meaning, she leads Dido into acting contrary to a very valuable part of her personality—the part that is high-minded and virtuous. Her otherwise admirable care for her sister emphasizes the tragic failure of love and devotion as moral guides. Anna's love is not adequate protection from the forces of fate, which she ultimately cannot be fully aware of nor adequately prepare for.

CHAPTER THREE

Anna as Kindler: Incendiary Language and Motifs in Book Four

The language and associated imagery of fire are well-attested within Book Four, and Anna's character engages prominently with these images. The fire motif of fire is closely related to Dido's passion, but it is also closely linked to nurses in the *Aeneid*. This chapter will explore the semantic interaction between the nurse and the incendiary language pervasive throughout Book Four as an explanation for Anna's corresponding role as a "kindler" of her sister's love. Further, in several instances involving Anna in Book Four, Virgil contrasts the fire motif with that of water. I suggest that Virgil is evoking Anna's nymphic qualities, which are explored further in Chapter Four. Meanwhile, this chapter will examine the precise ways in which Virgil associates Anna with fire and suggest that the reason for doing so is her allusive role as a nurse figure.

Anna is introduced into the context of illicit love in Book Four, and this should come as no surprise given the literary precedent of the nurse figures in tragedies such as the *Hippolytus*, as discussed in the previous chapter. In Book Four, Dido's illicit love is repeatedly likened to fire: *At regina gravi iamdudum saucia cura / vulnus alit venis et caeco carpitur igni*, "But the queen, long since wounded by grave pain, nourishes the wound with her veins and feeds the unseen fire" (*Aen.* 4,2); *...est mollis flamma medullas / interea et tacitum vivit sub*

pectore vulnus, “The flame consumes her soft marrow, and meanwhile the silent wound lives deep in her heart” (*Aen.* 4,66-67); *uritur infelix Dido*, “Unhappy Dido burns” (*Aen.* 4,68). Book Four thus begins with the powerful motif of fire and its destructive quality. The *gravis cura*, *vulnus*, and *caecus ignis* are treated roughly as equivalents here,¹ and their damaging effects are made clear by the use of *saucia* and *male sana*. Dido calls her feeling for Aeneas *veteris vestigia flammae*, “the trace of former flame” (*Aen.* 4,23), indicating that she also conceives of her passion in terms of fire.

The motif of wounding and the disease-like quality of love is reminiscent of the *Hippolytus* again, where Phaedra is described: ἐνταῦθα δὴ στένουσα κακπεπληγμένη / κέντροις ἔρωτος ἢ τάλαιν’ ἀπόλλυται / σιγῇ, ξύνοιδε δ’ οὔτις οἰκετῶν νόσον, “Panicked and moaning away, the wretched woman wastes away in silence from the sharp point of love, and none of the slaves know the disease” (*Eur. Hipp.* 38-40). Many of the same elements appear in Book Four as well. Phaedra is depicted as wounded, and the wound or disease which afflicts her is imperceptible to others given both her silence and the mysterious nature of her illness. The image resembles the hidden fire in Dido’s heart and the slowly debilitating nature of her love-wound.

¹Otis (1964) 149.

Dido's love is clearly depicted as a flame, and Anna is introduced for the explicit purpose of adding fuel to this fire: *his dictis incensum animum inflammavit amore / spemque dedit dubiae menti solvitque pudorem*, "With these words, she inflamed her spirit with love, giving hope to her doubtful mind and unbinding her modesty" (*Aen.* 4,54-55). Anna is introduced for a specific purpose: *inflammavit*. She does so with her words, and this is again very like the nurse figures of tragedy who each demonstrate a certain amount of rhetorical dexterity.² It is also significant that Anna does not inflame Dido on her own, but she inflames an already *incensum* mind with the help of *amor*. She is acting in tandem with divine forces, which I will suggest in the next chapter is because Anna is connected to divinity in a fundamental way. Anna's words, in addition to inflaming, also have a soothing effect, quelling Dido's doubts and temporarily dissolving a sense of modesty. Anna herself is thus not depicted as a destructive force, as Love itself is, but is rather its humble helper.

Once Dido has decided to die, she sends her nurse Barce to summon Anna so that she can prepare a funeral pyre for her (although, of course, without knowledge of Dido's intentions): *Annam, cara mihi nutrix, huc siste sororem; / dic corpus properet fluviali spargere lympha*, "My dear nurse, bring Anna here; tell her to hasten to sprinkle her body with water from the river" (*Aen.* 4,494). It is

²Karydas (1946) 131-175.

significant that Dido asks that Anna sprinkle herself with river water. David Wright has pointed out that the word *lympa* appears only twice in the *Aeneid*, both times with reference to Anna.³ The other instance is in the final scene of Book Four, in which Anna requests river water be brought to wash Dido's wounds: *date vulnera lymphis abluam*, "Let me wash your wounds with river water" (*Aen.* 4,683-84). Varro reports a connection between *nympha* and *lympa*, the particular use of which in this passage may be a reference to Anna's religious origins as a nymph, discussed more fully in the next chapter.⁴ Wright further points to the need for *lympa* from the Numicus in sacrificial ritual to Vesta, a fact which is also significant since the Roman goddess Anna Perenna was associated with the river Numicus by Ovid (*Fast.* 3, 653). Her role thus becomes reflective of Virgil's Juturna, another helpful sister with river-nymph associations. The idea then that Anna, both helpful and associated with water, also performs the task of inflaming produces some delightful ironies. She intends to help her sister, but she will help destroy her. As a river nymph, the healing properties of water may be expected to extinguish Dido's love, especially if Anna were to play to typical

³David Wright, "Annie Get Your Jug: Anna Perenna and Water in the Aeneid," <https://classicalstudies.org/annual-meeting/147/abstract/annie-get-your-jug-anna-perenna-and-water-aeneid>

⁴The usage of this word may also have been a partial source of inspiration for Ovid's etiological myth regarding her in the *Fasti*.

role of a sister who attempts to dissuade her obstinate sister. What in fact happens, however, is that Anna inflames her sister's heart further.

Once Anna arrives after Dido summons her, she is told the precise purpose for her summoning: *tu secreta pyram tecto interiore sub auras erige...*, "Erect a pyre in the inner court under the skies in secret" (*Aen.* 4, 494-495).

Brooks Otis has insightfully pointed out that the flame Anna has encouraged, at first private, will eventually develop into a public conflagration by the end of Book Four.⁵ It is significant that Dido has *Anna* build the pyre. She could presumably have asked anyone to do so, even Barce herself. Anna, however, was the initial kindler of Dido's love-flame, which is the thing that encourages her destruction. Just as Anna had kindled Dido's *caecus ignis*, she will now, *secreta*, build her pyre and thus the thing that will ultimately destroy her. By intentionally assigning the motif of fire to Anna, Virgil cleverly foreshadows Dido's self-immolation. The implications of Anna kindling an *actual* flame that will literally destroy Dido are tragic and poignant, and her presence and actions bookend the narrative, as she acts as kindler both at the outset of the narrative and at its bitter conclusion.

The other nurses in Book Four also share the close connection to fire that Anna does. The other nurses found in the *Aeneid* are Barce, Pyrgo, and Caieta,

⁵Otis (1964) 72.

and Michael Paschalis has observed that all these women's names are etymologically associated with fire. He writes: "'Pyrgo' evokes πῦρ and 'Caieta' evokes καίω. This linkage implies semantic interaction between 'nutrix' ('nurse') and 'nutrio' ('feed the fire with fuel'; cf. I.176 'nutrimenta')."⁶ Paschalis explains that the name of Barce, who appears in Book Four to bear Dido's message to Anna,⁷ is linked to Hannibal and the Semitic word meaning 'sword-flash' or 'lightning.' Barce appears precisely after Dido has invoked a future avenger, an allusion to Hannibal's future conflict with Rome.⁸ Both the juxtaposition of *breviter* and *Barcen* in *Aen.* 4, 632 and her swiftness⁹ are likewise suggestive of lightning, and a 'sword-flash' would foreshadow Dido's suicide by Aeneas' sword and its precipitous occurrence. Her connection to fire is emphasized elsewhere. Barce is Sychaeus' former nurse, and she has become Dido's because her own died, left as ashes in Carthage. She is a kind of mirror to Anna, who is a nurse figure to Dido and will, like Barce, see her "child" die before she does. Her

⁶Michael Paschalis, *Semantic Names and Proper Relations*, (Clarendon Press, 1997): p. 171.

⁷This is another instance in which a nurse acts as a message-bearer, as Anna is Dido's messenger to Aeneas. See the previous chapter for a lengthier discussion on the trope of the message-bearing nurse.

⁸*Aen.* 4, 625-26: *excoriare, aliquis nostris ex ossibus ultor, qui face Dardanios ferroque sequare colonos*, "Arise from my bones, some avenger, who will pursue the Dardan colonists with the sword."

⁹Indicated at *Aen.* 4, 641: *sic ait. illa gradum studio celerabat anili*, "Thus she spoke, and the nurse hastened her step with the eagerness of an old woman."

essential role is to fetch Anna so that she can build the funeral pyre, further connecting her fire. Every other nurse in the *Aeneid* is thus connected to fire by punning her name. Although Anna is not expressly called a nurse, she plays the part of one and is similarly associated with it.

The conception of a nurse as kindler is unique in the *Aeneid*. Anna encourages Dido's existing feelings of love, which is not something the nurse of the *Hippolytus*, for instance, succeeds in doing. While the nurse in *Hippolytus* offers enabling advice to Phaedra, she is intractable and does not heed the advice. Dido, on the other hand, is proves particularly flammable tinder. She does not scorn Anna because Anna has a sense for what Dido is feeling and the proper words to draw these feelings out. She is depicted as understanding and helpful, but ultimately unsuccessful.

In the final scene of Book Four, Anna is depicted on the funeral pyre beside her dying sister, attempting in vain to resuscitate her:

*hoc illud, germana, fuit? me fraude petebas?
hoc rogi iste mihi, hoc ignes araeque parabant?
quid primum deserta querar? comitemne sororem
sprevisti moriens? eadem me ad fata vocasses,
idem ambas ferro dolor atque eadem hora tulisset.*

“Was this your aim, my sister? Did you aim to deceive me?
This pyre, these fires and altars, were they prepared for me?
What first should I, forsaken, protest? Have you, in dying, spurned
your sister's companionship? You should have summoned me to the same
fate; the same pain of the sword and the same hour of death should have
carried us both off.” (*Aen.* 4, 675-79)

The lines depict Anna's *anagnorisis*, as she has been tragically unaware of Dido's intentions until this moment. Vassiliki Panoussi has made invaluable comparisons of Dido to Sophocles' Ajax,¹⁰ and in this respect Anna resembles the forsaken Teucer in this final tragic moment. Her desire to have the same fate as Dido may also remind the reader that, in an alternate tradition, she was the one who in fact had this fate. Virgil again in these lines continues to situate Anna within the context of fire and wounding motifs, which her presence is nearly inseparable from (*rogus iste; ignes araeque; ferro dolor*). Anna's final words to Dido again stress her desire for a shared fate:

*his etiam struxi manibus patriosque vocavi
voce deos, sic te ut posita, crudelis, abessem?
extincti te meque, soror, populumque patresque
Sidonios urbemque tuam. date, vulnera lymphis
abluam et, extremus si quis super halitus errat,
ore legam.*

"Did I build the pyre with my own hands and called the paternal gods with my voice; was I absent as you lie thus, cruel one? You, my sister, have destroyed yourself and me, your people and our Sidonian fathers, and your city. Let me wash your wounds with river water, and if any last breath remains, I will catch it with my lips." (*Aen.* 4, 680-85)

Her tragedy is that she, once in Dido's full confidence, became so removed from her sister that she was absent in the time she could have been most helpful to her

¹⁰Vassiliki Panoussi, "Vergil's Ajax: Allusion, Tragedy, and Heroic Identity in the *Aeneid*," *Classical Antiquity* 21, 1 (2002): 95-134.

sister. Her grim realization is that she was helpful in the exact opposite way, by aiding her sister's suicide. She complains that everyone Dido has left behind has in a way shared in her fate, for indeed Dido's death anticipates Carthage's eventual destruction by Rome, and Anna's last efforts to save her sister invigorate the pathos of the scene.

Characterizing Anna as a nurse figure unlocks much of our understanding of her character. It explains why she behaves like a maternal figure and why she is so closely connected to the incendiary motif of the fourth book. Virgil connects all the nurses to this motif via his signature word-play, and he obliquely includes Anna in this process since she behaves as what is essentially the nurse figure of tragedy. This serves to heighten the tragic pitch of Book Four and continue Virgil's rich and complex interaction with the great poetic works preceding his own.

CHAPTER FOUR

Anna as Nurse: Further Connections

Until now, Anna's identity as a nurse has only been supported intertextually. Such an identity, however, is reinforced if we allow for connections beyond the text to be made. This chapter begins with a discussion of the meaning of Anna's name, which fundamentally underlies the conception of her character as a nurse and which then extends the present study into the religious aspects of Anna as an Italic mother goddess. This further joins her to other characters of the *Aeneid*, specifically the other sisters—Acca and Juturna, who all represent Virgil's creation of the "tragic sibling pair" in the epic. These women then contribute to the larger telos of the epic in a special way.

The history of Anna's name may be traced back to its Indo-European beginnings as a babble-word meaning of 'mother' or 'nurse.'¹ The Indo-European morpheme from which the name is derived is **an-* or **h₂en-*, from which came both Anatolian *anna-* and *hanna-*, meaning 'mother' and 'grandmother' respectively. Greek rendered these as ἀμμά and ἀννίς,² and Anna's

¹S.v. "am(m)a" in Julius Pokorny, *Indogermanisches etymologisches Wörterbuch* (Tübingen und Basel, 2005): 36.

²Pokorny (2005) 22, s.v. *akkā* for another Indo-European permutation of 'mother.' Pokorny mentions the Greek Ἀκκώ, the nurse of Demeter, and Acca Larentia, whose name is probably of Etruscan origin.

name appears as *Ammái*, or **Ammae* in Oscan.³ These are cognate with the Latin *anus*, ‘old woman.’⁴ The word used for ‘mother’ is central to any language, demonstrated by the pervasiveness of its cognates across Indo-European languages. Naming Anna such, Virgil was clever in devising a role for her for which she was quite literally named. Of course, it could be that Virgil depicts Anna’s behavior like the nurse’s while the meaning of her name happens to coincide with the role; but this would, however, appear a very fortuitous coincidence. Perhaps, then, Virgil selected for his fourth book a character already located within the tradition whose name rung of the first words a child would utter and logically applied the tragic nurse’s character to hers.

The maternal essence of her name is expressed in various religious traditions in which Anna appears as a mother goddess. Cult worship of Anna across Indo-European people groups identified her with fertility in regard to both children and land, and she is thus often portrayed as a nourishing mother or nurse. For example, ‘*Amma Cerealis*’ appears on the bronze Agnone Tablet, the oldest example of the Oscan language.⁵ The tablet was used in the worship

³Pokorny (2005) 36.

⁴Jaan Puhvel, *Hittite Etymological Dictionary, Volume 3: Words beginning with H*, (New York: Mouton de Gruyter, 1991). Also c.f. *anili* in *Aen.* 4, 641.

⁵E. T. Salmon, *Samnium and the Samnites*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1967): 159.

of Kerres, a fertility goddess in the Samnite religion roughly equivalent to the Roman Ceres and the Greek Demeter.⁶ Amma is a nurse of Ceres—the goddess that nourishes all life. Also associated with Kerres on the Agnone Tablet are the *Lymphae Cereales*, which Salmon suggests were importations of the Greek *Nymphae*, or river divinities.⁷ By this same token, Anna (as *Amma Cerealis*) is a nurse figure associated with river nymphs. Virgil activates both of these notions in his depiction of Carthaginian Anna, whose nurse- and nymph-like qualities have been discussed in the previous chapters.

Other evidence of Anna as a mothering goddess comes from Sicily, where it appears that an original cult existed prior to Greek influence. Here, she is also associated with nymphic deities. Paolo Orsi discovered inscriptions dedicated to feminine figures in caves near the Sicilian town of Buscemi, the so-called “*Theai paides*” not to be found elsewhere in the archaeological record. Orsi suggested that they were virgin sisters or some feminine pair reminiscent of Demeter and Cora.⁸ Following Orsi, Margaret Guarducci identified the goddess in his findings

⁶*Ibid.*, 161-173.

⁷See Chapter Two for a discussion of the connection between Anna and *lympha* in the *Aeneid*.

⁸P. Orsi, “Buscemi. Sacri spechi con iscrizioni greche scoperti presso Akrai,” *Notizie degli scavi di antichità comunicate alla R. Accademia dei Lincei*, (Roma, 1899), pp. 452

as Anna, the Roman and Siculan goddess.⁹ The presence of Anna's cult here was used by Guarducci to support the conclusion that Romans and Sicules shared a common origin, but in the present study the point of interest is that Anna was pervasively and inextricably depicted as a mother goddess and linked to fertility. Virgil is thus invoking something quite natural to her identity when he characterizes her as a nurse. Across the whole of Indo-European religions and languages, Anna was a nurse.

This is further supported by what we know about the worship of Anna Perenna in Rome. As far as the archeological record is concerned with the Roman cult of Anna Perenna, a fountain dedicated to cult worship of the goddess was discovered in 1999, from which it has been determined that her cult practice existed from at least the 1st century BC.¹⁰ Where the literary record is concerned, it is unclear who exactly Anna Perenna was, but Ovid gives multiple etiological explanations for her in his *Fasti*. One of his attestations is that some equate her with the foster-nurse of Jove: *invenies qui te nymphen Azanida dicant / teque Iovi primos, Anna, dedisse cibos*, "You will find those who say that you are the nymph daughter of Azan, and that you had given Jove his first food" (*Fast.* 3,

⁹M. Guarducci, "Il culto di Anna e delle Paides nelle iscrizioni sicule di Buscemi, e il culto di Anna Perenna," *Studi e materiali di storia delle religioni*, (1934).

¹⁰Attilio Mastrocinque, "Late Antique Lamps with Defixiones," *Greek, Roman, and Byzantine Studies* 47, 1 (2010), 87-99.

659-60). Whatever her true origins, Ovid's description of Anna Perenna's festival is somewhat similar to what is known of Demeter's Thesmophoria festival, suggesting that Anna Perenna may have similarly been conceived by the Romans as a mother goddess of fertility. For Donald White, the Syracusan Thesmophoria was "patently oriented toward pleasing the common people,"¹¹ where eating rustic cakes and exchanging ribald jokes were important features of the ten-day festival celebrating the fertility of the land. Ovid tells us that course joking was also a common feature to the festival of Anna Perenna, and scholars have discussed his description of it as also plebeian in nature. In *Fasti* 3.523-42, Ovid describes the plebs reclining in the grass, drinking wine, singing ditties and dancing, lines in which Ovid focuses specifically on the plebeian experience.¹² It is not clear whether the Romans necessarily identified Anna Perenna with Demeter, and thus as a fertility goddess, though the evidence might suggest common origins. Nevertheless, the similarities discussed helpfully show how Anna is on a religious continuum which has its origins in a very pervasively conceived mother/fertility divinity.

¹¹Donald White, "Demeter's Sicilian Cult as a Political Instrument," (1964). For this aspect in the Roman festival, see; and Carole Newlands, "Transgressive Acts: Ovid's Treatment of the Ides of March," *Classical Philology* 91, 4 (1996): 320-338.

¹²Angeline Chiu, *Ovid's Women of the Year*, (University of Michigan Press, 2016): 27.

Indeed, Ovid's treatment of the myth of Anna Bovillae shows where he may also be picking up on the same etymological and religious connections which Virgil does. She is described by him as an *anus*, "an old woman" (*Fast.* 3, 668), perhaps punning her name here. This description begins following Ovid's mention that the people were deficient in *Ceres*, 'grain' (*Fast.* 3, 666), and Anna Bovillae is introduced to fulfill their needs as nourisher of the people, baking hot cakes for them. In another one of Ovid's etiologies, she acts as a go-between for Mars in his sexual pursuit of Minerva.¹³ Mars' words to Anna are strongly reminiscent of Virgil's description of Dido's love: *uror, et hoc longo tempore volnus alo*, "I burn, and for a long time have nourished this wound" (*Fast.* 3, 682). The key concepts of fire, wounding, and nourishing of the fire/wound are all present. Likewise, Anna's use of *evicta* in her reply to him echoes Virgil's *evicta* in *Aen.* 4, 548, which Dido uses of Anna, although *lacrimis* is replaced with *precibus* in the *Fasti*. Ovid also picks up Anna's story where Virgil left off in the *Aeneid*, and in this myth he identifies Anna Perenna with the deified Carthaginian Anna, who drowned in the river Numicius and subsequently turned into a nymph. In each of these mythical etiologies, Ovid is playing on many of the same elements which inform our study of Anna in the *Aeneid*. In Ovid's hands, Anna is variously the nurse of Juppiter, a nourishing old woman, a go-between, and a nymph.

¹³*Fast.* 3, 675-96.

Having discussed Anna's maternal nature, derived from both the etymology of her name and her religious origins as a mother goddess, we now return again to its application in the *Aeneid*. In Book Eleven, Virgil introduces another feminine pair that in many ways parallels the sister pair of Book Four. Acca is the close companion of Camilla, and while she is not a sister to the young female warrior per se, Camilla addresses her as such: *hactenus, Acca soror, potui: nunc vulnus acerbum conficit, et tenebris nigrescunt omnia circum*, "Acca, my sister, hitherto have I had strength: now a bitter wound reduces me, and everything around me blackens with night" (*Aen.* 11, 823-24). This seems to echo Dido's first address to Anna in Book Four:¹⁴ *Anna soror, quae me suspensam insomnia terrent*, "Anna, my sister, what dreams terrify me, suspended!" (*Aen.* 4, 9) In both instances, the distressing sister approaches her companion with her ills. The resonant vocatives *Acca soror* and *Anna soror* should also be duly noted. Virgil's characterization of Acca and the attendant circumstances surrounding her relationship to Camilla also strike one as similar to those of Anna and Dido. Both Camilla and Dido are young heroines who die before their time, both in some way connected to Aeneas, and both have their sisters beside them as they die.

¹⁴Richard Tarrant and Richard John Tarrant ed. *Aeneis, Book 12*, (Cambridge University Press, 2012), p. 250.

As Camilla is dying on the battle-field, she speaks to one companion out of all: *tum sic exspirans Accam ex aequalibus unam / adloquitur, fida ante alias quae sola Camillae / quicum partiri curas, atque haec ita fatur*, “Then, thus dying, she spoke to Acca alone out of her peers, who alone was faithful to Camilla before others and with whom her troubles were shared, she spoke thus” (*Aen.* 11, 820-22). The repeated emphasis of Acca’s loyalty to Camilla (*fida ante alias quae sola Camillae* and *Accam unam*) smacks of Anna’s signature adjective—*unanimam*. Acca is not just loyal, but she is singularly loyal, with Virgil emphasizing twice that Acca has been selected alone out of many other possible companions. Acca was also a confidante for Camilla, like Anna for Dido, as Virgil describes her as a sharer in Camilla’s anxieties (*quicum partiri curas*), thus establishing the same kind of sisterly bond for Acca and Camilla that he does for Dido and Anna.

Besides being a confidante like Anna, Acca also performs the same duty of message-bearing: *Effuge et haec Turno mandata novissima perfer*, “Flee this and bear these most recent commands to Turnus” (*Aen.* 4, 825), and the next we hear of her she has delivered the news to Turnus: *Interea Turnum in silvis saevissimus implet / nuntius et iuveni ingentem fert Acca tumultum*, “Meanwhile the bitterest news fills Turnus, in the woods, and Acca relays the immense disturbance to the youth” (*Aen.* 4, 896-97). Acca’s duties are strikingly familiar to Anna’s; she is sister, confidante, and messenger—all roles that Anna plays in Book Four.

Scholars have not failed to sketch the similarities between Camilla and Dido as well, so that a comparison of Anna and Acca is even more apt. Just as Camilla and Dido are both depicted as potential threats to Rome's founding,¹⁵ they are similarly cast in a tragic light. Neither Dido nor Camilla is cast as a villain in the traditional sense, but rather each as a sympathetic character who possesses human flaws and happens to be on the wrong side of the gods' will. The pathos invoked by the inherent tragedy of human loss applies to both women.

Not only are Anna and Acca's characters similarly rendered, but they are also similarly named. Acca's name comes from the Proto-Indo-European **akkā*, related to the same family of roots as that of Anna's name,¹⁶ and also means 'mother.' Might Virgil have meant to cast her as a mother/nurse figure as well? It is unlikely a coincidence that Acca and Anna have similar sounding names, given Virgil's penchant for wordplay,¹⁷ but the fact that their names have the same de facto meaning suggests the possibility that Virgil intended to portray

¹⁵Teresa Ramsby, "Juxtaposing Dido and Camilla in the 'Aeneid'," *The Classical Outlook* 88, 1 (2010): 17.

¹⁶Allan R. Bomhard, John C. Kerns, *The Nostratic Macrofamily: A Study in Distant Linguistic Relationship*, (Walter de Gruyter, 1994), reprint, 2011: p. 557; and Ethan Allen Andrews, *Harper's Latin Dictionary: A New Latin Dictionary Founded on the on the translation of Freund's Latin-German Lexicon, Ed, Part 2*, (New York: American Book Company, 1879): p. 15.

¹⁷One scholar writes, "One of Virgil's favorite tricks is to create associations between characters based on the first and last letters of their names"; see Lee Fratatuono, "Virgil's Camilla and the Authenticity of the Helen Episode," *Studies in Latin Literature and Roman History*, ed. Carl Deroux, (Latomus, 1983): p. 199.

both of these sisters as maternal. Indeed, Acca shares a name with one of the most renowned mother figures in Roman legend — Acca Larentia, the foster mother of Romulus and Remus.¹⁸

Virgil's story of Acca and Camilla is semantically connected to that of Acca Larentia in Roman myth via their lupine and wildness motifs. To briefly recap, Livy wrote that, after being reared by a she-wolf, Romulus and Remus were transferred to the care of Acca Larentia, the wife of a shepherd.¹⁹ Alexander Krappe has discussed how Acca Larentia may have originally been a chthonic she-wolf divinity equivalent to a mother-goddess, explaining both why she nurses the twins and why she is transferred care of them following the she-wolf's.

Camilla is likewise associated with lycanthropic characters. Camilla slays the hunter Ornytus, wearing a wolf's head on his own. Camilla's slayer, Arruns, is introduced by Virgil as a priest of Apollo Soranus, and he mentions the practice of fire-walking customary to the Hirpini who dwelt around Mount

¹⁸See Alexander Krappe, "Acca Larentia," *American Journal of Archaeology* 46, 4 (1942): 190-91, where he summarizes the etymology of Acca Larentia's name thus: "Her name cannot be separated from the Greek Ἀκκώ, the name of Demeter's nurse, the word ἀκκώ 'vain female bogey,' the Sanskrit akkâ 'mother,' the Lapp Madder-akka 'mother earth,' the Finnish Ukko, lit. 'grand-father,' name of the oldest and highest god of the Finns, the Yakut aga 'father,' Mong. Aka, akha 'elder brother,' 'master.' On this showing, Acca would appear to be the Roman equivalent of Mother Earth, the nourishing and life-giving, but also chthonian, divinity."

¹⁹Livy, *Ab Urbe Cond.* 1.4.1-9

Soracte. Servius wrote that the Hirpini (from the Faliscan or Sabellic word meaning ‘wolves’²⁰) lived off of plunder as wolves did, after which they were named. They were told to do so in order to end a plague that had struck the people after they attempted to eradicate the wolves which plundered them of their sacrificial offerings to Dis Pater.²¹ Virgil then compares Arruns to a wolf as he steals away after killing Camilla: *continuo in montis sese avius abdidit altos / occiso pastore lupus magnove iuvenco*, “Forthwith he steals away among the lofty mountains, as a wolf after it has killed a shepherd or a great bull” (*Aen.* 4,810-11). These lupine figures are brought into the story in relation to Camilla, emphasizing her lupine associations.

For Camilla herself, there are certain bestial elements in the story of her childhood rearing which in some ways make her a kind of lycanthropic figure herself.²² She is introduced in Book Twelve with attributes contradictory to those of the civilized Roman woman: *bellatrix, non illa colo calathisque Minervae / femineas adsueta manus, sed proelia virgo / dura pati cursuque pedum praevertere ventos*, “A warrior maiden, her feminine hands unaccustomed to the distaff or wicker

²⁰Mika Rissanen, “The *Hirpi Sorani* and the Wolf Cults of Central Italy,” *Arctos* 46 (2015): 118.

²¹Serv. *Aen.* 11, 785.

²²Lee Fratantuono, “Chiastic Doom in the ‘Aeneid’,” *Latomus* 68, 2 (2009): 397; and *Madness Unchained: A Reading of Virgil’s Aeneid*, (Lexington Books, 2007).

basket, instead a virgin hardened to endure battle and to out-strip the winds with her swift foot" (*Aen.* 7, 805-807). Raised in the wild, Camilla was *hic natam in dumis interque horrentia lustra / armentalis equae mammis et lacte ferino / nutribat teneris immulgens ubera labris*. "Here among the briars and dread wilds, her father was nursing his child with the udders of rustic mares and the milk of wild beasts, milking the teats with tender lips" (*Aen.* 11, 570-73). She wears a tiger skin over her shoulder's and is trained to become a *bellatrix* in the wild: *pro crinali auro, pro longae tegmine pallae / tigridis exuviae per dorsum a vertice pendent*, "Instead of a golden ornament for her hair, instead of a covering of long mantle, the spoils of a tiger hang down her back from her head" (*Aen.* 11, 576-577). The peculiar circumstances of Camilla's upbringing explain important aspects of her nature—it emphasizes her characterization as autochthonous and feral, yet it also bears an important resemblance to the mythological nurturing of Romulus and Remus. Her early years were far removed from the accouterments of the civilized world, as Romulus and Remus' were, and she too was nursed by wild animals and spent the better part of early life learning to hunt and fight. After the boys were raised in the wilderness by a she-wolf, Acca Larentia became their foster-mother. Like Camilla is nursed by wild animals in the wild, she is then transferred by Virgil to the battlefield, where Acca is the closest thing to a family member for her, who strikingly lacks a father, mother, husband, or mother-in-law. Acca is

thus her stand-in nurse or mother as Acca Larentia was the foster nurse or mother of Romulus and Remus.

The last sister to appear in Virgil's epic is Juturna, the nymph sister of Turnus. Again, she is shown as the motherly figure to her tragic sibling, thus becoming a tragic figure herself. For Virgil's siblings, one is always doomed and the other must watch helplessly, and both Anna and Acca are helpless to their dying sisters. In this way, both may be connected to Juturna as a sororal figure in the *Aeneid*. Juturna is a nymph-protectress sent by Juno to protect Turnus and very clearly has a great emotional attachment to him: *vix ea, cum lacrimas oculis Iuturna profundit / terque quaterque manu pectus percussit honestum*, "Scarcely had she spoken when Juturna's eyes poured tears, and three and four times she struck her comely breast with her hand" (*Aen.* 12, 154-55). Her protectiveness bears itself out tragically, as she cannot save her brother for many of the same reasons Anna cannot help Dido: their ends have already been decided by the divine forces at work in the narrative. Her pleas are much like Anna's once she realizes the futility of her aid:

*quid nunc te tua, Turne, potest germana iuvare?
aut quid iam durae superat mihi? qua tibi lucem
arte morer? talin possum me opponere monstro?*

"How can your sister help you now, Turnus?
Or what is now left for me, having endured this? By what art
could I keep your life? Am I able to oppose such an omen?"
(*Aen.* 12, 872-74)

Juturna experiences her own anagnorisis as Anna does when she realizes that her efforts did not have their intended consequences and that there is nothing left for her to do to save her sister. Juturna realizes that she cannot prolong her brother's life, and she further laments her inability to attend her brother in death:

*quo vitam dedit aeternam? cur mortis adempta est
condicio? possem tantos finire dolores
nunc certe, et misero fratri comes ire per umbras!*

“Why did he give me eternal life? Why has the condition of death been taken from me? I could certainly now end such sorrows and go to the shades as a companion for my poor brother!”
(*Aen.* 12, 879-881)

Just as Anna expressed sorrow that she could not join Dido in death and had been left alone, so too does Juturna express the same sorrow. She, as an immortal being, cannot accompany her brother in death or extend his life. Her helpful behavior suggests a characteristically Virgilian pun on her name with the Latin verb *iuvare*, ‘to help,’ and her nymph status is strongly evocative of Anna's nymphic associations, situating her quite closely to her parallel sister of Book Four.

The salient connection is that all these sisters are both tragic and maternal in some way. Despite whatever romantic views we may have today about the power of love, Virgil shows that it does not constitute enough to fend against the will of the gods. He emphasizes the tragic loss of youthful life—that these

characters die *before their time*.²³ He could not have the mothers of these characters to cradle them in their arms as they died, but he could have a motherly sister do so, and he could identify all of these sisters with maternal figures to bring out a desired tragic effect.

As a further point of interest, each sister is connected to a Roman divinity. Anna Perenna was worshipped in Rome, her festival taking place on the Ides of March. Acca is connected to Acca Larentia and her worship during the Larentalia. And finally, Juturna to the Lacus Juturnae in Rome, which dates back to the second century BC and was built for the healing cult of the goddess.²⁴ Although they are Roman goddesses, in the *Aeneid* each is on the *opposite* side of the Romans. Nevertheless, they all still aid (even if unintentionally or indirectly) in Rome's founding, reinforcing the element of divine sanction necessary to Rome's founding. Mostly, this is through the failure of each to aid her sibling who poses a threat to Aeneas' success. Dido is the first very real threat, and it is through Anna's intervention that she succumbs to love for Aeneas and then kills herself. Likewise, both Camilla and Turnus pose military threats to Aeneas, and

²³Virgil writes of Dido: *Nam quia nec fato merita nec morte peribat, sed misera ante diem subitoque accensa furore*, "For she was perishing neither by a fate nor a death merited, but instead the wretched woman, suddenly and incensed with fury, perished before her day" (*Aen.* 4, 696-97).

²⁴Christian Hülsen and Jesse Benedict Carter, *The Roman Forum, its History and its Monuments*, (Rome: Loescher & Co., 1906): 165.

both have a sister that cannot protect them against the hand of the gods, despite their best efforts.

Thus, each sister is tragically instrumental in neutralizing threats to the Roman project, and in an important way they anticipate the eventual part that Juno, the divine sister of Jove, will play in Rome's foundation. Though she tries to foil Aeneas for the better part of the epic, she will eventually yield to the compulsion of destiny, as the other three sisters must. Those who read the *Aeneid* at the time would have recognized that these goddesses were reconciled to Rome, having become patrons of and revered by its citizens. By endowing each sister with maternal qualities, Virgil communicates the tragic sense of loss that attends a parent's loss of a child, yet at the same time, by assembling an array of powerful goddesses, he communicates the truly divine consent of all the gods in the fulfillment of Rome's destiny.

CHAPTER FIVE

Conclusion

The present study of Anna has attempted to contribute to the view that Virgil was attentive, creative, and masterful in his craft by specifically examining his treatment of Carthaginian Anna in the *Aeneid*. He is attentive in that he employs a variety of literary and cultural resources to build his characters. He respects the precedents set down before him, but then creatively and resourcefully constructs new kinds of characters from the existing material. He does this masterfully with his rendering of Anna, a tragic sister and a tacitly divine force working to procure Rome's eventual founding. Her tragedy is activated by the allusive subtext of the *Hippolytus* and other dramas, and her divine status is derived from her widespread name and religious connections.

Virgil's treatment of Anna has been considered along with his treatment of the other sisters of the *Aeneid*, and it has been argued that he pulls from the tragic material to create the tragic maternal sister. This study has considered the ways in which these sisters rouse feelings of pity. They are depicted as passionately caring, helpful, well-intentioned, and privy to the inner thoughts of their beloved. The maternal connections are bolstered both by a solid intertextual foundation and the inherent religious associations that have been discussed.

Perhaps what is most masterful of Virgil's work is the respect with which he regards the characters themselves. Anna's loss is depicted as almost universally tragic. If the loss of a sibling were already tragic, the loss of a mother of her child is almost more so. The way Virgil chooses to characterize her relationship to Dido in terms of a mother's care and protection points to a certain sensitivity towards human life that scholars have long understood in the poet. It is harder to hate a person if you know their mother. The sympathy and tenderness with which he thus conceives the world and the human life would thus imply that Virgil's poem is not just one of conflict, destiny, and tragedy, but one of humanity.

Bibliography

- Abel, D. Herbert "Medea in Dido." *The Classical Bulletin* 34, 5 (1958).
- Adler, Eve. *Vergil's Empire: Political Thought in the Aeneid*. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2003.
- Anderson, W. S. *The Art of the Aeneid*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall, 1969.
- Andrews, Ethan Allen. *Harper's Latin Dictionary: A New Latin Dictionary Founded on the translation of Freund's Latin-German Lexicon, Ed, Part 2*. New York: American Book Company, 1879.
- Armstrong, Rebecca. "The Aeneid: Inheritance and Empire." In *Epic Interactions: Perspectives on Homer, Virgil, and the Epic Tradition Presented to Jasper Griffin by Former Pupils*. Oxford University Press, 2006.
- Baehrens, Emil. *Fragmenta Poetarum Romanorum*. Lipsiae: Teubner, 1886.
- Barrett, Antony A. "Anna's Conduct in Aeneid 4." *Vergilius*, 16 (1970).
- Barrett, W. S. *Euripides, Hippolytus*. Oxford, 1964.
- Başak, Emil. "Thesmophoria." *Journal of Ancient History and Archeology* 1, 4 (2014): 3-6.
- Bednarowski, K. Paul. "Dido and the Motif of Deception in Aeneid 2 and 3." *TAPA* 145 (2015).
- Bomhard, Allan R. and John C. Kerns, *The Nostratic Macrofamily: A Study in Distant Linguistic Relationship*. Walter de Gruyter, 1994. Reprint. 2011.
- Bowra, C. M. "Aeneas and the Stoic Ideal." *Greece & Rome* 3, 7 (1933).
- Burbidge, James. "Dido, Anna and the Sirens (Vergil Aeneid 4.437 ss.)." *Materiali e discussione per l'analisi dei testi classici* (2009).
- Casali, Sergio. "The Development of the Aeneas Legend." In *A Companion to Vergil's Aeneid and its Tradition*. John Wiley & Sons, 2014.

- Castellani, Victor. "Anna and Juturna in the 'Aeneid.'" *Vergilius* 33 (1987): 49-57.
- Chiu, Angeline. *Ovid's Women of the Year*. University of Michigan Press, 2016.
- DeGraff, Thelma B. "Antigone and Dido." *The Classical Weekly* 25, 19 (1932).
- DeLacy, Phillip. "Medea in Dido." *The Classical Bulletin* (1958): 51-56.
- DeWitt, Norman W. "The Dido Episode as a Tragedy." *The Classical Journal* 2, 7 (1907).
- — —. "Vergil's Tragedy of Maidenhood." *The Classical Weekly* 18, 14 (1925): 107-108.
- duBois, Page. "The φαρμακός of Virgil: Dido as Scapegoat." *Vergilius* 22 (1976): 14-23.
- Dyson, Julia T. "Dido the Epicurean," *Classical Antiquity* 15, 2 (1996).
- Farrell, Joseph. "The Virgilian Intertext." In *The Cambridge Companion to Virgil*, ed. Charles Martindale. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Farron, Steven. "The Aeneas-Dido Episode as an Attack on Aeneas' Mission and Rome." *Greece & Rome* 27, 1 (1980).
- Feder, L. "Vergil's Tragic Theme." *Classical Journal* 49, 5 (1954).
- Feeney, D. "The Taciturnity of Aeneas." *The Classical Quarterly* 33, 1 (1983): 204-219.
- Fowler, W. Warde. *Death of Turnus*. University of California Libraries, 1919.
- Fratantuono, Lee. "Chiastic Doom in the 'Aeneid.'" *Latomus* 68, 2 (2009).
- — —. "Diana in the 'Aeneid.'" *Quaderni Urbinati di Cultura Classica* 83, 2 (2002).
- — —. *Madness Unchained: A Reading of Virgil's Aeneid*. Lexington Books, 2007.
- — —. "Virgil's Camilla and the Authenticity of the Helen Episode." *Studies in Latin Literature and Roman History*, ed. Carl Deroux. Latomus, 1983.
- Garrod, H. W. "Vergil." In *English Literature and the Classics: Tragedy*. Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1912.

- Gildenhard, Ingo. *Virgil, Aeneid, 4.1-299: Latin Text, Study Questions, Commentary and Interpretative Essays*. Open Book Publishers, 2012.
- Glover, T. R. *Studies in Virgil*. London, 1904.
- Gordon, Pamela. "Phaeacian Dido: Lost Pleasures of an Epicurean Intertext," *Classical Antiquity* 17, 2 (1998).
- Goud, T. E. and J. C. Yardley. "Dido's Burning Effigy: Aeneid 4.508." *Rheinisches Museum für Philologie*, 131 (1988): 386-388.
- Guarducci, M. "Il culto di Anna e delle Paides nelle iscrizioni sicule di Buscemi, e il culto di Anna Perenna." *Studi e materiali di storia delle religioni*, (1934).
- Gutting, Edward. "Marriage in the Aeneid: Venus, Vulcan, and Dido." *Classical Philology* 101, 3 (2006): 263-279.
- Hahn, E. Adelaide. "Pietas versus Violentia in the Aeneid (Concluded)." *The Classical Weekly* 25, 3 (1931).
- Hamilton, Colin I. M. "Dido, Tityos and Prometheus." *The Classical Quarterly* 43, 1 (1993): 249-254.
- Hardie, Philip. "Virgil and Tragedy." In *The Cambridge Companion to Virgil*, ed. C. Martindale. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Harrod, Samuel Glen. "Latin Terms of Endearment and of Family Relationship: A Lexicographical Study Based on Volume VI of the Corpus Inscriptionum Latinarum." PhD diss., Princeton University, 1909.
- Heinze, Richard. *Virgils Epische Technik*. Leipzig: B. G. Teubner, 1903. Reprint, Los Angeles: California University Press, 1994.
- Highbarger, E. L. "The Tragedy of Turnus: A Study of Vergil, Aeneid XII." *The Classical Weekly* 41, 8 (1948): 114-124.
- Horsfall, N. M. "Aeneid." In *A Companion to the Study of Virgil*. Brill, 2000.
- Hülsemann, Christian and Jesse Benedict Carter. *The Roman Forum, its History and its Monuments*. Rome: Loescher & Co., 1906.

- Jacobson, Howard. "Vergil's Dido and Euripides' Helen." *The American Journal of Philology* 108, 1 (1987).
- Karydas, Helen. *Eurykleia and Her Successors*. Rowman & Littlefield, 1998.
- Krappe, Alexander. "Acca Larentia." *American Journal of Archaeology* 46, 4 (1942).
- Liddell, Henry George, Robert Scott, Henry Stuart Jones, and Roderick McKenzie. *The Online Liddell-Scott-Jones Greek-English Lexicon*. Irvine, CA: University of California, 2011.
- Marquis, Mary Christine. "Reading Aeneas and Dido: Suggestion and Inference in *Aeneid* 1-4." PhD. diss., The University of Minnesota (2013).
- Mastrocinque, Attilio. "Late Antique Lamps with Defixiones." *Greek, Roman, and Byzantine Studies* 47, 1 (2010).
- Muecke, Frances. "Foreshadowing and Dramatic Irony in the Story of Dido." *The American Journal of Philology* 104, 2 (1983): 134-155.
- Nagy, Gregory. "Homeric Hymn to Demeter." *The Homeric Hymns: Interpretative Essays*, ed. Andrew Faulkner. Oxford University Press, 2011.
<http://www.uh.edu/~cldue/texts/demeter.html>.
- Nettleship, Henry. "Suggestions Introductory to a Study of the Aeneid." In *Lectures and Essays on Subjects Connected with Latin Literature and Scholarship*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1885.
- Newlands, Carole. "Transgressive Acts: Ovid's Treatment of the Ides of March." *Classical Philology* 91, 4 (1996).
- O'Hara, James. *Death and the Optimistic Prophecy in Vergil's Aeneid*. Princeton University Press, 1990.
- Orsi, P. "Buscemi. Sacri spechi con iscrizioni greche scoperti presso Akrai." *Notizie degli scavi di antichità comunicate alla R. Accademia dei Lincei*. Roma, 1899.

- Otis, Brooks. *Virgil, A Study in Civilized Poetry*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1964. Reprint. University of Oklahoma Press, 1995.
- Panoussi, Vassiliki. "Epic Transfigured: Tragic Allusiveness in Vergil's *Aeneid*." PhD diss., Brown University, 1998.
- — — . "Vergil's Ajax: Allusion, Tragedy, and Heroic Identity in the *Aeneid*." *Classical Antiquity* 21, 1 (2002).
- Paschalis, Michael. *Semantic Names and Proper Relations*. Clarendon Press, 1997.
- Pease, Aruthur Stanley. *Publi Vergili Maronis Aeneidos Liber Quartus*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1967.
- Perkell, Christine. *Reading Vergil's Aeneid: An Interpretive Guide*. University of Oklahoma Press, 1999.
- — — . "The Lament of Juturna: Pathos and Interpretation in the *Aeneid*." *Transactions of the American Philological Association* 127 (1997): 257-286.
- Pokorny, Julius. *Indogermanisches etymologisches Wörterbuch*. Tübingen und Basel, 2005.
- Pöschl, Viktor. *The Art of Vergil*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1962.
- — — . "The Poetic Achievement of Virgil." *The Classical Journal* 56, 7 (1961): 290-299.
- Prince, Meredith. "Helen of Rome? Helen in Vergil's *Aeneid*." *Helios* 41, 2 (2014).
- Pucci, Pietro. *The Violence of Pity in Euripides' Medea*. Ithaca and London, 1980.
- Puhvel, Jaan. *Hittite Etymological Dictionary, Volume 3: Words beginning with H*. New York: Mouton de Gruyter, 1991.
- Ramsby, Teresa. "Juxtaposing Dido and Camilla in the '*Aeneid*.'" *The Classical Outlook* 88, 1 (2010).
- Rand, Edward Kennard. *The Magical Art of Virgil*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1931.

- Rich, John. "Valerius Antias and the Construction of the Roman Past." *Bulletin of the Institute of Classical Studies* 48 (2005): 137-161.
- Rissanen, Mika. "The *Hirpi Sorani* and the Wolf Cults of Central Italy." *Arctos* 46 (2015).
- Rudd, Niall. *Lines of Enquiry: Studies in Latin Poetry*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- Ruffell, Ian. "The Nurse's Tale." In *Looking at Medea: Essays and a Translation of Euripides' Tragedy*, ed. David Stuttard. A&C Black, 2014.
- Salmon, E. T. *Samnium and the Samnites*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1967.
- Scafoglio, Giampiero. "Virgil and the *Astyanax* of Accius." *The Classical Quarterly* 57, 2 (2007).
- Smith, R. A. *Virgil*. Wiley-Blackwell, 2011.
- Starr, Raymond J. "Dido and Penelope in Virgil, 'Aeneid' IV, 50-53," *Latomus* 68, 4 (2009): 910-914.
- — —. "Weaving Delays: Dido and Penelope in Vergil, 'Aeneid' IV, 50-53." *Latomus* 68, 4 (2009): 910-14.
- Swallow, Ellenor. "Anna Soror," *The Classical Weekly* 44, 10 (1951).
- Swanepoel, J. "Infelix Dido: Vergil and the Notion of the Tragic," *AKROTERION XL* (1995).
- Tarrant, Richard and Richard John Tarrant ed. *Aeneis, Book 12*. Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Tilly, Bertha. "The Identification of the Numicus." *The Journal of Roman Studies* 26, 1 (1936): 1-11.
- Tracy, H. L. "Aeneid IV: Tragedy or Melodrama?" *The Classical Journal* 41, 5 (1946).
- Welch, Anthony. "The Cultural Politics of *Dido and Aeneas*." *Cambridge Opera Journal* 21 (2009).

West, Grace Starry. "Andromache and Dido." *The American Journal of Philology* 104, 3 (1983).

— — —. "Vergil's Helpful Sisters: Anna and Juturna in the 'Aeneid.'" *Vergilius* 25 (1979): 10-19.

White, Donald. "Demeter's Sicilian Cult as a Political Instrument." (1964).

Wright, David. "Annie Get Your Jug: Anna Perenna and Water in the Aeneid."
<https://classicalstudies.org/annual-meeting/147/abstract/annie-get-your-jug-anna-perenna-and-water-aeneid>

Wilhelm, Michelle Pach. "Venus, Diana, Dido and Camilla in the 'Aeneid.'" *Vergilius* 33 (1959): 43-48.

Yeames, Herbert H. "The Tragedy of Dido. Part I," *The Classical Journal* 8, 4 (1913).